

# LJMU Research Online

Shanbara, HK, Ruddock, F and Atherton, W

A viscoplastic model for permanent deformation prediction of reinforced cold mix asphalt

http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/id/eprint/9084/

Article

**Citation** (please note it is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from this work)

Shanbara, HK, Ruddock, F and Atherton, W (2018) A viscoplastic model for permanent deformation prediction of reinforced cold mix asphalt. Construction and Building Materials, 186. pp. 287-302. ISSN 0950-0618

LJMU has developed LJMU Research Online for users to access the research output of the University more effectively. Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Users may download and/or print one copy of any article(s) in LJMU Research Online to facilitate their private study or for non-commercial research. You may not engage in further distribution of the material or use it for any profit-making activities or any commercial gain.

The version presented here may differ from the published version or from the version of the record. Please see the repository URL above for details on accessing the published version and note that access may require a subscription.

For more information please contact <a href="mailto:researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk">researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk</a>

http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/

 1
 A viscoplastic model for permanent deformation prediction of

 2
 reinforced cold mix asphalt

# 3 Hayder Kamil Shanbara<sup>a,c,\*</sup>, Felicite Ruddock<sup>b</sup> and William Atherton<sup>b</sup>

- <sup>4</sup> <sup>a</sup> Department of Civil Engineering, Faculty of Engineering and Technology, Liverpool John Moores University,
- 5 Henry Cotton Building, Liverpool L3 2ET, UK
- <sup>b</sup> Department of Civil Engineering, Faculty of Engineering and Technology, Liverpool John Moores University,
- 7 Peter Jost Centre, Liverpool L3 3AF, UK
- 8 <sup>c</sup> Civil Engineering Department, College of Engineering, Al Muthanna University, Sammawa, Iraq
- 9 \*Corresponding author
- 10 E-mail address: <u>H.K.Shanbara@2014.ljmu.ac.uk</u>, <u>hayder.shanbara82@gmail.com</u>
- 11 Declarations of interest: none

#### 12 Abstract

A reliable viscoplastic model of natural and synthetic fibres reinforced cold bitumen emulsion 13 14 mixture is developed and applied to characterize the rutting behaviour of asphalt pavement by 15 using finite element analysis. It is indicated that the traffic load parameters such as temperature, 16 static loading condition and vehicular speed not only affects the rutting depth, it accelerates the rutting rate, causing the pavement earlier enter into rutting failure with shortened service life. 17 18 Several finite element models (FEM) have been developed to simulate the behaviour of hot 19 mix asphalts (HMAs), but none exists for cold mix asphalt (CMA) reinforced by natural and 20 synthetic fibres. This research presents the first three dimension (3-D), finite element model 21 (FEM) to assess the viscoplastic behaviour of reinforced CMA mixtures. The model is also 22 able to predict rutting (permanent deformation) of asphalt mixtures under different traffic and 23 environmental loadings, traditional HMA used as a comparison. The enhancement of the 24 performance of CMA mixtures against permanent deformation using finite element software 25 (ABAQUS) was validated by comparing the models' predictions with measurements from 26 wheel-tracking tests at different temperatures (45°C and 60°C). A very good level of agreement was found between the rutting predicted by the model and the experimental test. The results show that the finite element model can successfully predict rutting of flexible pavements under different temperatures and wheel loading conditions. Finally, the natural and synthetic fibres reinforced CMA mixtures are much more effective at resisting permanent deformation damage than conventional cold and hot asphalt mixtures.

Keywords: ABAQUS; cold mix asphalt; finite element model; natural fibre; rutting; syntheticfibre.

# 34 **1. Introduction**

35 Asphalt or bitumen are widely used in flexible pavements as aggregate binders because of their 36 high adhesion properties. Flexible pavements are subject to cyclic and sometimes excessive 37 loads during their service life [1, 2]. Their surface is also temperature sensitive in terms of high 38 temperature permanent deformation and low temperature cracking [3, 4]. Permanent 39 deformation (rutting) development is one of the major distresses that frequently occurs in 40 flexible pavements due to the non-linear, viscous and plastic behaviours of asphalt mixes [5]. 41 Permanent deformation can be defined as the unrecoverable vertical deformation of pavements 42 under a vehicle wheel path caused by high temperatures and load repetition. Such deformation 43 can be limited to the asphalt surface layers comprising the viscoelastic and viscoplastic 44 properties of asphalt and the plastic characteristics of aggregates [6].

Hot mix asphalt (HMA) is the main source of flexible pavements used in 95% of the world's paved roads [7]. However, this mixture is considered environmentally unfriendly because it needs substantial amounts of energy to heat the aggregate and asphalt producing CO<sub>2</sub> emissions during both production and laying [8, 9]. Nowadays, several flexible pavement design technologies have been invented to eliminate, or reduce, emissions and save energy regarding asphalt paving production [10]. Cold mix asphalt (CMA) is one of these technologies. CMA is defined as a bituminous mixture of aggregates and asphalt emulsion, mixed at ambient temperature which does not require the same amount of energy to produce the same CO<sub>2</sub> emissions as HMA [11]. However, it has been considered an inferior mix compared to HMA, mainly in terms of its mechanical properties, the extended curing period required to achieve an optimal performance and its weak early life strength [12]. Poor asphalt mix quality and inadequate design may result in an inefficiently designed layer.

57 Some strengthening techniques have been trialed in flexible pavements. The reinforcement of 58 asphalt pavements is one method to improve the performance when pavements do not meet 59 traffic, climate and pavement structural requirements. Fibre reinforcement improves the life of 60 a pavement by increasing resistance to permanent deformation and cracking [13]. The addition 61 of fibres to hot and cold mixes as a reinforcing material, enhances the strength, bonding and 62 durability of such mixes [14]. The modification of asphalt mixtures with additives has also 63 been found to decrease permanent deformation and increase durability [15-18]. Modification 64 of asphalt has gained the attention because of its better performance and considered a more economical option compared with neat asphalt binder based on life cycle cost [19]. 65

66 Flexible pavement responses to traffic loadings are mainly affected by the properties of the 67 materials [20]. A variety of three-dimensional (3-D), finite element simulations have been 68 developed to analyse the responses of flexible pavements [21-26]. The strain experienced by 69 asphalt mixtures under wheel loads has recoverable components (elastic and viscoelastic) and 70 irrecoverable components (plastic and viscoplastic) [27]. Elastic and viscoelastic responses 71 are seen at low traffic volume and low temperatures, while plastic and viscoplastic responses 72 at high traffic volume and high temperatures. Selecting an appropriate constitutive law that 73 takes into account asphalt mixtures' creep behaviour and calibration its parameters using creep 74 testing is important to simulate permanent deformation of flexible pavements by finite element modelling [6]. Picoux, et al. [28] simulated the distribution of vertical deformation to a flexible 75 76 pavement, subjected to different wheel loadings based on viscoelastic deformation theory.

77 Dave, et al. [29] developed viscoelastic models to analyse the response of asphalt overlay using 78 thermomechanical impact under different combinations of loading time and temperature. Kai 79 and Fang [30] conducted a 3-D, finite element model of asphalt pavements based on the elastic 80 half-space theory, again examining the effect of load and temperature. Xue, et al. [31] 81 developed a dynamic model to describe the settlement of the surface of asphalt pavements 82 under different temperatures. Pérez, et al. [32] simulated a nonlinear, elasto-plastic Mohr-83 Coulomb numerical model for recycled flexible pavements, to determine the response of these 84 pavements under two different loads and four types of soil subgrade. Gu, et al. [33] evaluated 85 the effect of geogrid-reinforced flexible pavements by developing two pairs of geogrid-86 reinforced and unreinforced pavement models. Finite element modeling revealed that rutting 87 resistance is better in the geogrid-reinforced pavement in comparison to the unreinforced 88 pavement.

