LJMU Research Online

Van Asperen, EN and Kahlke, R-D

 Dietary variation and overlap in Central and Northwest European Stephanorhinus kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus (Rhinocerotidae, Mammalia) influenced by habitat diversity

http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/213/

Article

For more information please contact researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk

1   **Dietary variation and overlap in Central and Northwest European Stephanorhinus**

2   **kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus (Rhinocerotidae, Mammalia) influenced by habitat**

3   **diversity**

4

5   You'll have to take pot luck!

6   (proverb)

7

8   Eline N. van Asperen [a,*], Ralf-Dietrich Kahlke [b]

9

10   [a] Research Centre in Evolutionary Anthropology and Palaeoecology, School of Natural

11   Sciences and Psychology, Liverpool John Moores University, James Parsons Building,

12   Byrom Street, Liverpool L3 3AF, United Kingdom

13

14   [b] Research Station of Quaternary Palaeontology Weimar, Senckenberg Research Institutes

15   and Natural History Museums, Am Jakobskirchhof 4, 99423 Weimar, Germany

16

19

20   **Abstract**

21   To trace the dietary evolution of the two abundant Middle to Late Pleistocene rhinoceros

22   species Stephanorhinus kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus in Europe over several climatic

23   cycles, we examined comprehensive material of stratigraphically well-defined

24   palaeopopulations from different regions and interglacials. Using morphometrics and

* Corresponding author. Tel.: 0044-(0)151-2312401
E-mail addresses: envanasperen@palaeo.eu (E. v. Asperen), rdkahlke@senckenberg.de (R.-D. Kahlke)

25 mesowear analysis, these reconstructions of Stephanorhinus diets indicate that habitat

26 diversity and interspecific competition with closely related rhinoceros species induced

27 variation in feeding behaviour. Although anatomical features of both species suggest

28 significantly higher dietary specializations compared to the Early to early Middle Pleistocene

29 *S. hundsheimensis*, their mesowear signals are characteristic of a mixed feeder diet, similar to

30 that of extant mammal species in relatively open habitats. Both species retained a degree of

31 dietary flexibility, enabling them to survive in a range of environments. Although each of

32 these rhinoceroses preferred different habitats, species identity alone is not sufficient to

33 establish the real dietary traits of a Stephanorhinus palaeopopulation. As a consequence, their

34 occurrence in a faunal assemblage alone cannot be taken to indicate a specific habitat.

35 S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus were embedded in a dynamic process of temporo-spatial

36 replacements and interspecific differentiation of rhinoceroses in the western Palaearctic.

37 However, dietary specialization in these Middle to Late Pleistocene European rhinoceroses

38 was not the result of a directed time-transgressive evolution. Rather, within the range of each

39 species' ecological tolerance, it was controlled by environmental parameters, with habitat

40 variability as the main factor.

41

42 **1. Introduction**

43 The reconstruction of fossil faunal assemblages can significantly contribute to our

44 understanding of the natural variability and evolution of past ecosystems and climates. In

45 particular, assessments of dietary requirements for each species and inferences to their

46 corresponding subsistence strategies have proved to be valuable methods for reconstructing

47 palaeoenvironmental parameters. In the case of herbivores, reconstructions of the vegetational

48 character of associated palaeoenvironments based on dietary signals may provide detailed

49 insights into the behaviour of different species, when corresponding palaeobotanical records

50 are not available.

51 Pleistocene herbivore communities clearly reflect fluctuations in global climate and resulting

52 environmental changes (e.g. Lister, 2004; Kahlke et al., 2011). Rhinocerotids in particular are

53 among the most significant ecological trace species of the Palaearctic (Zeuner, 1934; Loose,

54 1975; Guérin, 1980; Fortelius, 1982; Fortelius et al., 1993; Lacombat, 2006; Hernesniemi et

55 al., 2011; Kahlke, 2014). Recent investigations have revealed that Pleistocene rhinoceroses

56 show an individualistic response to changes in the periodicity of environmental variation

57 (Raymo and Nisancioglu, 2003, Figure 1; Lisiecki and Raymo, 2005, Figure 4), resulting in

58 different evolutionary patterns between species. Thus, the subsistence strategy of

59 Stephanorhinus hundsheimensis, as the only rhinocerotid species of western Palaearctic

60 mammal faunas between 1.4/1.2 and 0.6/0.5 Ma BP, was that of a generalist. Its lifestyle

61 evolved under the influence of the relatively stable 41 ka climatic periodicity and proved to be

62 very successful also during the more unsteady climate course of the transitional interval

63 linking with the following 100 ka regime (Kahlke et al., 2011, p. 1388). The dietary

64 variability of S. hundsheimensis ranged from grazing regimes to predominantly browsing

65 ones, characterising the species as the ecologically most tolerant rhinoceros of the Palaearctic

66 Plio-Pleistocene (Kahlke and Kaiser, 2011).

67 A different path of evolution can be traced in the genus Coelodonta. From the Late Pliocene

68 onwards (Deng et al., 2011), its range was for more than three million years restricted to open

69 landscapes in Central Asia. Strictly progressive adaptation to efficient grazing enabled woolly

70 rhinoceroses to inhabit the pan-Eurasian tundra-steppe for the first time around 460 ka BP

71 (Kahlke and Lacombat, 2008). This new type of biome originated during marine isotope stage

72 (MIS) 12, a long-lasting and pronounced cold interval within the 100 ka periodicity span.

73 During most of the subsequent warm and humid stages Coelodonta populations retreated from

74 western Palaearctic areas, only to re-occupy extended Eurasian territories as increasingly

75 more specialized grazers during the succeeding cold and continental periods (Kahlke, 2014).

76 Over substantial periods of the Pleistocene Stephanorhinus hundsheimensis and Coelodonta

77 species occupied huge territories of the Palaearctic. Members of both groups predominantly

78 occurred as the only rhinoceros species of corresponding faunas, and their subsistence

79 strategies were principally different. However, at present it is not well understood whether a

80 co-occurrence of t w o species of Pleistocene rhinoceros might have affected their dietary

81 specialization, and whether rhinoceros dietary flexibility interacts with environmental

82 conditions. Sympatries of closely related species are not uncommon in mammalian

83 communities (e.g. Jacoby et al., 1999; Hayward and Kerley, 2008; Li et al., 2008; Dammhahn

84 et al., 2013). Such co-occurrences of closely related species are durable only if intraspecific

85 competition is stronger than interspecific competition (Elton, 1927). Sympatric species tend to

86 reduce competition through differences in their use of resources, whether by focusing on

87 different resources, by using these resources at different times or at different intensities, or by

88 exploiting different habitats within the same landscape (e.g. Chase and Leibold, 2003).

89 Several extant rhinoceros species occur sympatrically. Specialised grazer Ceratotherium

90 simum and the co-occurring browsing species Diceros bicornis have little overlap in diet

91 (Groves, 1972; Owen-Smith, 1988; Hillman-Smith and Groves, 1994; Codron et al., 2007;

92 Steuer et al., 2010). The browsing species Dicerorhinus sumatrensis and Rhinoceros

93 sondaicus, whose ranges overlapped in the past, avoided competitive interactions by using

94 upland resp. lowland habitats (Groves and Kurt, 1972; Groves and Leslie, 2011).

95 Here we investigate the subsistence strategy of two closely related rhinoceros species,

96 Stephanorhinus kirchbergensis (Jäger, 1839), the so-called forest rhinoceros, and S.

97 hemitoechus (Falconer, 1868), the slightly smaller-bodied steppe rhinoceros. Both species

98 occurred in most regions of the western Palaearctic during temperate periods of the Middle

99 and Late Pleistocene, sometimes allopatrically, at other times sympatrically. To trace their

100 dietary evolution in Europe over several climatic cycles we examined Stephanorhinus

101 material from palaeopopulations of different regions and interglacials.

102

2. Appearance and spread of Stephanorhinus kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus in Europe

During the early Middle Pleistocene two new rhinoceros species, S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus, with different and more specialised feeding strategies, appeared in Europe to compete with the previously unchallenged generalist Stephanorhinus hundsheimensis. After a period of sympatry between 0.7 and 0.6 Ma BP, documented in the faunal assemblages of several early Middle Pleistocene sites, such as Kolkotova Balka and Sukleya near Tiraspol (Moldova), Mauer and Mosbach 2 (Germany), as well as Soleilhac (France), S. kirchbergensis started to replace S. hundsheimensis in temperate faunas (Beljaeva and David, 1975; Guérin, 1980; Fortelius et al., 1993; Schreiber, 2005). S. kirchbergensis, an immigrant of Asian origin (Guérin, 1980; Van der Made, 2000), was a very large animal with long legs, a high head posture, and moderately hypsodont molars (Fortelius et al., 1993), indicating a diet with significant portions of browsing.

Between 0.6 and 0.5 Ma, a second rhinoceros species, S. hemitoechus, appeared in Europe, as recorded in the Mosbach 2 gravels (Fortelius et al., 1993; Hemmer et al., 2003). Its anatomy, especially its relatively short limbs, the low-slung cranium, more hypsodont molars and reduced premolar segment of the tooth rows compared to those of S. kirchbergensis, indicate affinities to less forested landscapes or open grasslands (Guérin, 1980; Janis, 1990; Mazza, 1993; Fortelius et al., 1993). This is corroborated by the fact that it was especially widespread in Europe under dryer and/or moderate to cooler conditions. The origins of both rhinoceroses, S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus, seem to ultimately derive from the development of the 100 ka periodicity in the global climatic record, which led to a longer lasting environmental continuity in the resulting biomes compared to the preceding 41 ka span of time (Kahlke et al., 2011).

127 Alternating stages of prolonged colder and temperate climatic conditions resulted in mutual

128 alternations of Coelodonta tologoijensis / C. antiquitatis and S. hemitoechus populations from

129 the Middle Pleistocene onwards. When C. tologoijensis spread into Eastern and Central

130 Europe during MIS 12, S. hemitoechus retreated to Western Europe and survived there, as it is

131 recorded e.g. from Tautavel (Ensemble III) in France (Moigne et al., 2006). Both species co-

132 occurred at the sites of La Fage (layer 5) in France during MIS 10 or 8 (Guérin, 1973) and

133 Weimar-Ehringsdorf (Upper Travertines) in Germany during MIS 7 and/or 5 (Kahlke, 1975;

134 Kahlke et al., 2002). Stratigraphic sequences at the latter site indicate that S. hemitoechus was

135 replaced successively by Coelodonta. A similar alternation has been observed in areas of

136 Great Britain (Schreve, 2001a) and in the northern part of the Iberian Peninsula (Álvarez-Lao

137 and García, 2011). During interstadials and especially during periods of interglacial warming

138 the opposite happened: S. hemitoechus prevailed and Coelodonta disappeared from large

139 areas of Europe. However, under optimal interglacial conditions with extensive afforestation,

140 the steppe rhino was successively replaced by the ecologically more demanding S.

141 kirchbergensis, as far as the latter had access to corresponding areas.

142 During the Last Glacial Stephanorhinus withdrew from most areas of Europe to - probably

143 several - southern refugia. Both S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus became extinct in the

144 Western Palaearctic well before the Last Glacial Maximum (LGM). Youngest finds of S.

145 kirchbergensis from the Grotte des Enfants and the Grotte du Prince (Grimaldi Caves) in Italy

146 are assigned to MIS 4 to 3 (Lacombat, 2005, 2006). The latest occurrence of S. hemitoechus

147 reported so far, from the Bulgarian Bacho Kiro Cave, approximately 42.542 ± 1.068 cal. ka in

148 age (Stuart and Lister, 2007), may correlate with Greenland Interstadial (GI) 10 of MIS 3

149 (Van Meerbeeck et al., 2011). Supposedly younger Stephanorhinus finds of Azilian or

150 Neolithic age from Spain are dubious (Cerdeño, 1990; Sánchez et al., 2005; D.J. Álvarez-Lao,

151 pers. comm.).