89 This research focuses on the evaluation of the response of natural and synthetic fibre reinforced 90 CMA to permanent deformation, using 3-D finite element modelling and experimental tests. 91 The main objectives are to identify the most accurate and effective approach to describe fibre 92 reinforced CMA mixtures using finite element modelling. A 3-D, finite element model is 93 developed and included attention to viscoplastic material behaviours to precisely predict the 94 behaviour of natural and synthetic fibres reinforcement on the development of permanent 95 deformation resistance. Finally, the predicted results from the model are compared with those 96 measured in the lab to identify and verify the applicability of the developed model.

# 97 2. Methodology

98 Firstly, all produced specimens in this research were designed and prepared according to the 99 method that adopted by the Asphalt Institute (Marshall Method for Emulsified Asphalt 100 Aggregate Cold Mixture Design (MS-14)) [34]. After optimizing the emulsion, the length of 101 the fibres and fibre content were determined. Different laboratory tests were used on the reinforced and unreinforced CMA mixtures to calibrate the parameters of creep power law and to determine the elastic modulus. These tests included the indirect tensile stiffness modulus test and the creep test. A wheel tracking test was also performed to measure the permanent deformation of the mixtures.

A 3-D, finite element model was then developed in ABAQUS with the required test properties.
A comparison between measured and predicted results was then carried out to validate the
efficiency of the developed model.

# 109 **3. Viscoplastic behaviour of flexible pavements**

110 Contemporary flexible pavement designs assume that the pavements' response to traffic and 111 environmental stressors is elastic. However, the validity of this assumption is limited to low 112 temperature climate conditions and under rapidly applied vehicle loadings where the 113 deformation to asphalt surfaces is not permanent, returning back to its original shape when the 114 load is removed. At high temperatures, or under slow moving loads, flexible pavements are 115 subject to the type of plastic deformation, which is associated with viscous behaviour. This is 116 the main reason for the development of a new model; to simulate the mechanical response of 117 the new, reinforced, cold mix asphalt and hot mix asphalt. This model is characterized by the 118 elasticity required to simulate the immediate response of the pavement, viscosity to simulate 119 the pavements mechanical response dependent on the strain rate in terms of loading time, and 120 plasticity to simulate plastic flow in terms of permanent deformation.

121 The viscoplastic deformation of flexible pavements generally depends on the stress level,
122 loading time, number of cycles and temperature. The constitutive law for flexible pavements
123 can be stated as [35]:

$$\varepsilon_{ij} = (\sigma_{ij}, t, N, T) \tag{1}$$

124 where:

125  $\varepsilon_{ij}$  and  $\sigma_{ij}$  are the strain and stress components, respectively

126 *t*: time

127 *N*: loading cycles number

128 *T*: temperature

The creep test is used in this research to characterize the viscoplastic behaviour of both the cold and hot asphalt mixes. Four different types of strain develop in flexible pavements when a vehicle moves on the top of them: elastic recoverable strain ( $\varepsilon_e$ ) which is time independent; plastic irrecoverable strain ( $\varepsilon_p$ ) which is time independent; viscoelastic recoverable strain ( $\varepsilon_{ve}$ ) which is time dependent, and viscoplastic irrecoverable strain ( $\varepsilon_{vp}$ ) which is time dependent [36, 37]. The total strain ( $\varepsilon_t$ ) can be expressed as [35]:

$$\varepsilon_t(\sigma, t, N) = \varepsilon_e(\sigma) + \varepsilon_p(\sigma, N) + \varepsilon_{ve}(\sigma, t) + \varepsilon_{vp}(\sigma, t, N)$$
(2)

135 Responses to the above strains can be calculated from the creep test. After applying the load, 136 an instantaneous asphalt mixture response occurs comprising the elastic ( $\varepsilon_e$ ) and plastic ( $\varepsilon_p$ )

137

138

strains of the total strain, as shown in



Figure 1. The elastic strain ( $\varepsilon_e$ ) is the instantaneous reduction at the moment of unloading. The plastic strain ( $\varepsilon_p$ ) can be calculated by subtracting the elastic strain ( $\varepsilon_e$ ) from the instantaneous loading strain ( $\varepsilon_e + \varepsilon_p$ ). The instantaneous loading strain determined from creep curve (for

example Figure 1) when the time is zero. From such creep curves, when the time is just passed zero, the nonlinear part of the curve is started and this point is identified as the cutoff point between the linear and nonlinear parts of creep curves. Both viscoelastic ( $\varepsilon_{ve}$ ) and viscoplastic ( $\varepsilon_{vp}$ ) strains are time dependent, occurring and overlapping during the loading time stage ( $\varepsilon_{ve}$  +

in



Figure 1. Viscoelastic strain ( $\varepsilon_{ve}$ ) is the delayed response during the unloading stage and can be determined as the following:

- 150 1. The total strain at time 3600s is  $(\varepsilon_e + \varepsilon_p + \varepsilon_{ve} + \varepsilon_{vp})$  as can be determined from the creep 151 curve.
- 152 2. After the unloading period (3600s) the permanent strain is  $(\varepsilon_p + \varepsilon_{vp})$  as can be 153 determined from creep curve when the time is 7200s.
- 154 3. After subtracting the permanent strain from the total strain, elastic ( $\varepsilon_e$ ) and viscoelastic 155 ( $\varepsilon_{ve}$ ) can be determined ( $\varepsilon_e + \varepsilon_{ve}$ ).
- The instantaneous recovery strain after removing loads (at time 3600s) is the elastic
   strain (ε<sub>e</sub>) which can be determined from the creep curve.

158 5. By subtracting the elastic strain ( $\varepsilon_e$ ) from the strain that determined in step (3), the 159 viscoelastic strain ( $\varepsilon_{ve}$ ) can be determined.

160 The viscoplastic strain ( $\varepsilon_{vp}$ ) can be determined by subtracting the elastic, plastic and 161 viscoelastic strains from the total strain as shown below:

$$\varepsilon_{vp} = \varepsilon_t - \varepsilon_e - \varepsilon_p - \varepsilon_{ve} \tag{3}$$

As the determined strains in the above are only for one cycle, that means the permanent deformation can be determined. After several cycles, the accumulative permanent deformation can be determined according to how many cycles are applied.







Figure 2 illustrates the plastic and viscoplastic strains in the cold mix asphalt at 45°C. From this Figure, it can be seen that the cumulative viscoplastic strain curve increases with a constant steep slope, specifically after 1000 seconds, while the plastic strain curve flattens horizontally with a constant value, as it is a time independent component. This indicates that the irrecoverable deformation of asphalt mixtures in the creep test, mainly depends on the viscoplastic strain component; plastic strain can be considered insignificant if loading occurs over a long time. This confirms the observations by Huang [38].





175 Figure 2. Plastic and viscoplastic strains in the CMA at 100 kPa and 45°C

A viscoplastic model of time-hardening is available in ABAQUS, using the creep power law
to represent the nonlinear behaviour of asphalt mixtures. Equation 4 is expressed in a power
law form and used to define the creep model [39]:

$$\varepsilon_{vn} = A\sigma^n t^m \tag{4}$$

where *A*, *n* and *m* are the creep power law parameters that relate to the material properties. These parameters depend on bitumen viscosity, aggregate maximum size and aggregate angularity [6]. In this research, the values of the parameters for the conventional CMA and HMA, and the reinforced CMA mixtures were determined according to the results obtained from the creep test. It should be noted that if the creep power law is used to model the timerelated behaviour of materials, repeated and continuous loadings result in the same estimation of creep strain on the condition that the total loading periods are the same [6].

#### 186 **4.** Methods and experimental procedures

187 4.1 Materials

# 188 4.1.1 Virgin aggregate

The aggregate used in this research for producing asphalt concrete (AC) was crushed granite, which was obtained from Bardon Quarry, Leicestershire, UK. This aggregate was graded using asphalt concrete 14 mm, a close graded surface course in accordance with BS EN 933-1 [40], as presented in Table 1. Based on this, the selected aggregate is one of the most common aggregates used in the production of asphalt, considered hard, durable and clean, of a suitable shape, providing a good level of skid resistance and resistant to permanent deformation. This grade was selected to ensure an appropriate interlock between the particles in the mixtures.

Table 1. Selected mix gradation

Sieve size (mm)	14	10	6.3	2	1	0.063	
Passing (%)	100	80	55	28	20	6	

#### 197 *4.1.2 Bitumen emulsion*

196

198 A commercial cationic slow setting bituminous emulsion (C50B3) with 50% bitumen content 199 was used as a binding agent for manufacturing the CMA mixtures to ensure high adhesion 200 between aggregate particles. This type of emulsion is called Cold Asphalt Binder (CAB 50) 201 based on 40/60 penetration grade base bitumen and is supplied by Jobling Purser, Newcastle, 202 UK. The high stability and high adhesion of this cationic emulsion were the reasons for 203 selection as recommended by the supplier. The relevant properties of the selected bitumen 204 emulsion are shown in Table 2. The bitumen emulsion was kept in air-tight sealed containers 205 stored at room temperature. The bitumen emulsions were stirred well into a homogenous state 206 before using in producing the CMA mixtures.

Property	Value	Standard
Туре	Cationic	
Appearance	Black to dark brown liquid	
Breaking behaviour	110-195	EN 13075-1
Base bitumen Penetration (0.1 mm)	50	EN 1426
Softening Point (°C)	50	EN 1427
Bitumen content, (%)	50	EN 1428
Viscosity (2mm at 40°C)	15-70	EN 12846
PH	5	
Boiling point, (°C)	100	
Adhesiveness	$\geq 90\%$	EN13614
Relative density at 15 °C, (g/ml)	1.05	
Particle surface electric charge	positive	EN 1430
Density (g/cm <sup>3</sup> )	1.016	

Table 2. Properties of C50B3 bitumen emulsion

# 208 *4.1.3 Bitumen*

207

A traditional binder, consisting of 100/150 penetration grade bitumen supplied by Jobling Purser, Newcastle, UK, was used for the conventional HMA mixture production. This grade of bitumen was selected because it is commonly used in the UK to manufacture HMA mixtures. According to the British Standard PD 6691:2010 [41], this grade is the preferred grade for the production of HMA, having an AC 14 mm close-graded surface course aggregate gradation. The properties of the bitumen used in this research are presented in Table 3.

Table 3. Properties of 100/150 bitumen used in the study

Property	Value
Appearance	Black
Penetration at 25°C (0.1 mm)	141
Softening Point (°C)	43.5
Kinematic viscosity at 135°C (mPa.s)	179
Density (g/cm <sup>3</sup> )	1.02

215

216 4.1.4 Water

Tap water was used in this research for all types of CMA mixtures. The water was obtained from the domestic water supply pipe in the Henry Cotton Building at Liverpool John Moores

219 University, UK.

220 4.1.5 Filler

Conventional limestone dust was used in this research as a natural filler obtained from Francis
Flower Ltd, UK. Limestone filler plays a physical role through filling the pores between
aggregate particles and improving the backing properties.

224 4.1.6 Fibres

Two different types of fibres were used in this research as reinforcing materials, including synthetic fibre, which is glass fibre (supplied by the Fibre Technologies International Limited-UK), and natural fibre, which is hemp (supplied by the Wild Fibres-UK). These fibres are always as single (mono) fibres. The physical properties of these fibres are presented in Table 4.

Table 4. Natural and synthetic fibre properties

Items	Fibre type			
Items	Glass	Hemp		
Density (kg/m <sup>3</sup> )	1380	1500		
Tensile strength (MPa)	1600	900		
Diameter (µm)	15-19	17-23		
Moisture content (%)	0.5	10		

230

231 4.2 Specimens preparation

232 The effects of interaction between the asphalt binder and mineral aggregates and the effect of 233 mixing conditions are considered valuable on the properties of the bituminous mixtures [42]. 234 CMA specimens were prepared according to the Marshall method for emulsified asphalt 235 aggregate cold mixture designs (MS-14), as adopted by the Asphalt Institute [34]. According 236 to this procedure, the optimum pre-wetting water content, optimum total liquid content, 237 optimum residual bitumen contents and optimum emulsion content, were 3%, 15.4%, 6.2% and 238 12.4%, respectively. These results are comparable to those published by [12, 43, 44]. The fibres were added and blended into the mixtures to improve the mechanical properties. To ensure a 239

240 consistent distribution of the fibres, water and emulsion in the mixtures, the aggregate together 241 with the fibres and the pre-wetting water were added and mixed for 1 minute using an electric 242 blender [45]. After that, the bitumen emulsion was added progressively throughout the next 30 243 seconds of mixing, and the mixing was continued for the next 2 minutes. This process allows 244 for the best fibre distribution in the mixtures [46]. In addition, the mixed specimens were placed 245 in the moulds, and then directly compacted with 100 blows (in terms of Marshall specimens 246 were prepared), 50 on each side of the specimens using standard Marshall Hammer (impact 247 compactor), or compacted using a steel roller compactor (in terms of bituminous slabs were 248 prepared).

249 Fibre reinforcement of bituminous mixtures is deemed a random, direct inclusion of fibres into 250 the mixture. If the fibres are too long, they might not mix well with other materials because 251 some of the fibres may lump together creating a clumping or balling problem. On the other 252 hand, too short fibres might not perform well as a reinforcing material, serving only as an 253 expensive filler in the mixture. Therefore, it is necessary to optimise fibre's length and content 254 to avoid such problems and to ensure the uniformity of fibre distribution in the mixtures. In 255 this research, in order to find the optimum fibre length and content, fibres of varying lengths 256 (10, 14 and 20 mm) were used according to literatures reported [47]. These lengths were selected based on the aggregate maximum size, where, 10 mm is shorter, 20 mm is longer and 257 258 14 mm is the same as the aggregate maximum size. Based on the fibre reinforcing HMA and 259 concrete pavements [13, 45, 47-51], fibre contents of 0.15, 0.25, 0.35, 0.45 and 0.55% of total 260 aggregate weight for all fibre lengths, were included in the CMA mixtures. Based on the results 261 of the ITSM test, an optimised fibre length and content were selected and used for the other 262 experimental tests [52].

HMA specimens were prepared for comparison purposes according to the British Standard
[41]. 14 mm close graded surface course was used with (100/150) bitumen grade and according

to the British Standard [41] this grade is the preferred grade for producing HMA with the 14
mm close graded surface course aggregate gradation that been used for producing the CMA
mixtures. 5.1% optimum binder content by weight of aggregate was added according to PD
6691 (European Committee for Standardization, 2010b) for the Asphalt Concrete (AC) 14 mm
close graded surface course. The HMA mixtures were mixed and compacted at temperature of
160-170°C (in accordance with [53], shall not exceed 180°C).

# 271 4.3 Testing program and procedures

The testing program was conducted in two phases. In the first phase, fibres were investigated to establish the optimum fibre length and content. In the second phase, the conventional CMA (CON) and HMA mixtures, and the optimised fibre-reinforced CMA mixtures with two different fibres: glass as a synthetic fibre (GLS) and hemp as a natural fibre (HEM), were researched using different laboratory tests as detailed below.