152

3. Material and methods

3.1. Material

To achieve a reliable dataset documenting the history of dietary specialization of S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus, rhinoceros palaeopopulations from two European regions of different biogeographic location were selected. The inclusion of fossil rhino remains from different geographic areas provides control over the effect that regional differences, such as a reported geographic gradient in body size (Lacombat, 2009), may have on the results. We chose Central Germany and the British Isles representing Central and Northwest Europe respectively, because in both of these regions extensive fossil material of the two species from a range of more or less well-dated faunal assemblages is available (Figure 1; Table 1). Moreover, the dietary signals obtained here should not have been overprinted by the influence of competing species, because all assemblages considered here have a similar fauna of co-occurring herbivores feeding on the same levels of vegetation as the two rhinoceroses, often even at similar abundances (see references below). While episodes of co-occurrence of the two Stephanorhinus species have been documented for earlier interglacials (MIS 11, 7), during some parts of the Last Interglacial (MIS 5e) the species had a largely disjunct distribution in the studied area.

In Central Germany, the rhinoceros remains from Bilzingsleben, Weimar-Ehringsdorf and Weimar-Taubach (all in Thüringen; Table 1), were included in our study. The rhinoceros remains of these sites originate from travertine layers. Bilzingsleben II (hominin site) is related to one of the warm stages of the late Middle Pleistocene "Holstein-Komplex" (Mania, 1997, 2006; Heinrich, 2003), assigned by most authors to MIS 11 (Nitychoruk et al., 2006). Schreve and Bridgland (2002) correlate Bilzingsleben II with the younger of two temperate warm substages documented in the MIS 11 sequence of the Thames valley (UK). The fossil layer of Bilzingsleben II formed within a very short and hence biostratigraphically instantaneous time span, and produced a considerable number of individuals of both S.

179   kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus (Figures 2a-b and 3a-b; Table 1; Van der Made, 2000), so

180   that sympatry has to be concluded.

181   The very complex Pleistocene sequence of Weimar-Ehringsdorf contains remains of at least

182   12 biochronologically distinguishable mammal faunas (Kahlke et al., 2002 and references

183   therein). The abundant S. kirchbergensis finds of Weimar-Ehringsdorf were recovered

184   exclusively from the lower and middle parts of the Lower Travertin (hominin layers, Mammal

185   Fauna 2), which reflect fully developed interglacial conditions (Kahlke, 1975: p. 385). The

186   stratigraphic distribution of Ehringsdorf's rhinoceros fossils (Figures 2c-d and 3c-d), as far as

187   accurate data on their discovery horizons are available (Kahlke, 1975: Figure 32), clearly

188   indicate the co-occurrence of S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus during the accumulation of

189   the middle part of the Lower Travertine (Fauna 2). Such sympatry is not repeated during the

190   later part of the Ehringsdorf faunal sequence. With the deposition of the upper part of the

191   Lower Travertine (Mammal Fauna 3) the kirchbergensis-population has been completely

192   replaced by hemitoechus-rhinos. Low numbers of S. hemitoechus fossils were also recorded in

193   Ehringsdorf's Pariser horizon above the Lower Travertine (Mammal Fauna 5) and more

194   frequently in the Upper Travertines (Mammal Faunas 7-8), here either as the only rhinoceros

195   species or jointly with Coelodonta antiquitatis (Kahlke, 1975: p. 383). The stratigraphic

196   classification of the individual fossiliferous horizons of Weimar-Ehringsdorf is still debated.

197   The majority of biostratigraphic arguments (compiled in Kahlke et al., 2002; Katzschmann,

198   2007) assign the Lower Travertine with its Mammal Faunas 2 und 3 to MIS 7, without,

199   however, ultimate clarity. The correlation of the S. hemitoechus bearing Upper Travertines

200   either with MIS 7 or with 5e is also uncertain (Kahlke et al., 2002; Katzschmann, 2007).

201   The travertines of Weimar-Taubach inclusive of the Lower Travertine Sands, which produced

202   the extended series of S. kirchbergensis finds (Table 1, Figure 2e-f), are confidently assigned

203   to the Eemian, i.e. to the MIS 5e interglacial (Kahlke, 1977; Heinrich, 2003). Since the

204   majority of Weimar-Taubach's rhinoceros remains are the result of Middle Palaeolithic

205 killing and butchering activities (Bratlund, 1999 and references therein), they represent not

206 just the immediate vicinity of the site within the water-rich floodplain of the river Ilm, but the

207 more extended range of the human hunters. S. kirchbergensis therefore appears to have been

208 the only rhino species present fully developed interglacial conditions in the Taubach area. The

209 origin of a single hemitoechus-p4 from Weimar-Taubach is unclear; it probably derives from

210 younger layers (Kahlke, 1977).

211 A range of rhinoceros fossils from the British Isles dated to MIS 7 and MIS 5e were studied

212 (Table 1). Three rhinoceros species are recorded from the temperate deposits at Ilford (Uphall

213 Pit; West et al., 1964) in the Lower Thames Valley: S. hemitoechus, S. kirchbergensis and a

214 few specimens of C. antiquitatis (Schreve, 1997). The faunal material was collected from the

215 Taplow-Mucking Formation in specific brickearth pits during the 19th century, although their

216 exact provenance is largely unknown.

217 The sequence at Crayford (Scott, 2009), also in the Lower Thames Valley, shows great

218 similarities to the Ilford sequence and has a similar research history (Bridgland, 1994;

219 Gibbard, 1994). As at Ilford, the exact provenance of most specimens is unclear. The fauna

220 from the Crayford Gravel underlying the brickearth includes S. hemitoechus and C.

221 antiquitatis. The Lower Brickearth contained specimens of S. kirchbergensis and C.

222 antiquitatis (Schreve, 1997). Amino acid ratios are indicative of an MIS 7 age for the

223 temperate sediments at both sites (Penkman et al., 2008).

224 A temperate fauna, including a virtually complete skeleton of S. hemitoechus, was recovered

225 from Bed 2 of the Lifeboat Station channel near Selsey, West Sussex (West et al., 1960). The

226 channel is dated to MIS 7 based mainly on the composition of the mammalian fauna (Parfitt,

227 1998).

228 All three faunas are correlated with the late MIS 7 Sandy Lane Mammal Assemblage Zone

229 (MAZ), which is thought to reflect relatively continental climatic conditions (Schreve, 2001a,

230 b). Co-occurrence of S. hemitoechus and S. kirchbergensis can only tentatively be asserted for

9

231 Ilford, whilst at Crayford and Selsey only a single Stephanorhinus species is documented in

232 each assemblage. However, these sites date from the same temperate stage, and both species

233 have been found co-occurring at other Sandy Lane MAZ sites (e.g. West Thurrock,

234 Pontnewydd; Green, 1984; Schreve et al., 2006). Both species were therefore present during

235 MIS 7 and may have interacted. Below, these samples are collectively referred to as the

236 'British MIS 7 S. hemitoechus' or 'British MIS 7 S. kirchbergensis' sample.

237 For MIS 5e, six sites were chosen based on the reported presence of rhinoceros material in

238 good condition. The Last Interglacial faunal assemblage from Victoria Cave was collected

239 from the Hyaena Bone Bed within the Lower Cave Earth (Lord et al., 2007). Inside the cave,

240 it is overlain by a thin flowstone, which started forming relatively late in the interglacial

241 (Lundberg et al., 2010). The flowstone and calcite encasing a red deer antler from the Hyaena

242 Bone Bed was dated directly by U-series and TIMS to the Last Interglacial (Gascoyne et al.,

243 1981: p. 654; Gilmour et al., 2007: p. 795; Lundberg et al., 2010). In Kirkdale Cave the

244 fossiliferous deposit is reported to have been of homogeneous character, with a depth of about

245 30 cm (Dawkins, 1874; Boylan, 1981). A flowstone on top of this bone bed was dated by U-

246 series to the Last Interglacial (McFarlane and Ford, 1998). A number of specimens that are

247 labelled as coming from Kirkdale Cave have very different preservation characteristics from

248 the main collections. These specimens are excluded here. Based on faunal composition, the

249 site is correlated with the climatic optimum of the Ipswichian (MIS 5e). The fossiliferous

250 layer at Raygill Fissure (Davis, 1880) was correlated with Hippopotamus-bearing Ipswichian

251 clay in the Leeds area (Earp, 1961). The fossiliferous deposit in Joint Mitnor Cave (Figure 3e-

252 f) is dated to the Ipswichian based on faunal content (Sutcliffe, 1960). The Great Bone Bed in

253 Tornewton Cave can be correlated to the Hyaena Stratum of later excavations (Sutcliffe and

254 Zeuner, 1962; Currant, 1998). The age of the Hyaena Stratum is bracketed by two TIMS dates

255 of ca. 134 and 98 ka BP on stalagmite, although some authors regard the fauna as dating from

256 a later part of MIS 5 based on pollen and faunal composition (Gilmour et al., 2007).

257   A single fluvial site, Barrington, was included (Figure 3g-h). Channel infills, known as the

258   Barrington Beds, were exposed in quarries, and produced mammalian remains (Sparks, 1952).

259   Based on the composition of the mammal fauna, the Barrington Beds are ascribed to the

260   Ipswichian (Gibbard and Stuart, 1975).

261   All six Ipswichian sites considered produced remains of a single rhinoceros species,

262   Stephanorhinus hemitoechus. No S. kirchbergensis remains have been recovered from any

263   Last Interglacial sites in the British Isles even though rich faunal assemblages are available

264   from a range of depositional contexts dated to different phases of the interglacial. We

265   therefore here assume that S. kirchbergensis was absent from or extremely rare in the British

266   Isles during MIS 5e (Van Asperen, in prep.). Since all the above-mentioned British MIS 5e

267   sites, except for the lowland site of Barrington, come from upland areas, they are collectively

268   referred to as the 'British MIS 5e upland' sample in the DFA. The lowland sample from

269   Barrington is analyzed separately. In all other analyses, all British MIS 5e sites are collated

270   into a single sample.

271

272   [Insert here: Figure 1. Sites with remains of late Middle to Late Pleistocene Stephanorhinus

273   palaeopopulations studied for dietary signature (in the order of appearance in the text, see

274   section 3.1.): 1 - Bilzingsleben II; 2 - Weimar-Ehringsdorf; 3 - Weimar-Taubach; 4 - Ilford; 5

275   – Crayford; 6 - Selsey; 7 - Victoria Cave; 8 - Kirkdale Cave; 9 - Raygill Fissure; 10 - Joint

276   Mitnor Cave; 11 - Tornewton Cave; 12 - Barrington.

277   Figure 2. Tooth rows of Stephanorhinus kirchbergensis, occlusal and buccal views; a and b.

278   Bilzingsleben (no. 388-163, P2-M3 sin); c and d. Weimar-Ehringsdorf (IQW 1965-3440 (Ehr.

279   4089) and IQW 1965-3377 (Ehr. 10072), P2-M2 dex); e and f. Taubach (IQW 1968-10692

280   (Taub. 2632…2639), P3-M3 dex).

281   Figure 3. Teeth of Stephanorhinus hemitoechus, occlusal and buccal views; a and b.

282   Bilzingsleben (no. 663-4; M2 sin); c-d. Weimar-Ehringsdorf (IQW 1965-318 (Ehr. 3410), M2

283 dex); e-f. Joint Mitnor Cave (P36774, M1 sin; courtesy of Torquay Museum); g-h. Barrington

284 (BGS GSM779, M2 sin; courtesy of the Geological Survey Museum, Keyworth).]