#### 277 4.3.1 Indirect tensile stiffness modulus test

278 The indirect tensile stiffness modulus (ITSM) test is a non-destructive test where cylindrical 279 samples are positioned vertically, a diametrical load then applied. This test is used in the current 280 study to determine the stiffness modulus of the bituminous mixtures. Samples are subject to 281 repeated load pulses, with a rest period, along the vertical diameter of the sample, using two 282 loading strips 12.5 mm in width. Loading is applied in a half sine wave form, the loading time 283 is controlled during the test. The rise-time, measured from when the load pulse commences 284 and the time taken for the applied load to increase from initial contact load to the maximum 285 value, is  $124 \pm 4$  ms. The peak load value is adjusted to achieve a target peak, a transient 286 horizontal deformation of 0.005% of the sample diameter. The applied load is measured using 287 a load cell with an accuracy of 2%, the pulse repetition period  $3.0 \pm 0.1$  s.

288 In order to determine the stiffness modulus [8, 11, 12, 44, 54-56], all CMA specimens were 289 kept in their mould for one day at room temperature (20°C), this representing the first stage of curing, followed by 14 days of curing which represents the early age of pavement life. During 290 291 this period and because of the fibres, the average stiffness values increase significantly due to 292 reaching a definitive level. This behaviour is due to the bitumen emulsion emitting volatile 293 components, allowing the CMA mixtures to be cured and reach approximately their final 294 strength [14]. Adopting a normal curing temperature (room temperature) in this study was 295 performed to simulate the production, compaction and placing of such mixtures in field 296 conditions and avoid any premature ageing of the binder [57, 58]. Prior to test, the sample were 297 conditioned at the test temperature at least 4 hours. The testing temperatures were set as 5°C, 298 20°C, 45°C and 60°C. This test was carried out in accordance with BS EN 12697-26 [59] using 299 a Cooper Research Technology HYD 25 testing apparatus. The stiffness modulus was set at 300 the average value of five tested samples.

#### 301 *4.3.2 Creep test*

302 According to the British Standard [60], this test describes a method for determining the creep 303 parameters of bituminous mixtures by means of uniaxial static creep test with some 304 confinement present. Confinement of the sample is necessary to predict realistic rutting 305 behaviour. In this test, a cylindrical specimen is subjected to a static stress. To achieve a certain 306 confinement, the diameter of the loading plate is taken smaller than that of the sample. Creep 307 curve displays of the cumulative strain, expressed in %, of the specimen as a function of the 308 time of load applications. Generally, the following stages can be distinguished in the creep 309 curve Figure 3.

Stage 1: the decelerated creep part of the strain curve, where the strain rate decreases
with increasing loading time.

- Stage 2: the constant strain rate part of the strain curve, where the strain rate is quasi
   constant and with a turning point in the strain curve.
- Stage 3: the accelerated creep part of the strain curve, where the strain rate increases 315 with increasing loading time.

316 Depending on the testing conditions and on the mixture properties, one or more stages might

317 be missing.







Figure 3. Creep behaviour at constant stress [61]

320 This test method determines the viscoplastic properties of a cylindrical specimen of bituminous 321 mixture by loading and unloading condition. A cylindrical test specimen with a diameter of 322 150 mm were prepared and placed between two plan parallel loading plates. The upper plate 323 has a diameter of 100 mm. The specimen is subjected to a static pressure. There is no additional 324 lateral confinement pressure applied. During the test the change in height of the specimen is 325 measured at specified loading time. From this, the cumulative strain (permanent deformation) 326 of the test specimen is determined as a function of the loading time. The results are represented 327 in a creep curve as given in Figure 3. From this, the creep characteristics of the specimen are 328 computed. Prior the test, the specimens were kept at the test temperature within  $\pm 1.0^{\circ}$ C from 4 329 to 7 hours. To evaluate the viscoplastic characteristics of the bituminous mixtures, creep test was performed at different testing temperatures (5°C, 20°C, 45°C and 60°C). This test was
carried out under 100 kPa stress in accordance with the BS EN 12697-25 [60].

#### 332 4.3.3 Wheel tracking test

333 Wheel tracking tests were used to measure the rut depth (permanent deformation) of the 334 bituminous mixtures at two different temperatures, 45°C and 60°C. The selection of these two 335 temperatures was based on the British Standard PD 6691:2010 [41]. 45°C represents moderate 336 to heavily stressed sites requiring high rut resistance, while 60°C represents very heavily 337 stressed sites requiring very high rut resistance. Before conducting the tests, an electric blender 338 was used to mix the loose components of the bituminous mixtures. These mixtures then 339 compacted using a steel roller compactor in steel moulds to obtain solid bituminous slabs with 340 dimensions of 40 cm  $\times$  30.5 cm  $\times$  5 cm, in length, width and thickness respectively.

341 After compaction, the slab samples were left in their moulds to cure for 24 hours at lab 342 temperature before extraction. Following this, to obtain the final strength of the CMA slabs, 343 the compacted slabs were cured at 40°C for 14 days inside a ventilated oven, then removed and 344 allowed to cool [11, 12, 43, 55, 56, 62, 63]. It is stated that the wheel tracking test should be 345 performed at full curing (at the final mixture strength) because of rutting happen normally at 346 the late ages of the pavements life. In order to prevent the bitumen from ageing, the selected 347 curing temperature (40°C) is less than the bitumen softening point (50°C) [12, 55, 56]. 348 However, curing of such mixtures in the site may take from 2 months to 2 years to obtain the 349 final strength of these mixtures depend on the weather conditions [12, 55, 56].

For the test, a single wheel with a standard vehicle tyre pressure of 0.7 MPa was applied to the surface of the bituminous slab. The wheel was rolled on the surface of the bituminous slab covering a distance of 230 mm at a speed of 42 ( $\pm$ 1) times/min (16.1 cm/s) along the centre line of the slab, for 460 minutes (about 20000 wheel load repetitions) under the dry condition. This test was carried out in accordance with BS EN 12697-22 [64].

#### 355 5. Optimisation of Fibres' Length and Content

356 Reinforcement can be defined as incorporating materials which have specific properties, within 357 other materials that lack said properties. The primary purpose of fibres as a reinforcing material, 358 is to provide additional tensile and shear strength in the resulting mixtures and then to develop 359 an appropriate amount of strain resistance during the rutting and fatigue process of the mixture 360 [65]. Therefore, optimum fibre's length and content has a major effect on the mixture properties. 361 To obtain the optimum fibres' length and content, natural and synthetic fibres were used in 362 various lengths and contents. The indirect tensile stiffness modulus test was performed in order 363 to conduct fibres' optimisation analysis. Five different fibre contents (0.15%, 0.25%, 0.35%, 364 0.45% and 0.55%) and three different lengths (10 mm, 14 mm and 20 mm) were carried out to 365 reinforce the CMA mixtures to determine the maximum ITSM. Figure 4 shows the ITSM of 366 all reinforced mixtures with different fibres' length and content. In this Figure, the increase of 367 the ITSM can be observed with increase of fibres content for all fibres length, and then the 368 ITSM decreased with increasing fibres content. Here, 0.35% of fibres content shows the 369 maximum ITSM for all mixtures. The results were in agreement with those found in the 370 literature for example Chen, et al. [45] and Xu, et al. [66] who recommend that 0.3% - 0.4% 371 fibres content as a reinforcing material can provide optimum mechanical properties of 372 bituminous mixtures, based on the results from similar tests. In addition to the fibres content, 373 fibres length was investigated. Figure 4 summarises the results of indirect tensile stiffness 374 modulus test to investigate fibres length effect. The results from the graph show that fibres with 375 14 mm long have the highest ITSM for the all reinforced CMA mixtures tested. This could be 376 due to the good adherence of the reinforced mixtures with 14 mm fibre length and 0.35% 377 content to the bitumen [13]. According to Li, et al. [67] and Shanbara, et al. [61], shorter and longer fibres than the used aggregate maximum size cannot provide well reinforcing for the 378 379 bituminous mixtures. Short fibres perform as an expensive filler, while lone fibres tend to lump

together leading to cause balling during the mixing process. This is in agreement with other studies for instance, work by Jeon, et al. [50]. The appropriate fibres length and content provide best placement and distribution into the bituminous mixtures resulting improved interlock between the mixture and fibres [68].