285 [Insert here: Table 1. Minimum number of individuals (MNI) represented by the material of

286 Stephanorhinus studied; abbreviations in [] used in Figures]

287

288 **3.2. Morphometrics**

289 Due to differences in size and morphology, it is usually relatively straightforward to

290 distinguish skeletal elements of S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus, although a degree of

291 overlap occurs (Staesche, 1941; Fortelius et al., 1993; Mazza, 1993; Van der Made, 2000;

292 Lacombat, 2005, 2009). Measurements were taken and qualitative characteristics were

293 recorded for the upper and lower teeth following Lacombat (2009), who provides a system of

294 measurements that is modified and expanded from the work of Guérin (1980), Mazza (1988)

295 and Fortelius et al. (1993).

296 Overall levels of sexual dimorphism appear to be low in extant rhinoceroses (Loose, 1975).

297 Dimorphism in cranial measurements has been documented in free-ranging Ceratotherium

298 simum (Owen-Smith, 1988; Berger, 1994; Rachlow and Berger, 1997). Although several

299 cranial measurements are significantly different between the sexes in Rhinoceros unicornis,

300 and to a lesser degree in Rhinoceros sondaicus and Dicerorhinus sumatrensis, dental

301 measurements are not (Groves, 1982; Dinerstein, 1991). To assess the impact of sexual

302 dimorphism on dental characters in Pleistocene Stephanorhinus, coefficients of variation

303 (CVs, standard deviation/mean*100) were calculated for the different samples, as well as

304 overall CVs for the two species. These were compared with CVs for the same measurements

305 on extant rhinoceros teeth. CVs provide a means of comparing the degree of variation

306 between measurements of different absolute sizes. CVs for the same measurements for

307 closely related extant species gives some indication of how much variability can be expected

308 to occur in fossil species (Cope and Lacy, 1995). Although CVs should be used with caution

309   as indicators of biologically meaningful variables such as number of species and sexual

310   dimorphism (Carrasco, 1998, 2004), some trends can be discerned. Linear measurements of

311   mammalian dentitions tend to show little sexual dimorphism and have CVs between 5 and 10

312   (Gingerich, 1974; Yablokov, 1974; Gingerich and Schoeninger, 1979; Gingerich and Winkler,

313   1979). Sexually dimorphic variables tend to have coefficients of variation greater than 10

314   (Mihlbachler, 2007). Summary statistics for extant species and the Pleistocene samples can be

315   found in the Supplementary Data.

316   To examine the extent of the size differentiation between the two species, t-tests were carried

317   out for lengths and widths of the teeth. Results for the tests were considered significant if $p \leq$

318   0.05. Only samples where $n \geq 10$ were included in the tests since these tests are relatively

319   sensitive to small sample size.

320

321   **3.3. Mesowear analysis**

322   Mesowear analysis is a well-validated method that indicates wear patterns over a large part of

323   the lifespan of an individual animal (Fortelius and Solounias, 2000; Rivals et al., 2007). Tooth

324   wear in browsers, which consume mainly low-abrasive foodstuffs, is dominated by sharp

325   cusps and high relief. In contrast, grazers consume more grasses, often with a higher amount

326   of grit, both of which contribute to an abrasion-dominated wear pattern with round or blunt

327   cusps with low relief (Williams and Kay, 2001). Relatively small samples (n>10) give reliable

328   and significant results (Fortelius and Solounias, 2000).

329   The upper first and second molars were scored for mesowear on the buccal side of the tooth

330   (Franz-Odendaal and Kaiser, 2003). The occlusal relief was scored as either high or low.

331   Cusp shape was scored on the sharpest cusp as sharp, round or blunt. Teeth of very young

332   (more sharp cusps) and very old (more blunt cusps) individuals were excluded to prevent any

333   influence extreme wear stages may have on the classification (Fortelius and Solounias, 2000;

334   Rivals et al., 2007). The rhinoceros assemblage from Weimar-Taubach reflects selective

13

335   hunting of young individuals (Bratlund, 1999), leading to a reduced MNI for mesowear

336   analysis compared to total MNI (Table 1).

337   Scores for relief and cusp shape were combined into an overall mesowear score (0 = high and

338   sharp, 1 = high and round, 2 = low and sharp, 3 = low and round, 4 = low and blunt; Louys et

339   al., 2012). The Kruskal-Wallis test was used to analyse differences in mesowear scores

340   between the samples. For those analyses where the Kruskal-Wallis test showed a significant

341   difference, Mann-Whitney U-tests were used to investigate which samples had significantly

342   different mesowear scores. An overall Mann-Whitney U-test between the scores for S.

343   hemitoechus and S. kirchbergensis was also carried out.

344   Using the comparative dataset for 64 extant ungulates, compiled by Fortelius & Solounias

345   (2000), as a training set, a stepwise discriminant function analysis using Wilk's lambda was

346   carried out with the Pleistocene rhinoceros samples as ungrouped specimens. Mesowear data

347   for M1/2 of the Stephanorhinus hundsheimensis samples from the Central German sites of

348   Süßenborn [SUE] and Voigtstedt [VOI] (Kaiser and Kahlke, 2005; Kahlke and Kaiser, 2011)

349   were also included as ungrouped specimens. Mesowear scores for the fossil assemblages can

350   be found in Table 2. Because the mesowear scores are not independent (teeth with blunt cusps

351   have low relief), variables entered in the analysis were % of teeth with high relief, % of teeth

352   with sharp cusps and % of teeth with round cusps. Species with problematic dietary data (the

353   'mabra' species of Fortelius and Solounias, 2000) were left out of further analyses (cf. Kaiser

354   and Solounias, 2003), and the conservative dietary classification of Fortelius and Solounias

355   (2000) was used. The accuracy and robusticity of the differentiation between the dietary

356   categories was investigated with jackknifed cross-validation models, using a single species as

357   ungrouped case while using the other species in the original dataset as a generator set for

358   calculating discriminant functions. Hierarchical cluster analysis with complete linkage

359   (furthest neighbour, squared Euclidean distance) was carried out on the same dataset to

360   investigate which extant species are the most similar in their mesowear signature to the

14

361   Pleistocene rhinoceroses. All statistical analyses were performed with the Statistical Package

362   for the Social Sciences (SPSS) version 21.

363

364   [Insert here: Table 2. Mesowear scores for the fossil assemblages.]

365

366   Recently, there has been considerable discussion about the value of mesowear in determining

367   diets of past herbivore populations. The question has been raised whether mesowear provides

368   a dietary signal or whether environmental factors, in particular the amount of dust or grit on

369   the foodstuffs consumed, influence the mesowear value. Kaiser et al. (2013) suggested that

370   mesowear is primarily related to diet, whilst the presence of dust particles on the food may

371   contribute to overall wear of the tooth (and thus exerts selective pressure towards

372   hypsodonty), but does not impact on the morphology of tooth wear facets due to the small

373   size of the particles and the relatively uniform distribution of this wear. Kaiser et al. (2013)

374   also showed that mesowear is not related to habitat. Loffredo and DeSantis (2014) found that

375   teeth with similar mesowear values can display a wide range of δ^{13}C values. Therefore they

376   state that mesowear values should not be taken as indicative of individual diets, although they

377   regard the method as moderately reliable for assessing diet at population level. Like Loffredo

378   and DeSantis (2014), Ecker et al. (2013) found that there was no correlation between

379   mesowear, microwear (Rivals et al., 2009) and δ^{13}C values for a range of herbivore species

380   from the site of Payre in southeast France, dated to MIS 8-5. However, Ecker et al. (2013)

381   inferred that these herbivore species maintain their browsing or grazing diet across different

382   habitats, with δ^{13}C values reflecting differences in vegetation openness between e.g. river

383   valley and plateau. Differences between mesowear and microwear signatures can be

384   explained by the different timescales recorded by these two methods: while mesowear reflects

385   diet over a longer period of time (months to years), microwear records the diet over the last

386   days to weeks of an animal's life (Fortelius and Solounias, 2000; Rivals et al., 2007). In the

light of this discussion and the clear correlation of mesowear with diet in extant species (Fortelius and Solounias, 2000), we here conclude that mesowear provides valid information on a species' diet, especially at population level.

The diet of extant rhinoceros species varies from grazing via mixed feeding to browsing (Owen-Smith, 1988). The diet of Pleistocene rhinoceroses was equally diverse. Hernesniemi et al. (2011) compared mesowear scores for the extant species Diceros bicornis, Ceratotherium simum, Dicerorhinus sumatrensis, Rhinoceros sondaicus and R. unicornis with scores for the Pleistocene species Stephanorhinus kirchbergensis, S. hemitoechus, S. hundsheimensis and Coelodonta antiquitatis from the British Isles. Cluster analysis for the scores on M1 and M2 grouped Stephanorhinus kirchbergensis with Dicerorhinus sumatrensis and S. hundsheimensis with Rhinoceros sondaicus. Together with the somewhat more distant Stephanorhinus hemitoechus, these browsing species were clearly distinct from the mixed feeder Rhinoceros unicornis, which grouped closely with British Coelodonta antiquitatis in a cluster which also contains the grazer Ceratotherium simum. Within-species variation can be almost equally large. Mesowear analysis of two samples of early Middle Pleistocene S. hundsheimensis from the Central German sites of Süßenborn and Voigtstedt showed this species had a wide dietary range (Kaiser and Kahlke, 2005; Kahlke and Kaiser, 2011) varying from moderate grazing to non-specialised browsing with a high diversity of food items.

4. Results

4.1. Absolute size

The teeth of the two Stephanorhinus species are similar in shape but differ in size. T-tests are significant for all upper and lower lengths and widths (Table 3). Scatterplots of width versus length show two clusters, with varying but small degrees of overlap (Figure 4). Overall, the metric characteristics are congruent with qualitative traits; teeth with traits characteristic for S. kirchbergensis are mostly larger than teeth with S. hemitoechus traits. The teeth of S.

413   kirchbergensis from Bilzingsleben II are relatively small and overlap in size with the S.

414   hemitoechus teeth from the same location, although qualitative characteristics of the teeth, as

415   well as qualitative and quantitative data for the postcranial remains, clearly indicate the

416   presence of two species.

417   Van der Made (2000) documented a linear size increase of the lower third molars within the

418   kirchbergensis-group from Bilzingsleben II via Weimar-Ehringsdorf to Weimar-Taubach.

419   Our data, which includes the British MIS 7 S. kirchbergensis teeth and larger samples for the

420   German sites, confirm this trend (Figure 5).

421

422   [Insert here: Table 3. Table 3. Results of t-tests for dental measurements of S. hemitoechus

423   and S. kirchbergensis.

424   Figure 4. Scatterplots of width (L10/L9) vs. length (L2) for a. M2; b. m2; abbreviations: see

425   Table 1.

426   Figure 5. Mean values for the width of the posterior lobe of m1, m2 and m3 of S.

427   kirchbergensis from German late Middle Pleistocene sites.]

428

429   **4.2. Coefficient of variation**

430   73% of measurements of the upper and lower dentition of both extant and Pleistocene

431   rhinoceroses have CVs below 10. In the upper dentitions, some measurements for extant

432   Ceratotherium simum are relatively high, particularly on M2. The maximum length of the

433   crochet (L6) in the upper teeth is a highly variable qualitative characteristic, which is also

434   small in absolute size. Similarly, the two measurements in the lower teeth that are small in

435   absolute size (minimum height of the anterior and posterior valleys, L6 and L5) range widely,

436   more than half having a CV higher than 15. It is a well-known phenomenon for measurements

437   of small absolute size to have relatively high coefficients of variation (Yablokov, 1974;

438   MacFadden, 1989). Partly this is caused by the stronger impact of measurement error on

439 smaller variables, although in the case of L6 in the upper dentition it reflects a high level of

440 natural variation in this characteristic. CVs for measurements with small sample sizes are

441 somewhat higher than those for larger samples.

442

443 **4.3. Mesowear**

444 An overall Mann-Whitney U-test for differences between the mesowear scores for the two

445 Stephanorhinus species is significant (U=3184, p=0.035). A Kruskal-Wallis test for all

446 samples is significant (χ^2=13.023, p=0.011). Mann-Whitney U-tests reveal that the Weimar-

447 Ehringsdorf S. kirchbergensis sample is significantly different from the British MIS 5e S.

448 hemitoechus sample (U=879, p=0.016) and the Bilzingsleben II S. kirchbergensis sample

449 (U=1012, p=0.005), whilst the Weimar-Taubach S. kirchbergensis sample is also different

450 from these two samples (British MIS 5e S. hemitoechus: U=256.5, p=0.050; Bilzingsleben II

451 S. kirchbergensis: U= 296.5, p=0.027).

452 The DFA has an overall correct reclassification rate of 72.2% (cross-validation: 64.8%). 7 out

453 of the 11 studied Pleistocene rhinoceros samples are classified as mixed feeders (Table 4).

454 The S. hemitoechus samples from the British MIS 7 sites and the MIS 5e lowland site fall

455 along the grazer axis (Figure 6). The other samples fall along a straight line, with the Weimar-

456 Ehringsdorf S. hemitoechus identified as a grazer and with early Middle Pleistocene S.

457 hundsheimensis from Voigtstedt located at the extreme browser end of the spectrum. The S.

458 kirchbergensis samples align more closely with the browsers and mixed feeders, and the S.

459 hemitoechus samples cluster toward the mixed feeder-grazer end of the spectrum.

460

461 [Insert here: Table 4. Dietary classification of Pleistocene Stephanorhinus samples using

462 DFA]

463

464   The patterns found in the DFA are born out in the cluster analysis (Figure 7). The main

465   distinction is between a browser cluster, a number of mixed feeder clusters and a grazer

466   cluster. The three browsing and one mixed feeding extant rhinoceros species are included in a

467   browser-dominated cluster, while the grazing Ceratotherium simum falls within the cluster of

468   the extreme grazers.

469   The British MIS 7 S. hemitoechus sample is the only fossil assemblage that clusters with the

470   extreme grazers. The remaining S. hemitoechus samples, as well as the S. kirchbergensis

471   samples from Bilzingsleben II and early Middle Pleistocene S. hundsheimensis from

472   Süßenborn, are linked most closely with a mixed feeder-grazer group of Artiodactyla with a

473   mesowear signature is characterised by a high percentage of teeth with high relief and round

474   cusps. The mixed feeder cluster that includes the S. kirchbergensis samples from the British

475   MIS 7 sites, Weimar-Ehringsdorf and Weimar-Taubach consists of cervids, bovids and

476   camelids with a high percentage of teeth with high relief, while a higher percentage of teeth

477   with sharp cusps is present than in the S. hemitoechus cluster. The Voigtstedt S.

478   hundsheimensis remains are in the same group as the browsing extant rhinoceros species (cf.

479   Kahlke and Kaiser, 2011).

480

481   [Insert here: Figure 6. Plot of scores on DF2 vs. DF1 for a range of extant herbivore species

482   and Pleistocene rhinoceros assemblages; abbreviations: see Table 1.

483   Figure 7. Cluster diagram using mesowear variables for extant herbivores and European

484   Pleistocene rhinoceros assemblages; dots: extant rhinoceros species; arrows: Pleistocene

485   samples.]

486

487   **5. Discussion**

488   The overall mesowear signature of the studied samples of European Pleistocene

489   Stephanorhinus indicates a predominantly mixed feeder diet (Table 4). Interestingly, the only

490   fossil sample that clusters closely with any of the extant rhinoceros species, at the browser

491   end of the spectrum, is the Voigtstedt S. hundsheimensis sample (see Kahlke and Kaiser,

492   2011). In comparison with the extant Asian and African rhinoceroses, most European late

493   Middle Pleistocene Stephanorhinus had a diet that was shifted more towards the mixed

494   feeder-grazer end of the dietary spectrum (Figure 6). Extant rhinoceros species therefore do

495   not provide the most suitable dietary analogues for European Pleistocene rhinoceroses

496   (compare Hernesniemi et al., 2011; Taylor et al., 2013). The British MIS 7 S. hemitoechus

497   sample falls in the same group of grazers as Ceratotherium simum, characterised by a high

498   percentage of teeth with low relief. These grazers feed primarily on grasses, particularly short

499   grasses, in open environments, apart from Saiga tatarica, a mixed feeder that today lives in

500   the Central Asian dry steppe and semi-desert (Bannikow, 1963; Bekenov et al., 1998; Sokolov

501   and Zhirnov, 1998).

502   The remaining S. hemitoechus samples from Central Europe, as well as the S. kirchbergensis

503   sample from Bilzingsleben II and the S. hundsheimensis sample from Süßenborn, align with

504   the extant bovids Alcelaphus lichtensteinii, Boselaphus tragocamelus, Hippotragus equinus,

505   Hippotragus niger, Kobus ellipsiprymnus, Redunca fulvorufula, Redunca redunca, Syncerus

506   caffer and Tragelaphus strepsiceros, and the cervid Axis porcinus (Figure 7). This cluster

507   consists of grazers and mixed feeders living in a variety of environments ranging from

508   floodplains and savannahs to open woodlands. The S. kirchbergensis samples from the British

509   MIS 7 sites, Weimar-Ehringsdorf and Weimar-Taubach fall most closely to the extant cervids

510   Axis axis and Cervus unicolor, the bovids Aepyceros melampus, Ammodorcas clarkei,

511   Litocranius walleri, Ourebia ourebi, Tetracerus quadricornis and Tragelaphus angasii, and

512   the camelids Camelus dromedarius and Lama glama. This cluster is dominated by mixed

513   feeders which incorporate a larger amount of browse in their diet. Most of these species live

514   in relatively dry areas of open woodland and grassland.

When comparing the dietary flexibility of S. hundsheimensis with that of the other two Stephanorhinus species, it is clear that the former had a broader dietary range than either S. kirchbergensis or S. hemitoechus, ranging from an extreme browser to a mixed feeder with a considerable amount of grass in the diet. Our results therefore illustrate how the generalist subsistence strategy of S. hundheimensis (cf. Kahlke and Kaiser, 2011) contrasts with the more specialised strategies of S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus. There is a clear indication of more browse in the diet of S. kirchbergensis compared to that of S. hemitoechus, whilst S. hemitoechus had the ability to subsist on a diet rich in grasses. However, it is too simplistic to describe S. kirchbergensis as a 'forest' rhinoceros and S. hemitoechus as a 'steppe' rhinoceros, assuming a browsing resp. grazing diet and taking these species as indicative of forested versus open landscapes. The 'forest' rhinoceros did not feed exclusively in forest areas, and likewise the 'steppe' rhinoceros was not exclusively a steppe grazer. The analysis of the dietary signature of these rhinoceros species in cases of sympatry and allopatry clearly demonstrates that their feeding traits, within a certain range of variation, relate to the characteristics of available food resources, which in turn reflect the range of habitats present in the regions considered during the Middle and Late Pleistocene interglacials.

The S. hemitoechus samples studied here do not appear in stratigraphic order in the DFA and the dendrogram (Figures 6 and 7). In the S. kirchbergensis samples, there is an increase in the size of the dentition, especially the m3 (Figure 5), and a weak trend towards a larger proportion of browse in the diet (Figure 6). The increased size of the dentition in S. kirchbergensis could find an explanation in the fact that in herbivores the dimensions of the teeth are related to the quantity and quality of the food. Larger occlusal surfaces enable more effective mastication of food (e.g. Janis, 1976, 1988; Van der Made, 2010; Anders and Von Koenigswald, 2013), providing a selective advantage when the proportion of low quality food resources in the diet increases. For the hindgut fermenter S. kirchbergensis, an increasing proportion of less-digestible browse in the diet may have necessitated a higher food intake (cf.

541   Steuer et al., 2010). However, dietary differences between the MIS 7 and MIS 5e S.

542   kirchbergensis specimens are limited (Figure 6). Thus, there is little indication for a

543   directional evolutionary process of increasing specialization of the two species as grazer resp.

544   browser during the timespan considered. Instead, the individuals of the considered

545   palaeopopulations reacted to changing environmental conditions within the limits of their

546   feeding abilities.

547   The Bilzingsleben II samples present a suitable starting point for deciphering the relationships

548   between the Stephanorhinus mesowear record, environmental factors and competitive

549   interactions between the two species. The great similarity of the dietary traits of co-occurring

550   S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus individuals from this site must be explained by a high

551   degree of spatial and temporal uniformity of food resources available to both species.

552   Although the botanical evidence from the fossil layer of the Stephanorhinus remains is not

553   sufficient for a detailed reconstruction of the contemporaneous vegetation (Erd, 1997), the

554   geographic position of the site explains the apparent low habitat diversity of the region under

555   fully developed interglacial (MIS 11) conditions. Bilzingsleben II lies within an area known

556   as the 'Zirkumherzynes Trockengebiet', a relatively dry region in the rain shadow of the Harz

557   Mountains (Figure 1). As is presently the case, during the Middle and Late Pleistocene

558   interglacials Atlantic low-pressure systems controlled precipitation levels in Northwest and

559   Central Europe (Kaspar and Cubasch, 2007). The mountains immediately northwest of

560   Bilzingsleben protected the region against the prevailing winds from the west. As a

561   mesoclimatic result, the area east and southeast of the Harz had a subcontinental climate,

562   which in combination with the uniform morphological and edaphic characteristics of the

563   region resulted in a relatively uniform vegetation pattern (T. Litt, pers. comm.). Based on

564   these geomorphological considerations and the interglacial character of the mammalian fauna

565   recovered from the site, which includes an abundance of large herbivores (Mania, 1991), the

566   inferred vegetation consisted of subcontinental thermophilous woodland with rich

undergrowth (T. Litt, pers. comm.). Such a habitat has a relatively high biomass and productivity in vegetation layers available to the rhinoceroses and other large herbivores. Both rhinoceros species are present in nearly equal numbers, indicating that S. kirchbergensis, which later appears to be a strong competitor, did not outcompete S. hemitoechus at this time. This may be due to the fact that its teeth were still small relative to its body size, while S. hemitoechus benefited from its smaller body size.

Compared to Bilzingsleben II, the dietary signals of the two Stephanorhinus species from Weimar-Ehringsdorf (MIS 7/5e) are significantly more differentiated (Figure 6). The latter fossil site is located in a wetter region of the central German Thuringian Basin, on the flank of a tectonic graben forming the valley of the River Ilm. The abundant floral remains from the find layers of the Ehringsdorf S. kirchbergensis (Mammal Fauna 2) and S. hemitoechus (Mammal Faunas 2-3, 7-8) specimens reveal a generally high diversity of habitats in the vicinity of the site (Vent, 1974). However, in comparison with the lower and middle parts of the Lower Travertine (Mammal Fauna 2; see section 3.1.), the Upper Travertines (Mammal Faunas 7-8) experienced intensified subcontinental climatic influences. Due to this environmental trend and the time-transgressive nature of the Ehringsdorf S. hemitoechus sample (Table 1), a wide diversity of rhinoceros habitats is represented in the divergence of the dietary signal. In particular, the relatively grazer-like signature of the S. hemitoechus sample reflects the influence of the more subcontinental climate of the Upper Travertine.