385

384

Figure 4. Fibre optimization at 20°C after 2 days

# **6.** Characteristics of the Finite Element Method

The use of the Finite Element Method (FEM) to simulate flexible pavements is currently on the increase because of the nonlinear correlation between stresses and different strain types [3]. Although, 2-D models are acceptable when calculating permanent deformation of flexible pavements, 3-D models are employed to determine more precise and realistic pavement responses [6]. Therefore, in this research, a three-dimensional, finite element analysis of flexible pavement responses under repeated traffic loads, was performed to study the 393 mechanical properties of the reinforced and unreinforced CMA mixtures. The FEM gives 394 numerical estimations to problems which are too complicated to solve analytically. The 395 problems considered in this model are response to a repeated applied moving load and the 396 viscoplastic material properties of the bituminous mixtures.

397 The analytic model has a bituminous layer of 400 mm length, 305 mm width and 50 mm 398 thickness, as illustrated in Figure 5. These dimensions were chosen to concur with the wheel 399 tracking test samples which were simulated in this study. During the problem-solving process, 400 displacements of the base layer were restrained in all directions and the layer edges were 401 subject to horizontal restraints. In FEM technique, the body is divided into many small, discrete, 402 finite elements that are solved simultaneously. Simple 3-dimensional, 8-node, linear brick 403 reduced integration elements (C3D8R) were used for all simulations. These finite elements are 404 joined to each other by shared nodes, the combination of nodes and elements forming a mesh. 405 The density of the mesh is dependent on the number of elements used in a particular mesh. The 406 mesh size under the loading area and subject to intense stress and strain, was small (1.5 mm), 407 gradually increasing horizontally to ensure accurate results [69, 70]. Figure 6 shows the finite 408 elements mesh for the model and load distribution on the pavement surface.





Figure 5. Three-dimensional slab modelling



Figure 6. Mesh of the finite element model

413 In this research, viscoplastic models were developed for the bituminous layers (CMA) 414 containing natural or synthetic fibres as a reinforcing material, and conventional CMA and 415 HMA since the main aim of this research was to qualitatively compare the rutting resistance of 416 different CMA mixtures. Such fibres (glass and hemp) provide random, three-dimensional 417 reinforcement, which improves the tensile and shear strength of the asphalt layer. Four different 418 types of cold and hot mix asphalt mixtures were used in this study: conventional cold (CON) 419 and hot (HMA) mixtures, and reinforced CMA mixtures with glass (GLS) and hemp (HEM). 420 The main variations in the mixtures were the elastic modulus, and creep parameters. It is 421 acknowledged that temperature is an important factor that affects the rutting resistance of all 422 mixtures. With that in mind, the elastic modulus and creep of different mixtures, corresponding 423 to different temperatures, were obtained from the experimental results and a constant Poisson

ratio of 0.35 was assumed. All the flexible pavement material properties for the FEMcalculation are presented in Table 5, after 14 days curing for the CMA mixtures.

Mixture type	Temperature (°C)	А	n	m	E (MPa)
CON	60	$1.01 \times 10^{-3}$	1.721	-0.0058	35
	45	$1.00 \times 10^{-3}$	1.648	-0.0011	100
	20	$1.91 \times 10^{-3}$	1.494	-0.0072	464
	5	$9.46 \times 10^{-4}$	1.602	-0.0139	581
HMA	60	$9.76 \times 10^{-4}$	1.756	-0.0093	550
	45	$8.19 \times 10^{-4}$	1.758	-0.0123	835
	20	$6.97  imes 10^{-4}$	1.747	-0.0149	1420
	5	$5.33 \times 10^{-4}$	1.737	-0.0163	4138
GLS	60	$6.38 \times 10^{-4}$	1.716	-0.0096	604
	45	$5.06 \times 10^{-4}$	1.721	-0.0137	789
	20	$3.23 \times 10^{-4}$	1.737	-0.0224	1152
	5	$2.17 \times 10^{-4}$	1.736	-0.0195	2267
HEM	60	$6.81 \times 10^{-4}$	1.640	-0.0127	529
	45	$5.74 \times 10^{-4}$	1.652	-0.0147	713
	20	$4.11 \times 10^{-4}$	1.668	-0.0152	1100
	5	$2.88 \times 10^{-4}$	1.655	-0.0149	2047

Table 5. Creep power law and elastic parameters of cold and hot mix asphalt mixtures

The creep power law parameters are based on the equation 4, which represents the unloading part of creep test. By fitting the unloading part of the creep curve using Microsoft Excel, the creep power law parameters (A, n and m) are determined. Then these can be used to property the material in ABAQUS. Figure 7 shows an example of fitting the CON creep curve at 20°C.





# Figure 7. Fitting creep curve of CON at 20°C

433 A vertical, uniform type pressure of 700 kPa was applied as a moving load on the pavement 434 surface having a rectangular loading footprint of 5 cm in length and 3 cm in width, to meet the 435 wheel tracking test requirements. The applied wheel load transfers to the bituminous surface 436 layer through the contact pressure between the tyre and pavement surface. This contact pressure 437 is equal to the pressure from a tyre on a road surface [71], simplified as a rectangular, uniformly 438 distributed, surface load [72, 73]. The moving wheel load zone (Figure 8a) is divided into 439 several small rectangles which have the same width as the tyre footprint (5 cm) and are one-440 third its length (1 cm). The wheel load occupies three rectangular areas as shown in Figure 8a.



442

Figure 8. Moving load zone and loading amplitude

443 When the load gradually moves backwards and forwards, a series of load application steps are 444 performed. At the end of each load application step, the whole load moves forward to a small 445 rectangular area, for example, at the end of the first load application step, the load occupying 446 areas 2, 3 and 4. In order to avoid any impact, load applications on area 4, increase gradually 447 to reach the maximum (700 kPa), at the same time decreasing gradually in area 1, as shown in 448 Figure 8b. Tyre pressure is applied repeatedly on the pavement surface, over a large number of 449 cycles (1.43 s of each cycle), during which the load is applied to each element for 0.18 s to 450 simulate a vehicle speed of approximately 0.6 km/h. The load is then removed as shown in 451 Figure 8b.

# 452 **7. Validation of the Finite Element Method**

453 In order to validate the finite element model, a validation process was carried out by comparing 454 the experimental results with the finite element modelling output data. A similar set of 455 experiments had been conducted using wheel tracking tests to compare actual rutting 456 (permanent deformation) with the rutting values obtained from the model. The experimental 457 setup comprised an asphalt mix slab with dimensions 5 cm thick, 30.5 cm wide and 40 cm long, 458 over a fixed rigid steel plate. Initially, the slabs were kept in the oven for 14 days at 40°C after 459 compaction, in order to reach the final curing condition stage [11]. During the test, the slabs 460 were subjected to a moving type pressure of 700 kPa. The total traveling distance of the type on 461 the slab is 23 cm at a speed of 0.6 km/h. Four types of cold and hot asphalt mixtures were 462 prepared to make the slabs. Each type was then wheel track tested at two different temperatures; 463 45°C and 60°C. The wheel tracking tests were carried out to measure the rut depth on the 464 asphalt pavement surface, along and under the wheel path, after 20000 cycles (28600 s). The 465 rutting value was set at the average value of three tested samples.