The three British MIS 7 sites are all of fluvial origin, although the Selsey channel was of a smaller scale than the Thames River (Ilford and Crayford). The latter part of MIS 7, from which these sites date, is known to have been relatively dry and continental in northwest Europe, with somewhat lower temperatures than in most other late Middle Pleistocene interglacials (Ruddiman and McIntyre, 1982; Petit et al., 1999; Desprat et al. 2006). This part of the interglacial witnessed an influx of animals adapted to open environments into northwest Europe, whilst forest-adapted animals withdrew (Schreve, 2001a, 2004; Auguste,

593   2009). The British MIS 7 samples display the largest dietary difference between the two

594   Stephanorhinus species within the time span considered. In comparison with the Weimar-

595   Ehringsdorf specimens, the British MIS 7 S. kirchbergensis sample is shifted towards the

596   mixed feeder end of the spectrum (Figure 6), whilst S. hemitoechus has the dietary signature

597   of a grazer. This indicates that the availability of browse was limited, in accordance with

598   other environmental proxies which are indicative of open environments in the British Isles

599   (Schreve, 2001a). Even though its optimal diet seems to have incorporated more browse (see

600   below), S. kirchbergensis was able to increase the grazing component in its diet, and be a

601   strong enough competitor to force S. hemitoechus to consume greater proportions of abrasive

602   foodstuffs.

603   During at least part of MIS 5e, the Stephanorhinus species show a mostly disjunct

604   distribution, with S. kirchbergensis occurring in Central Europe, whilst S. hemitoechus is

605   common in western parts of the continent and in the British Isles. Under these conditions, S.

606   kirchbergensis at Weimar-Taubach consumed a significantly higher percentage of browse

607   than S. hemitoechus. The geomorphological characteristics of this site are similar to those at

608   Weimar-Ehringsdorf, situated only 2 kilometres northwest of Taubach, providing a similar

609   diversity of habitats. Nevertheless, the absence of the only other temperate-adapted rhinoceros

610   species and the diverse range of available foodstuffs ameliorated the environmental

611   conditions for S. kirchbergensis.

612   Of the British MIS 5e sites with S. hemitoechus fossils, Victoria Cave, Kirkdale Cave and

613   Joint Mitnor Cave are all located on the boundary between an upland area and a lowland area,

614   providing a diverse habitat of plateaus, slopes, valleys and floodplains. Raygill Fissure, and to

615   a lesser degree Tornewton Cave are situated in a diverse upland landscape with plateaus,

616   valleys and streams. In contrast, the site of Barrington lies in a lowland area with lower

617   habitat diversity, with open environments along the river and possibly woodland further away

618   from the active stream (Gibbard and Stuart, 1975). Although we studied only a single lowland

619 site and we cannot exclude that other lowland sites show a different pattern, interestingly,

620 these different levels of habitat diversity can be traced in the mesowear scores for these sites:

621 the upland samples are classified as mixed feeder, whereas the lowland sample is classified as

622 grazer, although it is not displaced towards the grazer end of the spectrum as much as the

623 British MIS 7 S. hemitoechus sample (Figure 6).

624 Since further environmental proxies are only available for the Barrington site, we cannot

625 exclude the possibility that these sites date from different phases of the same interglacial.

626 However, this scenario seems unlikely based on the fully developed interglacial character of

627 the faunal assemblages: the ecologically demanding Hippopotamus amphibius is recorded

628 from all sites, and other 'temperate indicators' such as Palaeoloxodon antiquus, Sus scrofa,

629 Dama dama and Capreolus capreolus are also present in the upland sites. Since the large

630 herbivore faunas from the upland and lowland sites are very similar, the difference in the

631 mesowear scores could reflect the availability of foodstuffs in the environment. A more

632 diverse habitat would have provided a wider range of resources, enabling S. hemitoechus to

633 subsist on a mixed feeder diet, whilst a more homogeneous environment with open grassland

634 forced the species to graze.

635

636 **6. Conclusions**

637 Stephanorhinus kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus were embedded in a dynamic process of

638 temporo-spatial replacements and interspecific differentiation of Middle to Late Pleistocene

639 rhinoceroses in the western Palaearctic. Both their anatomical features (see section 2) and the

640 obtained mesowear scores show significantly higher dietary specializations compared to the

641 Early to early Middle Pleistocene S. hundsheimensis. This is consistent with the idea that the

642 100 ka periodicity in the global climatic record caused a sustained environmental continuity

643 compared to the preceding 41 ka regime and thus promoted the development of more

644 specialized subsistence strategies (Kahlke and Kaiser, 2011).

645   The presence of the rhinoceros species considered here is often taken as a first indication of

646   the character of the vegetation prevailing in their respective habitats. However, our studies

647   demonstrate that species identity alone is not sufficient to establish the real dietary traits of a

648   Stephanorhinus palaeopopulation. The occurrence of the 'forest' rhinoceros S. kirchbergensis

649   in a faunal assemblage by no means indicates exclusively forested habitats. Similarly, the

650   'steppe' rhinoceros S. hemitoechus did not occupy steppe landscapes only. Instead, the

651   reconstruction of past rhinoceros diets on the level of extended samples from stratigraphically

652   well-defined palaeopopulations of different European regions sheds light on the impact of

653   habitat diversity and the effect of interspecific competition with closely related rhinoceros

654   species on feeding behaviour.

655   Whilst both S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus had already developed advanced dietary

656   specializations compared to that of the "indigenous" S. hundsheimensis when they first

657   entered Europe, there is little evidence of progressing dietary specialization of the two

658   newcomers over the late Middle and Late Pleistocene. A moderate size increase of the molar

659   row in S. kirchbergensis over this period may have provided some advantage. The mesowear

660   signals of both species indicate a mixed feeder diet, similar to that of extant mammal species

661   in relatively open habitats. In comparison with S. hemitoechus, S. kirchbergensis generally

662   consumed more browse. Nevertheless, both species maintained a level of dietary flexibility,

663   with S. kirchbergensis including more or less browse in its diet depending on the quality of

664   the habitat, and S. hemitoechus shifting from mixed feeder to consuming more grass when

665   necessary. Although this indicates they preferred different habitats, clearly both species were

666   capable of surviving on a range of diets in a range of environments.

667   Low habitat variability forced S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus to consume very similar

668   diets, as is evidenced by the sympatric Bilzingsleben II populations. Increasing habitat

669   variability correlates with an increasing degree of divergence in feeding traits both within and

670   between Stephanorhinus species. At Weimar-Ehringsdorf, Weimar-Taubach, and the British

671 MIS 5e upland sites, high habitat variability was combined with relatively high precipitation,

672 allowing S. hemitoechus to consume its optimal mixed feeder diet, and S. kirchbergensis to

673 incorporate more browse. Low habitat variability pushed S. hemitoechus towards consuming

674 more grass even in the absence of S. kirchbergensis, as reflected by the British MIS 5e

675 lowland sites. This pattern therefore holds regardless of whether both species were co-

676 occurring or only one species was present, although the disjunct distribution pattern during

677 MIS 5e appears to have presented optimum conditions for both species. However, in some

678 cases the impact of habitat variability on dietary composition was modified by the presence of

679 a closely related competitor. Thus, S. kirchbergensis from British MIS 7 sites, with low

680 precipitation levels, was able to survive on less browse, thereby displacing co-occurring S.

681 hemitoechus towards a grass-dominated diet.

682 Similar patterns of dietary variation related to habitat characteristics and competitive

683 interactions have been observed in a range of other fossil species, such as Neogene equids

684 (Kaiser, 2003) and bovids (Solounias and Hayek, 1993; Merceron et al., 2004, 2006;

685 Kostopoulos and Karakütük, in press), Early and Middle Pleistocene Proboscidea (Rivals et

686 al., 2012; Rivals et al., in prep.) and Late Pleistocene cervids (Rivals and Solounias, 2007;

687 Rivals et al., 2010). As in the rhinoceros species with highly specialised feeding traits studied

688 here, these animals had a considerable dietary flexibility and adapted their diet according to

689 the availability of food resources in different habitats (Kaiser, 2003; Rivals and Solounias,

690 2007; Tütken et al., 2013).

691 For Middle to Late Pleistocene S. kirchbergensis and S. hemitoechus of Central and

692 Northwest Europe, it appears likely that the diet consumed was not simply the result of a

693 directed time-transgressive evolution. Even as specialists they retained a certain amount of

694 ecological flexibility as part of their subsistence strategy. Rather, within the range of each

695 species' ecological tolerance, diet was controlled by environmental parameters, with a

696 particular role for habitat variability. Whilst these rhinos obviously had a preferred optimal

697 diet, in most cases they had to make do with what was available in their environment,

698 following the timeless proverb "You'll have to take pot luck!"

699

700 **Acknowledgments**

722

References

Álvarez-Lao, D.J., García, N., 2011. Southern dispersal and Palaeoecological implications of woolly rhinoceros (Coelodonta antiquitatis): review of the Iberian occurrences. Quaternary Science Reviews 30, 2002-2017. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2011.05.005

Anders, U., von Koenigswald, W., 2013. Increasing and decreasing functional area of the dentition (FAD) of Mammuthus primigenius. Paläontologische Zeitschrift 87, 515-527. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s12542-013-0168-2

Auguste, P., 2009. Évolution des peuplements mammaliens en Europe du nord-ouest durant le Pléistocène moyen et supérieur. Le cas de la France septentrionale. Quaternaire 20: 527-550.

Bannikow, A.G., 1963. Die Saiga-Antilope (Saiga tatarica L.). A. Ziemsen, Wittenberg Lutherstadt.

Bekenov, A.B., Grachev, IU.A., Milner-Gulland, E.J., 1998. The ecology and management of the Saiga antelope in Kazakhstan. Mammal Review 28, 1-52. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2907.1998.281024.x

Beljaeva, E.I., David, A.I., 1975. Die Nashörner (Rhinocerotidae) aus dem Faunenkomplex von Tiraspol. Quartärpaläontologie 1, 157-175.

Berger, J., 1994. Science, conservation, and black rhinos. Journal of Mammalogy 75, 298-308. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/1382548

749   Boylan, P.J., 1981. A new revision of the Pleistocene mammalian fauna of Kirkdale Cave,

750   Yorkshire. Proceedings of the Yorkshire Geological Society 43, 253-280. DOI:

751   http://dx.doi.org/10.1144/pygs.43.3.253

752

753   Bratlund, B., 1999. Taubach revisited. Jahrbuch des Römisch-Germanischen Zentralmuseums

754   Mainz 46, 61-174 + pl. 1-10.

755

756   Bridgland, D.R., 1994. Quaternary of the Thames. Chapman and Hall, London.

757

758   Carrasco, M.A., 1998. Variation and its implication in a population of Cupidinimus

759   (Heteromyidae) from Hepburn's Mesa, Montana. Journal of Vertebrate Paleontology 18, 391-

760   402. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/02724634.1998.10011067

761

762   Carrasco, M.A., 2004. Assessing statistical techniques for detecting multispecies samples of

763   Heteromyids in the fossil record: a test using extant Dipodomys. Bulletin of the American

764   Museum of Natural History 285, 120-129. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1206/0003-

765   0090(2004)285<0120:C>2.0.CO;2

766

767   Cerdeño, E., 1990. Stephanorhinus hemitoechus (Falc.) (Rhinocerotidae, Mammalia) del

768   Pleistoceno medio y superior de España. Estudios Geológicos 46, 465-479. DOI:

769   http://dx.doi.org/10.3989/egeol.90465-6475

770

771   Chase, J.M., Leibold, M.A., 2003. Ecological Niches: Linking Classical and Contemporary

772   Approaches. University of Chicago Press, Chicago.

773

774   Codron, D., Codron, J., Lee-Thorp, J.A., Sponheimer, M., De Ruiter, D., Sealy, J., Grant, R,

775   Fourie, N., 2007. Diets of savanna ungulates from stable carbone isotope composition of

776   faeces.   Journal   of   Zoology   273,   21-29.   DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-

777   7998.2007.00292.x

778

779   Cope, D.A., Lacy, M.G., 1995. Comparative application of the coefficient of variation and

780   range-based statistics for assessing the taphonomic composition of fossil samples. Journal of

781   Human Evolution 29, 549-576. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1006/jhev.1995.1075

782

783   Currant, A.P., 1998. Tornewton Cave, in: Campbell, S., C.O. Hunt, J.D. Scourse, D.H. Keen

784   & N. Stephens (Eds.), Quaternary of south-west England. Chapman & Hall, London, pp. 138-

785   145.

786

787   Dammhahn, M., Soarimalala, V., Goodman, S.M., 2013. Trophic niche differentiation and

788   microhabitat utilisation in a species-rich montane forest small mammal community of eastern

789   Madagascar.   Biotropica   45,   111-118.   DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-

790   7429.2012.00893.x

791

792   Davis, J.W., 1880. Report of the Raygill Fissure exploration committee, consisting of Prof.

793   A.H. Green, M.A., F.G.S.; Prof. L.C. Miall, F.G.S.; John Brigg, F.G.S.; and James W. Davis,

794   F.S.A., F.G.S., &c., (reporter). Proceedings of the Yorkshire Geological and Polytechnic

795   Society 7, 300-306. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1144/pygs.7.3.300

796

797   Dawkins, W.B., 1874. Cave Hunting, Researches on the Evidence of Caves Respecting the

798   Early Inhabitants of Europe. Macmillan and co, London.

799

800 Deng, T., Wang, X., Fortelius, M., Li, Q., Wang, Y., Tseng, Z.J., Takeuchi, G.T., Saylor, J.E.,

801 Säilä, L.K., Xie, G., 2011. Out of Tibet: Pliocene Woolly Rhino Suggests High-Plateau

802 Origin of Ice Age Megaherbivores. Science 333, 1285-1288. DOI:

803 http://dx.doi.org/10.1126/science.1206594

804

805 Desprat, S., Sánchez Goñi, M.F., Turon, J.-L., Duprat, J., Malaizé, B., Peypouquet, J.-P.,

806 2006. Climatic variability of Marine Isotope Stage 7: direct land-sea-ice correlation from a

807 multiproxy analysis of a north-western Iberian margin deep-sea core. Quaternary Science

808 Reviews 25, 1010-1026. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2006.01.001

809

810 Dinerstein, E., 1991. Sexual dimorphism in the greater one-horned rhinoceros (Rhinoceros

811 unicornis). Journal of Mammalogy 72, 450-457. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/1382127

812

813 Earp, J.R., 1961. Geology of the Country around Clitheroe and Nelson (one-inch geological

814 sheet 68, new series). Memoirs of the Geological Survey of Great Britain, England and Wales

815 68. Institute of Geological Sciences, London.

816

817 Ecker, M., Bocherens, H., Julien, M.-A., Rivals, F., Raynal, J.-P., Moncel, M.-H., 2013.

818 Middle Pleistocene ecology and Neanderthal subsistence: Insights from stable isotope

819 analyses in Payre (Ardèche, southeastern France). Journal of Human Evolution 65. 363-373.

820 DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jhevol.2013.06.013

821

822 Elton, C.S., 1927. Animal Ecology. Sidgwick & Jackson, London.

823

824 Erd, K., 1997. Pollenanalytische Datierung des Seekalk/Fundhorizonts von Bilzingsleben. In:

825 Mania, D., Mania, U., Heinrich, W.-D., Fischer, K., Böhme, G., Turner, A., Erd, K., Mai,

826 D.H., Bilzingsleben V. Homo erectus - seine Kultur und Umwelt. Zum Lebensbild des

827 Urmenschen. Verlag Ausbildung + Wissen, Bad Homburg, Leipzig, pp. 107-112.

828

829 Fortelius, M., 1982. Ecological aspects of dental functional morphology in the Plio-

830 Pleistocene rhinoceroses of Europe. In: Kurtén, B. (Ed.), Teeth: Form, Function, and

831 Evolution. Columbia University Press, New York, pp. 163-181.

832

833 Fortelius, M., Solounias, N., 2000. Functional characterization of ungulate molars using the

834 abrasion-attrition wear gradient: a new method for reconstructing paleodiets. American

835 Museum Novitates 3301, 1-36. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1206/0003-

836 0082(2000)301<0001:FCOUMU>2.0.CO;2

837

838 Fortelius, M., Mazza, P., Sala, B., 1993. Stephanorhinus (Mammalia: Rhinocerotidae) of the

839 western European Pleistocene, with a revision of S. etruscus (Falconer, 1868).

840 Palaeontographia Italica 80, 63-155.

841

842 Franz-Odendaal, T.A., Kaiser, T.M., 2003. Differential mesowear in the maxillary and

843 mandibular cheek dentition of some ruminants (Artiodactyla). Annales Zoologici Fennici 40,

844 395-410.

845

846 Gascoyne, M., Currant, A.P., Lord, T.C., 1981. Ipswichian fauna of Victoria Cave and the

847 marine palaeoclimatic record. Nature 294, 652-654. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/294652a0

848

849 Gibbard, P.L., 1994. Pleistocene History of the Lower Thames Valley. Cambridge University

850 Press: Cambridge.

851

852   Gibbard, P.L., Stuart, A.J., 1975. Flora and vertebrate fauna of the Barrington Beds.

853   Geological Magazine 112, 493-501. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0016756800046215

854

855   Gilmour, M., Currant, A., Jacobi, R., Stringer, C., 2007. Recent TIMS dating results from

856   British Late Pleistocene vertebrate faunal localities: context and interpretation. Journal of

857   Quaternary Science 22, 793-800. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jqs.1112

858

859   Gingerich, P.D., 1974. Size variability of the teeth in living mammals and the diagnosis of

860   closely related sympatric fossil species. Journal of Paleontology 48, 895-903.

861

862   Gingerich, P.D., Schoeninger, M.J., 1979. Patterns of tooth size variability in the dentition of

863   primates.   American   Journal   of   Physical   Anthropology   51,   457-465.   DOI:

864   http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/ajpa.1330510318

865

866   Gingerich, P.D., Winkler, D.A., 1979. Patterns of variation and correlation in the dentition of

867   the   red   fox,   Vulpes   vulpes.   Journal   of   Mammalogy   60,   691-704.   DOI:

868   http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/1380186

869

870   Green, H.S., 1984. Pontnewydd Cave: a lower Palaeolithic Hominid Site in Wales: the First

871   Report. National Museum of Wales, Cardiff.

872

873   Groves,   C.P.,   1972.   Ceratotherium   simum.   Mammalian   Species   8,   1-6.   DOI:

874   http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/3503966

875

876   Groves, C.P., 1982. The skulls of Asian rhinoceroses: wild and captive. Zoo Biology 1, 251-

877   261. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/zoo.1430010309

878

879   Groves, C.P., Kurt, F., 1972. Dicerorhinus sumatrensis. Mammalian Species 21, 1-6. DOI:

880   http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/3503818

881

882   Groves, C.P., Leslie, D.M. Jr., 2011. Rhinoceros sondaicus (Perissodactyla: Rhinocerotidae).

883   Mammalian Species 43. 190-208. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1644/887.1

884

885   Guérin, C., 1973. Les trois espèces de rhinocéros (Mammalia, Perissodactyla) du gisement

886   pléistocène moyen des Abîmes de La Fage (Corrèze). Nouvelles Archives du Muséum d'

887   Histoire naturelle de Lyon 11, 55-84, pl. 5-17.

888

889   Guérin, C., 1980. Les rhinoceros (Mammalia, Perissodactyla) du Miocène terminal au

890   Pléistocène supérieur en Europe occidentale. Comparaison avec les espèces actuelles.

891   Documents des Laboratoires de Géologie de Lyn 79 (1-3), 1-1185.

892

893   Hayward, M.W., Kerley, G.I.H., 2008. Prey preference and dietary overlap amongst Africa's

894   large predators. South African Journal of Wildlife Research 38, 93-108. DOI:

895   http://dx.doi.org/10.3957/0379-4369-38.2.93

896

897   Heinrich, W.-D., 2003. Rodentier-Biostratigraphie und Altersstellung pleistozäner Säugetier-

898   Fundstätten Mitteldeutschlands, in: Burdukiewicz, J.M., Fiedler, L., Heinrich, W.-D., Justus,

899   A., Brühl, E. (Eds.), Erkenntnisjäger. Kultur und Umwelt des frühen Menschen. Festschrift

900   für Dietrich Mania. Veröffentlichungen des Landesmuseums für Archäologie Sachsen-Anhalt

901   57/I, pp. 237-245.

902

903   Hemmer, H., Kahlke, R.-D., Keller, T., 2003. *Panthera onca gombaszoegensis* (Kretzoi,

904   1938) from the Early Middle Pleistocene Mosbach Sands (Wiesbaden, Hessen, Germany) − A

905   contribution to the knowledge of the variability and history of the dispersal of the jaguar.

906   Neues Jahrbuch für Geologie und Paläontologie, Abhandlungen 229, 31-60.

907

908   Hernesniemi, E., Blomstedt, K., Fortelius, M., 2011. Multi-view stereo three-dimensional

909   reconstruction of lower molars of Recent and Pleistocene rhinoceroses for mesowear analysis.

910   Palaeontologia Electronica 14, palaeo-electronica.org/2011_2/246/index.html.

911

912   Hillman-Smith, A.K.K., Groves, C.P., 1994. *Diceros bicornis*. Mammalian Species 455, 1-8.

913   DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/3504292

914

915   Jacoby, M.E., Hilderbrand, G.V., Servheen, C., Schwartz, C.C., Arthur, S.A., Hanley, T.A.,

916   Robbins, C.T., Michener, R., 1999. Trophic relations of brown and black bears in several

917   western North American ecosystems. Journal of Wildlife Management 63, 921-929. DOI:

918   http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/3802806

919

920   Janis, C., 1976. The evolutionary strategy of the Equidae and the origins of rumen and cecal

921   digestion. Evolution 30, 757-774. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2307/2407816

922

923   Janis, C.M., 1988. An estimation of tooth volume and hypsodonty indices in ungulate

924   mammals, and the correlation of these factors with dietary preference, in: Russell, D.E.,

925   Santoro J.-P., Sigogneau-Russell, D. (Eds.), Teeth Revisited: Proceedings of the VIIth

926   International Symposium on Dental Morphology, Paris 1986. Mémoires du muséum national

927   d'histoire naturelle, série C, 53: pp. 367-387.

928

929   Janis, C.M., 1990. The correlation between diet and dental wear in herbivorous mammals and

930   its relationship to the determination of diets of extinct species, in: Boucot, A.J. (Ed.),

931   Evolutionary Paleobiology of Behavior and Coevolution. Elsevier, Amsterdam, pp. 241-259.

932

933   Kahlke, H.-D, 1975. Die Rhinocerotiden-Reste aus den Travertinen von Weimar-Ehringsdorf.

934   Abhandlungen des Zentralen Geologischen Instituts, Paläontologische Abhandlungen 23,

935   337-397.