466 A very slight modification to the model was required to simulate the moving load as it needs467 to use a repeated moving surface load. The slight modification is, the repeated moving load in

468 the model was simulated as a surface repeated moving load, while in the wheel tracking test is 469 an actual wheel. All other modelling features remained the same, including loading and 470 unloading time, wheel speed, the total number of load repetitions, boundary conditions and 471 temperature. The total number of load cycles applied on the pavement surface was deemed to 472 be sufficient to distort these pavements. The vertical strain results (rut depth) and the 473 deformation shapes produced on the surface of the asphalt pavement samples using this model, 474 were compared with the pavement strain results which were performed using the wheel 475 tracking test as shown in the Figure 9. Different rut depth measurements were obtained for the 476 HMA and CMA mixtures, at 45°C and 60°C, from the finite element model, to be compared 477 with the experimental data, Figure 10 and 11 presenting these comparisons. It can clearly be 478 seen that there is good agreement on rut depth measurements between the model and the test. 479 The predicted rutting matches well with the measured ruts, even though some variations were 480 observed (between the predicted and measured rutting) between mixture types and temperature. 481 This vibration between the predicted and measured rutting is because of the model assumes 482 that the material properties are uniform and homogenous, whilst in reality the mixtures include 483 some voids and different aggregate interlocks. Also, in reality, the temperature and viscosity 484 of the mixtures can not be distributed equally for the whole mixture and this can not be 485 modelled because of the difficulty of setting different temperatures and viscosities for each 486 particles of the mixture.

It can be also observed from Figure 12 that the transverse rut profile of the experimental results follows the same trend as the slabs that were simulated in the model. Qualitative comparisons of the measured and calculated CMA and HMA responses prove that the finite element model can successfully predict rutting, dependent on the properties of the material, repeated loads and temperatures.



b









Figure 12. Measured vs. predicted transverse rut profile

# 500 8. Parametric study based on the FE model

501 The validated numerical models presented in Section 7 were used to carry out parametric 502 studies in order to investigate the influence of other parameters on the rutting behaviour of the 503 reinforced and unreinforced CMA mixtures under different loadings and environmental 504 conditions, which were not covered.

505 8.1 Temperature attributes

506 To examine the effect of the temperature on the rutting response of the reinforced and 507 unreinforced CMA mixtures using natural and synthetic fibres, two different temperatures were 508 adopted as a moderate to low temperature, i.e. 20°C and 5°C. At low temperatures (about 0°C), 509 rutting resistance increases due to the developed stiffness of the bituminous mixtures in such 510 temperature [67]. Figure 13 and 14 show the rutting variation of the reinforced CMA and 511 conventional CMA and HMA mixtures at different temperatures (20°C and 5°C). As expected 512 from the numerical model, lower rutting of the bituminous mixtures at low temperatures can 513 be observed. Therefore, Flexible pavement design procedures and analysis should consider the 514 actual road pavement temperatures that have an important impact on permanent deformation.







519 8.2 Static loading attributes

Rutting of reinforced and unreinforced CMA and HMA mixtures, after 20000 repeated applied moving loads (about 28600 s), were illustrated in Section 7. The rutting of the equivalent static loading condition (20000 s loading) of the same numerical model at four different temperatures is also demonstrated in Figure 15-18 This loading condition was applied resulting permanent deformation that follows the same order of moving loads rutting resistance: the conventional 525 CMA and HMA mixtures have the highest rut depth, while the reinforced CMA mixtures with 526 glass fibre have the shallowest rutting. This is in agreement with Zhi, et al. [74] who reported 527 that the static loading condition is more damaging to the flexible pavements structure than 528 moving loads condition. Because there is no rest interval in the static loading condition to allow 529 bituminous mixtures recover after releasing loads, rutting was greater than that was found in 530 the moving loading condition [61].







Figure 16. Predicted rutting for static loading at  $20^{\circ}C$ 











539 8.3 Repeated applied wheel load speed attributes

The influence of the traffic load speeds was performed using the validated numerical model on all cold and hot mixtures with different speeds (5 km/h, 30 km/h and 60 km/h), as shown in Figure 19. At 5 km/h, the cumulative rutting on the bituminous surface layer is significant more than that at 30 km/h, whereas a slight variation in rutting between the 30 km/h and 60 km/h is observed. The loading time for each repeated wheel pass on each element on the pavement surface, is depending on the moving loads speed. It was 0.0216 s at 5 km/h, 0.0036 s at 30 km/h and 0.0018 s at 60 km/h.



548



# 550 8.4 Stress distribution

551 The validated model in the previous section was used to study the rutting behaviour of the 552 bituminous mixtures in terms of temperature, static loading condition and repeated applied 553 wheel load speed which cannot be obtained from the experimental results. In addition, the 554 model was also used to explain different rutting depth during the repeated moving wheel load 555 on different types of bituminous mixtures. The rutting depth of the reinforced CMA mixtures 556 decreased in comparison to the conventional CMA and HMA mixtures. This reduction is due 557 to the decrease of the pavement stresses at the area underneath the repeated moving load. Figure 558 20 and 21 show the pattern of stress developed in the all mixtures under repeated moving wheel 559 load at 5°C and 20°C, if excessive will cause rutting. These Figures show that the maximum 560 stress naturally occurs on the top of the layer under the middle of the wheel path, which might 561 be the main cause of rutting. Stress distribution in the reinforced mixtures is considerably less 562 than stress occurring in the conventional mixtures especially under the moving wheel load.







Figure 21. Stress distribution at 20°C

# 568 9. Conclusion

569 In this research, a series of laboratory tests were conducted to characterise permanent 570 deformation characteristics of reinforced CMA mixtures using hemp and glass fibers and also 571 conventional CMA and HMA mixtures. The creep behaviour of such mixtures were 572 investigated based on creep power law parameters. A 3-D viscoplastic model was developed to simulate a laboratory wheel tracking test. Different types of comparison between the predicted results by the model and those measured using the wheel tracking test were conducted to validate the model. The validated model was finally employed to analyse the influences of different parameters on rutting behaviour that could not be obtained using the laboratory test. The effects of natural and synthetic fibres on these parameters were also considered. The following conclusions were obtained:

- The two reinforced CMA mixtures and the conventional CMA and HMA mixtures
   exhibited different rutting behaviours under moving and static loading conditions. Their
   recoverable and irrecoverable deformation trends were well described by the numerical
   viscoplastic model.
- The addition of hemp and glass fibres to the CMA mixtures as a reinforcing material was
   found to increase the permanent deformation resistance of such mixtures.
- The results showed the ability of the developed numerical models to predict rutting
   behaviour under different loading and environment conditions.
- Low and moderate pavement temperatures can effectively improve the resistance to
   rutting.
- Besides, a comparison between rutting behaviour models under both static and moving
   loading conditions revealed that the static loading condition exhibits higher rutting than
   the moving one for all temperatures.
- Effect of low moving load speed on the surface of the road pavements increases rutting
   effectively, whilst increases rutting slightly at high speeds.

# 594 Acknowledgments

595 This research is a part the first author PhD research Liverpool John Moores University, Faculty 596 of Engineering and Technology, Department of Civil Engineering (Liverpool John Moores

597 University Reference Number: 669831). The first author would like to express his gratitude to 598 the Ministry of Higher Education & Scientific Research, Iraq and Al Muthanna University, 599 Iraq for financial support under the grant agreement number 29517 dated 17/09/2013. The 600 authors also wish to thank David Jobling-Purser, Steve Joyce, Neil Turner and Richard Lavery 601 for providing the materials for this research project.

602

# 603 References

- 604 [1] Bai, F., Yang, X., and Zeng, G., A stochastic viscoelastic–viscoplastic constitutive model and
- 605 *its application to crumb rubber modified asphalt mixtures.* Materials & Design, 2016. **89**: p. 802-809.
- 606 [2] Xiao, Y., et al., Modeling stress path dependency of cyclic plastic strain accumulation of
- 607 *unbound granular materials under moving wheel loads.* Materials & Design, 2018. **137**: p. 9-21.
- Ke, Q., Wu, S., and Li, N., *Investigation of the dynamic and fatigue properties of fiber-modified asphalt mixtures*. International Journal of Fatigue, 2009. **31**(10): p. 1598-1602.
- 610 [4] Al-Hadidy, A.I. and Yi-qiu, T., *Mechanistic approach for polypropylene-modified flexible*611 *pavements*. Materials & Design, 2009. **30**(4): p. 1133-1140.
- 612 [5] Safaei, F. and Castorena, C., *Material nonlinearity in asphalt binder fatigue testing and*613 *analysis.* Materials & Design, 2017. **133**: p. 376-389.
- 614 [6] Imaninasab, R., Bakhshi, B., and Shirini, B., *Rutting performance of rubberized porous asphalt*
- 615 *using Finite Element Method (FEM).* Construction and Building Materials, 2016. **106**: p. 382-391.