936

937   Kahlke, H.-D, 1977. Die Rhinocerotidenreste aus den Travertinen von Taubach.

938   Quartärpaläontologie 2, 305-359 + pls. XXXI-XXXVII.

939

940   Caution: H̲.-D Kahlke and R̲.-D. Kahlke are different authors. Please do not lump together!

941

942   Kahlke, R.-D., 2014. The origin of Eurasian Mammoth Faunas (Mammuthus-Coelodonta

943   Faunal Complex). Quaternary Science Reviews 96, 32-49. DOI:

944   http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2013.01.012

945

946   Kahlke, R.-D., Lacombat, F., 2008. The earliest immigration of woolly rhinoceros

947   (Coelodonta tologoijensis, Rhinocerotidae, Mammalia) into Europe and its adaptive evolution

948   in Palaearctic cold stage mammal faunas. Quaternary Science Reviews 27, 1951-1961. DOI:

949   http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2008.07.013

950

951   Kahlke, R.-D., Kaiser, T.M., 2011. Generalism as a subsistence strategy: advantages and

952   limitations of the highly flexible feeding traits of Pleistocene Stephanorhinus hundsheimensis

953   (Rhinocerotidae, Mammalia). Quaternary Science Reviews 30, 2250-2261. DOI:

954   http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2009.12.012

955

956 Kahlke, R.-D., Maul, L.C., Meyrick, R.A., Stebich, M., Grasselt, T., 2002. The Quaternary

957 sequence from the late Middle to Upper Pleistocene site of Weimar-Ehringsdorf, in: Meyrick,

958 R.A., Schreve, D.C. (Eds.), The Quaternary of Central Germany (Thuringia & Surroundings).

959 Field Guide. Quaternary Research Association, London, pp. 163-177.

960

961 Kahlke, R.-D., García, N., Kostopoulos, D.S., Lacombat, F., Lister, A.M., Mazza, P.P.A.,

962 Spassov, N., Titov, V.V., 2011. Western Palaearctic palaeoenvironmental conditions during

963 the Early and early Middle Pleistocene inferred from large mammal communities, and

964 implications for hominin dispersal in Europe. Quaternary Science Reviews 30, 1368-1395.

965 DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2010.07.020

966

967 Kaiser, T.M., 2003. The dietary regimes of two contemporaneous populations of

968 Hippotherium primigenium (Perissodactyla, Equidae) from the Vallesian (Upper Miocene) of

969 Southern Germany. Palaeogeography, palaeoclimatology, palaeoecology 1998, 381-402. DOI:

970 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0031-0182(03)00480-2

971

972 Kaiser, T.M., Kahlke, R.-D., 2005. The highly flexible feeding strategy of Stephanorhinus

973 etruscus (Falconer, 1859) (Rhinocerotidae, Mammalia) during the early Middle Pleistocene in

974 Central Europe. Berichte des Institutes für Erdwissenschaften Karl-Franzens-Universität Graz

975 10, 50-53.

976

977 Kaiser, T.M., Solounias, N., 2003. Extending the tooth mesowear method to extinct and

978 extant equids. Geodiversitas 25, 321-345.

979

980   Kaiser, T.M., Müller, D.W.H., Fortelius, M., Schulz, E., Codron, D., Clauss, M., 2013.

981   Hypsodonty and tooth facet development in relation to diet and habitat in herbivorous

982   ungulates: implications for understanding tooth wear. Mammal Review 43, 34-46. DOI:

983   http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2907.2011.00203.x

984

985   Kaspar, F., Cubasch, U., 2007. Simulations of the Eemian Interglacial and the Subsequent

986   Glacial Inception with a Coupled Ocean-Atmosphere General Circulation Model, in: Sirocko,

987   F., Claussen, M., Sánchez Goñi, M.F., Litt, T. (Eds.), The Climate of Past Interglacials.

988   Developments in Quaternary Science 7, pp. 499-515.

989

990   Katzschmann.   L.,   2007:   Ehringsdorf-Formation.   In: LithoLex.

991   http://www.bgr.de/app/litholex/gesamt_ausgabe_neu.php?id=1000002,   Last   updated

992   30.11.2007 (http://www.bgr.bund.de/litholex).

993

994   Kostopoulos, D.S., Karakütük, S., in press. Late Miocene bovids from Şerefköy-2, SW

995   Turkey, and their position within the sub-Paratethyan biogeographic province. Acta

996   palaeontologica Polonica. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.4202/app.20120129

997

998   Lacombat, F., 2005. Les rhinocéros fossiles des sites préhistoriques de l'Europe

999   méditerranéenne et du Massif Central. Paléontologie et implications biochronologiques. BAR

1000 International Series 1419: 1-175.

1001

1002 Lacombat, F., 2006. Pleistocene Rhinoceroses in Mediterranean Europe and in Massif Central

1003 (France), in: Kahlke, R.-D., Maul, L.C., Mazza, P. (Eds.), Late Neogene and Quaternary

1004 Biodiversity and Evolution: Regional Developments and Interregional Correlations.

1005 Proceedings of the 18th International Senckenberg Conference (VI International

1006 Palaeontological Colloquium in Weimar). Volume I. Courier Forschungsinstitut Senckenberg

1007 256, pp. 57-69.

1008

1009 Lacombat, F., 2009. Biochronologie et grands mammifères au Pléistocène moyen et supérieur

1010 en Europe Occidentale: L'apport des Rhinocerotidae (Genre Stephanorhinus). Quaternaire 20,

1011 429-435.

1012

1013 Li, Z., Jiang, Z., Li, C., 2008. Dietary overlap of Przewalski's gazelle, Tibetan gazelle, and

1014 Tibetan sheep on the Qinghai-Tibet plateau. Journal of Wildlife Management 72, 944-948.

1015 DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.2193/2007-233

1016

1017 Lisiecki, L.E., Raymo, M.E., 2005. A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally distributed

1018 benthic $\delta^{18}O$ records. Paleoceanography 20, PA1003, DOI:

1019 http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2004PA001071

1020

1021 Lister, A.M., 2004. The impact of Quaternary Ice Ages on mammalian evolution.

1022 Philosophical Transactions of the Royal Society B 359, 221-241. DOI:

1023 http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rstb.2003.1436

1024

1025 Loffredo, L.F., DeSantis, L.R.G., 2014. Cautionary lessons from assessing dental mesowear

1026 observer variability and integrating palaeoecological proxies of an extreme generalist

1027 Cormohipparion emsliei. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology 395, 42-52.

1028 DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2013.12.020

1029

1030 Loose, H., 1975. Pleistocene Rhinocerotidae of W. Europe with reference to the recent two-

1031 horned species of Africa and S.E. Asia. Scripta Geologica 33, 1-59.

1032

1033 Lord, T.C., O'Connor, T.P., Siebrandt, D.C., Jacobi, R.M., 2007: People and large carnivores

1034 as biostratinomic agents in Lateglacial cave assemblages. Journal of Quaternary Science 22,

1035 681-694. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1002/jqs.1101

1036

1037 Louys, J., Ditchfield, P., Meloro, C., Elton, S., Bishop, L.C., 2012. Stable isotopes provide

1038 independent support for the use of mesowear variables for inferring diets in African antelopes.

1039 Proceedings   of   the   Royal   Society   B   279,   4441-4446.   DOI:

1040 http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rspb.2012.1473

1041

1042 Lundberg, J., Lord, T.C., Murphy, P.J., 2010. Thermal ionization mass spectrometer U-Th

1043 dates on Pleistocene speleothems from Victoria Cave, North Yorkshire, UK: Implications for

1044 palaeoenvironment and stratigraphy over multiple glacial cycles. Geosphere 6, 379-395. DOI:

1045 http://dx.doi.org/10.1130/GES00540.1

1046

1047 MacFadden, B.J., 1989. Dental character variation in paleopopulations and morphospecies of

1048 fossil horses and extant analogs, in: Prothero, D.R., Schoch, R.M. (Eds.), The Evolution of

1049 Perissodactyls. Oxford University Press, New York, pp. 128-141.

1050

1051 Mania, D., 1991. Zur Paläontologie der mittelpleistozänen Travertine von Bilzingsleben, in:

1052 Fischer, K., Guenther, E.W., Heinrich, W.-D., Mania, D., Musil, R., Nötzold, T.,

1053 Bilzingsleben IV. Homo erectus – seine Kultur und seine Umwelt. Veröffentlichungen des

1054 Landemuseums für Vorgeschichte in Halle 44, pp. 9-28.

1055

1056 Mania, D., 1997. Das Quartär des Saalegebietes und des Harzvorlandes unter besonderer

1057 Berücksichtigung der Travertine von Bilzingsleben – Ein Beitrag zur zyklischen Gliederung

1058   des eurasischen Quartärs, in: Mania, D., Mania, U., Heinrich, W.-D., Fischer, K., Böhme, G.,

1059   Turner, A., Erd, K., Mai, D.H., Bilzingsleben V. Homo erectus - seine Kultur und Umwelt.

1060   Zum Lebensbild des Urmenschen. Verlag Ausbildung + Wissen, Bad Homburg, Leipzig, pp.

1061   23-103.

1062

1063   Mania, D., 2006. Stratigraphie, Klima- und Umweltentwicklung der letzten 400 000 Jahre im

1064   Saalegebiet und Harzvorland (Forschungsstand 2006). Hercynia, Neue Folge 39, 155-194.

1065

1066   Mazza. P., 1988. The Tuscan Early Pleistocene rhinoceros Dicerorhinus etruscus.

1067   Paleontographica Italica 75, 1-87.

1068

1069   Mazza, P., 1993. Ethological inferences on Pleistocene rhinoceroses of Europe. Rendiconti

1070   Lincei, Classe di Scienze Fisiche, Matematiche e Naturali, Accademia Nazionale 9, 127-137.

1071   DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/BF03001424

1072

1073   McFarlane, D.A., Ford, D.C., 1998. The age of the Kirkdale Cave palaeofauna. Cave and

1074   Karst Science 25, 3-6.

1075

1076   Merceron, G., Blondel, C., Brunet, M., Sen, S., Solounias, N., Viriot, L., Heintz, E., 2004.

1077   The Late Miocene paleoenvironnment of Afghanistan as inferred from dental microwear in

1078   artiodactyls. Palaeogeography, palaeoclimatology, palaeoecology 207, 143-163. DOI:

1079   http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2004.02.008

1080

1081   Merceron, G., Zazzo, A., Spassov, N., Geraads, D., Kovachev, D., 2006. Bovid paleoecology

1082   and paleoenvironments from the Late Miocene of Bulgaria: Evidence from dental microwear

1083   and stable isotopes. Palaeogeography, palaeoclimatology, palaeoecology 241, 637-654. DOI:

1084   http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2006.05.005

1085

1086   Mihlbachler, M.C., 2007. Sexual dimorphism and mortality bias in a small Miocene North

1087   American rhino, Menoceras arikarense: insights into the coevolution of sexual dimorphism

1088   and sociality in rhinos. Journal of Mammalian Evolution 14, 217-238. DOI:

1089   http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10914-007-9048-4

1090

1091   Moigne, A.-M., Palombo, M.-R., Belda, V., Heriech-Briki, D., Kacimi, S., Lacombat, F.,

1092   Lumley, M.-A. de, Moutoussamy, J., Rivals, F., Quilès, J., Testu, A., 2006. Les faunes de

1093   grands mammifères de la Caune de l'Arago (Tautavel) dans le cadre biochronologique des

1094   faunes du Pléistocène moyen italien. L'Anthropologie 110, 788-831. DOI:

1095   http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.anthro.2006.10.011

1096

1097   Nitychoruk, J., Bińka, K., Ruppert, H., Schneider, J., 2006. Holsteinian Interglacial = Marine

1098   Isotope Stage 11? Quaternary Science Reviews 25, 2678-2681. DOI:

1099   http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2006.07.004

1100

1101   Owen-Smith, R.N., 1988. Megaherbivores, The Influence of very large Body Size on

1102   Ecology. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

1103

1104   Parfitt, S.A., 1998. Pleistocene vertebrate faunas of the West Sussex coastal plain: their

1105   stratigraphic and palaeoenvironmental significance, in: Murton, J.B., C.A. Whiteman, M.R.

1106   Bates, D.R. Bridgland, A.J. Long, M.B. Roberts & M.P. Walker (Eds.), The Quaternary of

1107   Kent and Sussex, Field guide. Quaternary Research Association, London, pp. 121-135.

1108

1109   Penkman, K., Collins, M., Keen, D., Preece, R., 2008. British Aggregates: An Improved

1110   Chronology of using Amino Acid Racemisation and Degradation of Intracrystalline Amino

1111   Acids. English Heritage research department report series 6/2008.

1112

1113   Petit, J.R., Jouzel, J., Raynaud, D., Barkov, N.I., Barnola, J.-M., Basile, I., Benders, M.,

1114   Chappellaz, J., Davis, M., Delaygue, G., Delmotte, M., Kotlyakov, V.M., Legrand, M.,

1115   Lipenkov, V.Y., Lorius, C., Pépin, L., Ritz, C., Saltzman, E., Stievenard, M., 1999. Climate

1116   and atmospheric history of the past 420,000 years from the Vostok ice core, Antarctica.

1117   Nature 399, 429-436. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1038/20859

1118

1119   Rachlow, J.L., Berger, J., 1997. Conservation implications of patterns of horn regeneration in

1120   dehorned   white   rhinos.   Conservation   Biology   11,   84-91.   DOI:

1121   http://dx.doi.org/10.1046/j.1523-1739.1997.95523.x

1122

1123   Raymo, M.E., Nisancioglu, K., 2003. The 41 kyr world: Milankovitch's other unsolved

1124   mystery. Paleoceanography 18, 1011. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2002PA000791.

1125

1126   Rivals, F., Solounias, N., 2007. Differences in tooth microwear of populations of caribou

1127   (Rangifer tarandus, Ruminantia, Mammalia) and implications to ecology, migration,

1128   glaciations and dental evolution. Journal of mammalian evolution 14, 182-192. DOI:

1129   http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10914-007-9044-8

1130

1131   Rivals, F., Mihlbachler, M.C., Solounias, N., 2007. Effect of ontogenetic-age distribution in

1132   fossil and modern samples on the interpretation of ungulate paleodiets using the mesowear

1133   method.   Journal   of   Vertebrate   Paleontology   27,   763-767.   DOI:

1134   http://dx.doi.org/10.1671/0272-4634(2007)27[763:EOODIF]2.0.CO;2

1135

1136 Rivals, F., Moncel, M.-H., Patou-Mathis, M., 2009. Seasonality and intra-site variation of

1137 Neanderthal occupations in the Middle Palaeolithic locality of Payre (Ardèche, France) using

1138 dental wear analyses. Journal of Archaeological Science 36, 1070-1078. DOI:

1139 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.jas.2008.12.009

1140

1141 Rivals, F., Mihlbachler, M.C., Solounias, N., Mol, D., Semprebon, G.M., De Vos, J.,

1142 Kalthoff, D.C., 2010. Palaeoecology of the Mammoth Steppe fauna from the late Pleistocene

1143 of the North Sea and Alaska: Separating species preferences from geographic influence in

1144 paleoecological dental wear analysis. Palaeogeography, palaeoclimatology, palaeoecology

1145 286, 42-54. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.palaeo.2009.12.002

1146
1147 Rivals, F., Semprebon, G., Lister, A., 2012. An examination of dietary diversity patterns in

1148 Pleistocene proboscideans (Mammuthus, Palaeoloxodon, and Mammut from Europe and

1149 North America as revealed by dental microwear. Quaternary international 255, 188-195.

1150

1151 Ruddiman, W.F., McIntyre, A., 1982. Severity and speed of Northern Hemisphere glaciation

1152 pulses: The limiting case? Geological Society of America Bulletin 93, 1273-1279. DOI:

1153 http://dx.doi.org/10.1130/0016-7606(1982)93<1273:SASONH>2.0.CO;2

1154

1155 Sánchez, A., Fraile, S., van der Made, J., Morales, J., Quiralte, V., Salesa, M.J., Sánchez,

1156 I.M., Sanchiz, B., Soria, D., Jiménez, J., Barbadillo, L.J., Laplana, C., Szyndlar, Z., 2005.

1157 Primeros datos faunísticos del Neolítico madrileño: la cueva de la Ventana (Torrelaguna,

1158 Madrid), in: Arias Cabal, P., Ontañón Peredo, R., C. García-Moncó Piñeiro, C. (Eds.), III

1159 Congreso del Neolítico en la Península Ibérica. Monografias del Instituto Internacional de

1160 Investigaciones Prehistóricas de Cantabria, 1, pp. 155-165.

1161

1162   Schreiber, H.D., 2005. Osteological investigations on skeleton material of rhinoceroses

1163   (Rhinocerotidae, Mammalia) from the early Middle Pleistocene locality of Mauer near

1164   Heidelberg (SW-Germany). Quaternaire, hors-série 2, 103-111.

1165

1166   Schreve, D.C., 1997. Mammalian biostratigraphy of the later Middle Pleistocene in Britain.

1167   Unpublished PhD thesis.

1168

1169   Schreve, D.C., 2001a. Mammalian evidence from Middle Pleistocene fluvial sequences for

1170   complex environmental change at the oxygen isotope substage level. Quaternary International

1171   79, 65-74. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S1040-6182(00)00123-3

1172

1173   Schreve, D.C., 2001b. Differentiation of the British late Middle Pleistocene interglacials: the

1174   evidence from mammalian biostratigraphy. Quaternary Science Reviews 20, 1693-1705. DOI:

1175   http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/S0277-3791(01)00033-6

1176

1177   Schreve, D.C., 2004. The mammalian fauna of the penultimate (MIS 7) interglacial in the

1178   Lower Thames valley, in: Schreve, D.C. (Ed.), The Quaternary Mammals of southern and

1179   eastern England, Field guide. Quaternary Research Association, London, pp. 69-79.

1180

1181   Schreve, D.C., Bridgland, D.R., 2002. Correlation of English and German Middle Pleistocene

1182   fluvial sequences based on mammalian biostratigraphy. Geologie en Mijnbouw, Netherlands

1183   Journal of Geosciences 81, 357-373.

1184

1185   Schreve, D.C., Harding, P., White, M.J., Bridgland, D.R., Allen, P., Clayton, F., Keen, D.H.,

1186   Penkman, K.E.H., 2006. A Levallois knapping site at West Thurrock, Lower Thames, UK: its

1187   Quaternary context, environment and age. Proceedings of the Prehistoric Society 72, 21-52.

1188   DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0079497X00000773

1189

1190   Scott, B., 2009. The Crayford brickearths project. Quaternary Newsletter 117, 44-48.

1191

1192   Sokolov, V.E., Zhirnov, L.V. (Eds.), 1998. Sajgak. Filogeniya, sistematika, ekologiya,

1193   okhrana, ispol'zovaniye. Rossijskaya Akademiya nauk, Moskva. (in Russian)

1194

1195   Solounias, N., Hayek, L.-A.C., 1993. New methods of tooth microwear analysis and

1196   application to dietary determination of two extinct antelopes. Journal of zoology 229, 421-

1197   445. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-7998.1993.tb02646.x

1198

1199   Sparks, B.W., 1952. Notes on some Pleistocene sections at Barrington, Cambridgeshire.

1200   Geological Magazine 89, 163-174. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1017/S0016756800067571

1201

1202   Staesche, K., 1941. Nashörner der Gattung Dicerorhinus aus dem Diluvium Württembergs.

1203   Abhandlungen der Reichsstelle für Bodenforschung, Neue Folge 200, 1-148 + pls. 1-14.

1204

1205   Steuer, P., Clauss, M., Südekum, K.-H., Hatt, J.-M., Silinski, S., Klomburg, S., Zimmermann,

1206   W., Fickel, J., Streich, W.J., Hummel, J., 2010. Comparative investigations on digestion in

1207   grazing (Ceratotherium simum) and browsing (Diceros bicornis) rhinoceroses. Comparative

1208   Biochemistry and Physiology, Part A: Molecular and Integrative Physiology 156, 380-388.

1209   DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.cbpa.2010.03.006

1210

1211   Stuart, A.J., Lister, A.M., 2007. Patterns of Late Quaternary megafaunal extinctions in Europe

1212   and northern Asia, in: Kahlke, R.-D., Maul, L.C., Mazza, P. (Eds.), Late Neogene and

1213　Quaternary Biodiversity and Evolution: Regional Developments and Interregional

1214　Correlations. Volume II. Proceedings of the 18th International Senckenberg Conference (VI

1215　International Palaeontological Colloquium in Weimar). Courier Forschungsinstitut

1216　Senckenberg 259, pp. 287-297.

1217

1218　Sutcliffe, A.J., 1960. Joint Mitnor Cave, Buckfastleigh, A report on excavations carried out

1219　during 1939-41 by the late A.H. Ogilvie. Transactions of the Torquay Natural History Society

1220　13, Part I, 1-28.

1221

1222　Sutcliffe, A.J., Zeuner, F.E., 1962. Excavations in the Torbryan Caves, Devonshire, I.

1223　Tornewton Cave. Proceedings of the Devon Archaeological Exploration Society 1957/58,

1224　127-145.

1225

1226　Taylor, L.A., Kaiser, T.M., Schwitzer, C., Müller, D.W.H., Codron, D., Clauss, M., Schulz,

1227　E., 2013. Detecting inter-cusp and inter-tooth wear patterns in rhinocerotids. PLoS ONE 8,

1228　e80921. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0080921

1229

1230　Tütken, T., Kaiser, T.M., Vennemann, T., Merceron, G., 2013. Opportunistic feeding strategy

1231　for the earliest Old World hypsodont equids: evidence from stable isotope and dental wear

1232　proxies. PLoS One 8, e74463. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0074463.

1233

1234　Van der Made, J., 2000. A preliminary note on the rhinos from Bilzingsleben. Praehistoria

1235　Thuringica 4, 41-64.

1236

1237 Van der Made, J., 2010. The rhinos from the Middle Pleistocene of Neumark-Nord (Saxony-

1238 Anhalt). Veröffentlichungen des Landesamtes für Denkmalpflege und Archäologie 62, 433-

1239 500.

1240

1241 Van Meerbeeck, C.J., Renssen, H., Roche, D.M. , Wohlfarth, B, Bohncke, S.J.P., Bos, J.A.A.,

1242 Engels, S., Helmens, K.F., Sánchez-Goñi, M.F., Svensson, A., Vandenberghe, J., 2011. The

1243 nature of MIS 3 stadial-interstadial transitions in Europe: new insights from model-data

1244 comparisons. Quaternary Science Reviews 30, 3618-3637. DOI:

1245 http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2011.08.002

1246

1247 Vent, W., 1974. Die Flora der Ilmtaltravertine von Weimar-Ehringsdorf, in: Kahlke, H.-D.

1248 (Ed.), Das Pleistozän von Weimar-Ehringsdorf. Teil I. Abhandlungen des Zentralen

1249 Geologischen Instituts, Paläontologische Abhandlungen 21, pp. 259-321.

1250

1251 West, R.G., Sparks, B.W., Sutcliffe, A.T., 1960. Coastal interglacial deposits of the English

1252 Channel. Philosophical transactions of the Royal Society of London, Series B, Biological

1253 Sciences 243, 95-133. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rstb.1960.0006

1254

1255 West, R.G., Lambert, C.A., Sparks, B.W., 1964. Interglacial deposits at Ilford, Essex.

1256 Philosophical transactions of the Royal Society of London, Series B, Biological Sciences 247,

1257 185-212. DOI: http://dx.doi.org/10.1098/rstb.1964.0002

1258

1259 Williams, S.H., Kay, R.F., 2001. A comparative test of adaptive explanations for hypsodonty

1260 in ungulates and rodents. Journal of Mammalian Evolution 8, 207-229. DOI:

1261 http://dx.doi.org/10.1023/A:1012231829141

1262

1263   Yablokov, A.V., 1974. Variability of Mammals. Amerind: New Delhi.

1264

1265   Zeuner, F., 1934. Die Beziehungen zwischen Schädelform und Lebensweise bei den rezenten

1266   und fossilen Nashörnern. Berichte der Naturforschenden Gesellschaft zu Freiburg i. Br. 34,

1267   21-80.