616 [7] Arabani, M. and Kamboozia, N., *The linear visco-elastic behaviour of glasphalt mixture under* 

- 617 *dynamic loading conditions.* Construction and Building Materials, 2013. **41**: p. 594-601.
- 618 [8] Al-Hdabi, A., Al Nageim, H., and Seton, L., Superior cold rolled asphalt mixtures using
- 619 *supplementary cementations materials*. Construction and Building Materials, 2014. **64**: p. 95-102.
- 620 [9] Yuliestyan, A., et al., Assessment of modified lignin cationic emulsifier for bitumen emulsions
- 621 *used in road paving.* Materials & Design, 2017. **131**: p. 242-251.

- [10] Jamshidi, A., et al., *Evaluation of sustainable technologies that upgrade the binder performance grade in asphalt pavement construction.* Materials & Design, 2016. **95**: p. 9-20.
- 624 [11] Dulaimi, A., et al., New developments with cold asphalt concrete binder course mixtures
- 625 *containing binary blended cementitious filler (BBCF).* Construction and Building Materials, 2016. **124**:
- 626 p. 414-423.
- 627 [12] Dulaimi, A., et al., *High performance cold asphalt concrete mixture for binder course using*
- *alkali-activated binary blended cementitious filler*. Construction and Building Materials, 2017. 141: p.
  160-170.
- 630 [13] Abiola, O.S., et al., Utilisation of natural fibre as modifier in bituminous mixes: A review.
- 631 Construction and Building Materials, 2014. **54**: p. 305-312.
- [14] Ferrotti, G., Pasquini, E., and Canestrari, F., *Experimental characterization of high- performance fiber-reinforced cold mix asphalt mixtures*. Construction and Building Materials, 2014.
  57: p. 117-125.
- 635 [15] Moghaddam, T., B., Karim, M., R., and Abdelaziz, M., A review on fatigue and rutting
  636 performance of asphalt mixes. Academic Journals, 2011. 6(4): p. 670-682.
- 637 [16] Vaitkus, A. and Paliukaitė, M., *Evaluation of Time Loading Influence on Asphalt Pavement*638 *Rutting*. Procedia Engineering, 2013. 57: p. 1205-1212.
- [17] Zaumanis, M., Poulikakos, L.D., and Partl, M.N., *Performance-based design of asphalt mixtures and review of key parameters*. Materials & Design, 2018. **141**: p. 185-201.
- [18] Zhang, Y. and Leng, Z., *Quantification of bituminous mortar ageing and its application in*ravelling evaluation of porous asphalt wearing courses. Materials & Design, 2017. 119: p. 1-11.
- 643 [19] Tan, Y., et al., Performance optimization of composite modified asphalt sealant based on
- 644 *rheological behavior*. Construction and Building Materials, 2013. **47**: p. 799-805.
- 645 [20] Chen, X., Zhang, J., and Wang, X., *Full-scale field testing on a highway composite pavement*646 *dynamic responses*. Transportation Geotechnics, 2015. 4: p. 13-27.
- 647 [21] Hu, X. and Walubita, L., F., *Effects of Layer Interfacial Bonding Conditions on the Mechanistic*
- 648 *Responses in Asphalt Pavements.* JOURNAL OF TRANSPORTATION ENGINEERING, 2011. **137**(1):
- 649 p. 28-36.

- 650 [22] Kim, H. and Buttlar, W.G., Finite element cohesive fracture modeling of airport pavements at
- 651 *low temperatures.* Cold Regions Science and Technology, 2009. **57**(2-3): p. 123-130.
- 652 [23] Chazallon, C., et al., Modelling of rutting of two flexible pavements with the shakedown theory
- and the finite element method. Computers and Geotechnics, 2009. **36**(5): p. 798-809.
- 654 [24] Ameri, M., et al., Cracked asphalt pavement under traffic loading A 3D finite element analysis.
- 655 Engineering Fracture Mechanics, 2011. **78**(8): p. 1817-1826.
- 656 [25] Ghauch, Z.G. and Abou-Jaoude, G.G., Strain response of hot-mix asphalt overlays in jointed
- 657 plain concrete pavements due to reflective cracking. Computers & Structures, 2013. 124: p. 38-46.
- 658 [26] Li, C. and Li, L., Criteria for controlling rutting of asphalt concrete materials in sloped
- 659 *pavement*. Construction and Building Materials, 2012. **35**: p. 330-339.
- Littel, D., N., Bhasin, A., and Allen, D., H., *Modeling and Design of Flexible Pavements and Materials*. 2017, Switzerland: Springer.
- 662 [28] Picoux, B., El Ayadi, A., and Petit, C., *Dynamic response of a flexible pavement submitted by*663 *impulsive loading*. Soil Dynamics and Earthquake Engineering, 2009. 29(5): p. 845-854.
- 664 [29] Dave, E., V., et al. Graded Viscoelastic Approach for Modeling Asphalt Concrete Pavements,
- 665 in: Proceedings of the Multiscale and Functionally Graded Materials Conference, O'Ahu, Hawaii
  666 (2006).
- [30] Kai, L. and Fang, W., *Computer Modeling Mechanical Analysis for Asphalt Overlay under Coupling Action of Temperature and Loads.* Procedia Engineering, 2011. 15: p. 5338-5342.
- [31] Xue, Q., et al., Dynamic behavior of asphalt pavement structure under temperature-stress
  coupled loading. Applied Thermal Engineering, 2013. 53(1): p. 1-7.
- 671 [32] Pérez, I., Medina, L., and del Val, M.A., Nonlinear elasto-plastic performance prediction of
- 672 materials stabilized with bitumen emulsion in rural road pavements. Advances in Engineering Software,
- 673 2016. **91**: p. 69-79.
- 674 [33] Gu, F., et al., Numerical modeling of geogrid-reinforced flexible pavement and corresponding
- 675 *validation using large-scale tank test.* Construction and Building Materials, 2016. **122**: p. 214-230.
- 676 [34] Asphalt Institute, Asphalt Cold Mix Manual, Manual Series No. 14(MS-14), third ed., Lexington,
- 677 KY 40512–4052, USA, 1989.

- [35] Uzarowski, L., *The Development of Asphalt Mix Creep Parameters and Finite Element Modeling of Asphalt Rutting*, in *Civil Engineering*. 2006, Waterloo, Ontario, Canada: Waterloo, Ontario,
  Canada.
- 681 [36] Sun, L., Predictions of rutting on asphalt pavements, in Structural Behavior of Asphalt
  682 Pavements. 2016. p. 601-648.
- 683 [37] Chen, F., Balieu, R., and Kringos, N., Thermodynamics-based finite strain viscoelastic-
- 684 viscoplastic model coupled with damage for asphalt material. International Journal of Solids and
- 685 Structures, 2017. **129**: p. 61-73.
- 686 [38] Huang, Y.H., *Pavement Analysis and Design*. 2004, United States of America: Pearson
  687 Education, Inc.
- 688 [39] Huang B., Mohammad L.N., and Rasoulian M., Three-Dimensional Numerical Simulation of
- 689 Asphalt Pavement at Louisiana Accelerated Loading Facility. 2001, Washington, D.C.: Transportation
- 690 Research Record, National Research Council.
- 691 [40] European Committee for Standardization, BS EN 933-1: Part 1, Tests for geometrical properties
- 692 of aggregates: Determination of particle size distribution Sieving method, British Standards
- 693 Institution, London, UK, 2012.
- 694 [41] European Committee for Standardization, BS EN PD 6691, Guidance on the use of BS EN
- 695 13108 Bituminous mixtures Material specifications, British Standards Institution, London, UK, 2010.
- 696 [42] Guo, M., et al., *Investigating the interaction between asphalt binder and fresh and simulated*
- 697 *RAP aggregate*. Materials & Design, 2016. **105**: p. 25-33.
- 698 [43] Al-Busaltan, S., et al., *Green Bituminous Asphalt relevant for highway and airfield pavement.*699 Construction and Building Materials, 2012. **31**: p. 243-250.
- 700 [44] Al-Hdabi, A., et al., Development of Sustainable Cold Rolled Surface Course Asphalt Mixtures
- *Using Waste Fly Ash and Silica Fume.* Journal of Materials in Civil Engineering, 2014. 26(3): p. 536543.
- 703 [45] Chen, H., et al., *Evaluation and design of fiber-reinforced asphalt mixtures*. Materials & Design,
  704 2009. **30**(7): p. 2595-2603.

- 705 [46] Abtahi, S.M., Sheikhzadeh, M., and Hejazi, S.M., *Fiber-reinforced asphalt-concrete A review*.
- Construction and Building Materials, 2010. **24**(6): p. 871-877.
- 707 [47] Liu, G., Cheng, W., and Chen, L., *Investigating and optimizing the mix proportion of pumping*
- 708 *wet-mix shotcrete with polypropylene fiber.* Construction and Building Materials, 2017. **150**: p. 14-23.
- 709 [48] Yang, J.M., Kim, J.K., and Yoo, D.Y., *Effects of amorphous metallic fibers on the properties*
- 710 *of asphalt concrete*. Construction and Building Materials, 2016. **128**: p. 176-184.
- 711 [49] Xu, Q., Chen, H., and Prozzi, J.A., *Performance of fiber reinforced asphalt concrete under*
- *environmental temperature and water effects.* Construction and Building Materials, 2010. 24(10): p.
  2003-2010.
- [50] Jeon, J., et al., *Polyamide Fiber Reinforced Shotcrete for Tunnel Application*. Materials, 2016. **9**(3): p. 163.
- [51] Hesami, S., Ahmadi, S., and Nematzadeh, M., *Effects of rice husk ash and fiber on mechanical properties of pervious concrete pavement*. Construction and Building Materials, 2014. 53: p. 680-691.
- 718 [52] Fu, Z., et al., Laboratory evaluation of pavement performance using modified asphalt mixture
- with a new composite reinforcing material. International Journal of Pavement Research and Technology,
  2017.
- 721 [53] European Committee for Standardization, BS EN 12697-13: Part 13, Bituminous mixtures —
- Test methods for hot mix asphalt Temperature measurement, British Standards Institution, London,
  UK, 2000.
- Al-Hdabi, A., Al Nageim, H., and Seton, L., *Performance of gap graded cold asphalt containing cement treated filler*. Construction and Building Materials, 2014. 69: p. 362-369.
- 726 [55] Dulaimi, A., et al., Laboratory Studies to Examine the Properties of a Novel Cold-Asphalt
- 727 Concrete Binder Course Mixture Containing Binary Blended Cementitious Filler. Journal of Materials
- 728 in Civil Engineering, 2017. **29**(9).
- 729 [56] Dulaimi, A., et al., Performance Analysis of a Cold Asphalt Concrete Binder Course
- 730 Containing High-Calcium Fly Ash Utilizing Waste Material. Journal of Materials in Civil Engineering,
- 731 2017. **29**(7): p. 04017048.

- [57] Khalid, H.A. and Monney, O.K., *Moisture damage potential of cold asphalt*. International
  Journal of Pavement Engineering, 2009. 10(5): p. 311-318.
- 734 [58] Ojum, C., et al. An investigation into the effects of accelerated curing on Cold Recycled
  735 Bituminous Mixes. in International Conference on Asphalt Pavements, ISAP. 2014.
- 736 [59] European Committee for Standardization, BS EN 12697-26: Part 26, Bituminous mixtures —
- 737 Test methods for hot mix asphalt: Stiffness, British Standards Institution, London, UK, 2012.
- 738 [60] European Committee for Standardization, BS EN 12697-25: Part 25, Bituminous mixtures —
- 739 Test methods for hot mix asphalt Cyclic compression test, British Standards Institution, London, UK,
  740 2005.
- 741 [61] Shanbara, H.K., Ruddock, F., and Atherton, W., Predicting the rutting behaviour of natural
- fibre-reinforced cold mix asphalt using the finite element method. Construction and Building Materials,
- 743 2018. **167**: p. 907-917.
- Al-Busaltan, S., et al., *Mechanical properties of an upgrading cold-mix asphalt using waste materials*. Journal of materials in civil engineering, 2012. 24(12): p. 1484-1491.
- [63] Al Nageim, H., et al., *A comparative study for improving the mechanical properties of cold bituminous emulsion mixtures with cement and waste materials.* Construction and Building Materials,
  2012. 36: p. 743-748.
- [64] European Committee for Standardization, BS EN 12697-22: Part 22, Bituminous mixtures —
   750 Test methods for hot mix asphalt Wheel tracking, British Standards Institution, London, UK, 2003.
- 751 [65] Shanbara, H.K., Ruddock, F., and Atherton, W., A laboratory study of high-performance cold
- 752 mix asphalt mixtures reinforced with natural and synthetic fibres. Construction and Building Materials,
- 753 2018. **172**: p. 166-175.
- 754 [66] Xu, T., et al., Evaluation of permanent deformation of asphalt mixtures using different
- *laboratory performance tests.* Construction and Building Materials, 2014. **53**: p. 561-567.
- 756 [67] Li, Y., et al., Effective temperature for predicting permanent deformation of asphalt pavement.
- 757 Construction and Building Materials, 2017. **156**: p. 871-879.
- 758 [68] Saeid, H., Saeed, A., and Mahdi, N., Effects of rice husk ash and fiber on mechanical properties
- 759 *of pervious concrete pavement.* Construction and Building Materials, 2014. **53**: p. 680-691.

- 760 [69] Shanbara, H.K., et al. The Linear Elastic Analysis of Cold Mix Asphalt by Using Finite Element
- 761 *Modeling*. in *The Second BUiD Doctoral Research Conference*. 2016. Dubai, United Arab Emirates.
- 762 [70] Chen, J., et al., *Evaluation of pavement responses and performance with thermal modified*763 *asphalt mixture*. Materials & Design, 2016. **111**: p. 88-97.
- 764 [71] NATIONAL COOPERATIVE HIGHWAY RESEARCH PROGRAM, Contributions of
- 765 Pavement Structural Layers to Rutting of Hot Mix Asphalt Pavements. 2002, TRANSPORTATION
- 766 RESEARCH BOARD: NATIONAL ACADEMY PRESS, WASHINGTON.
- 767 [72] Wu, J., Liang, J., and Adhikari, S., Dynamic response of concrete pavement structure with
- 768 *asphalt isolating layer under moving loads.* Journal of Traffic and Transportation Engineering (English
- 769 Edition), 2014. **1**(6): p. 439-447.
- 770 [73] Huang, C., W., et al., Three-Dimensional Simulations of Asphalt Pavement Permanent
- 771 Deformation Using a Nonlinear Viscoelastic and Viscoplastic Model. JOURNAL OF MATERIALS IN
- 772 CIVIL ENGINEERING, 2011.
- 773 [74] Zhi, S., et al., Evaluation of fatigue crack behavior in asphalt concrete pavements with different
- polymer modifiers. Construction and Building Materials, 2012. 27(1): p. 117-125.