Cooper, HV, Vane, CH, Evers, SL, Aplin, P, Girkin, NT and Sjögersten, S

From peat swamp forest to oil palm plantations: The stability of tropical peatland carbon

http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/id/eprint/10568/

Citation (please note it is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from this work)


LJMU has developed LJMU Research Online for users to access the research output of the University more effectively. Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Users may download and/or print one copy of any article(s) in LJMU Research Online to facilitate their private study or for non-commercial research. You may not engage in further distribution of the material or use it for any profit-making activities or any commercial gain.

The version presented here may differ from the published version or from the version of the record. Please see the repository URL above for details on accessing the published version and note that access may require a subscription.

For more information please contact researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk

http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/
From peat swamp forest to oil palm plantations: The stability of tropical peatland carbon

Hannah V. Cooper¹, b, , Christopher H. Vane⁴, Stephanie Evers³, d, f, Paul Aplin⁵, Nicholas T. Girkin⁶, Sofie Sjögersten⁷

¹ School of Biosciences, University of Nottingham, UK
² School of Environmental and Geographical Sciences, University of Nottingham Malaysia Campus, Malaysia
³ British Geological Survey, Environmental Science Centre, Keyworth, UK
⁴ School of Natural Sciences and Psychology, Liverpool John Moores University, UK
⁵ Department of Geography, Edge Hill University, Ormskirk, UK
⁶ TROCARI (Tropical Catchment Research Initiative), Malaysia

ABSTRACT

Accurate assessment of tropical peatland carbon dynamics is important to (a) determine the size of the active carbon pool, (b) estimate the scale of transfers of peat-derived greenhouse gases (GHGs) to the atmosphere resulting from land use change, and (c) support carbon emissions reduction policies. To date, information on the quality of tropical peatland organic matter and its sensitivity to increases in global temperatures is limited, particularly in the context of land conversion. The aim of this work is therefore to determine peat quality and temperature response of potential GHG emissions under flooded conditions from tropical peatland sites. Whilst reflecting the process of conversion from forest to oil palm plantation. Four land use types that represent the stages of conversion from peat swamp forest to oil palm were chosen: (i) secondary ‘forest’, (ii) recently ‘drained’ but not cleared forest (iii) cleared and recently planted ‘young oil palm’ plantation and (iv) ‘mature oil palm’ plantation.

Overall, surface peat carbon was more labile than deeper peats. The largest labile pool was measured at forest sites. In the later stages of land conversion, the labile carbon had been lost and the relative abundance of recalcitrant organic material increased. Potential GHG fluxes were greatest in surface peats compared to deeper peats and declined as labile carbon was depleted following land conversion. Higher temperatures resulted in higher potential GHG emissions at all stages of conversion, but the magnitude of the temperature response depended on organic matter lability. For CO₂ fluxes, the temperature response was most pronounced at forest sites. This reflects the greater peat lability at this land use. In contrast, for CH₄ emissions, there were increased emissions both at forest and converted land types with higher temperatures. This suggests that increasing temperatures in response to climate warming may drive higher CH₄ emissions from sites dominated by degraded organic matter. Collectively, this study demonstrates that during conversion from peat swamp forest to oil palm plantation, the enhanced decomposition and reduced litter input rates is reflected eventually in reduced potential gross CO₂ emissions from peat. Nonetheless higher temperature resulting from climate warming may maintain high GHG emissions at plantation sites.

1. Introduction

Palm oil is one of the most widely used agricultural products in the world, with demand projected to increase in the future (Corley, 2009; Koh and Wilcove, 2008; Vijay et al., 2016). An estimate by Koh and Wilcove (2008) indicated that of all oil palm expansion between 1990 and 2005 in Malaysia, at least 50% has come at the expense of natural rainforest, of which the natural vegetation is predominantly peat swamp forest (Davies et al., 2010). Peat swamp forests play an essential role in the global carbon cycle and are significant carbon sinks and stores, containing an estimated 15–19% of the global peat carbon stock (610 Gt C) (Dargie et al., 2017; Page et al., 2011).

Peat swamp forests are highly sensitive to disturbance by drainage or deforestation for conversion to oil palm plantations (Evers et al., 2017). Following conversion, the exchange of greenhouse gases (GHGs)
between terrestrial ecosystems and the atmosphere is directly affected (IPCC, 2000) and carbon accumulated over centuries or millennia is rapidly released to the atmosphere, contributing to climate warming (Cownenberg et al., 2010; Hooijer et al., 2012; Davies et al., 2010; Moore et al., 2018). Since 1990, oil palm plantations have been linked to 2.5 Gt C losses in carbon stock in tropical peatlands (Miettinen et al., 2017). There is, however, a lack of data regarding how rapidly carbon is lost to the atmosphere during the conversion process, and how changes to organic chemistry of remaining stored C determine its susceptibility to further release. A recent study in Malaysia suggests that organic matter content declines at least within the first one to 2 years following the start of conversion (Tonks et al., 2017). Furthermore, the conversion process altered surface peat functional organic chemistry as carbohydrates were preferentially depleted as a result of aerobic decay, suggesting that conversion will enhance peat recalcitrance but increase its aromaticity (Tonks et al., 2017; Yule et al., 2018).

In addition to land use conversion, tropical peatlands are also affected by climate change which is predicted to result in a 3–7 °C increase in temperature and increased seasonality of rainfall, resulting in more pronounced dry and wet seasons and, thus, longer periods of flooded conditions (IPCC, 2007, 2014). Recent work in pristine peatlands in the Neotropics has shown strong temperature responses of GHG emissions under high water-table conditions for both CO₂ and CH₄ (Sjögersten et al., 2018). However, temperature responses of GHG emissions from wetland soils differ considerably among land use types, likely in response to differences in organic matter lability (Dunfield et al., 1993; Duval and Radu, 2018; Gritsch et al., 2015; Inglett et al., 2012; Turetsky et al., 2015). As deforestation rates in Southeast Asia show no signs of slowing (Wijedasa et al., 2018), peat swamp forests are predicted to be extinct by 2050 if current rates of peatland deforestation continue unchecked (Miettinen et al., 2016). It is therefore critical that we quantify the climate feedback potentials from both peat swamp forests and also degraded peats in plantations. Indeed, it is plausible that high temperatures further increase the climate burden of GHG emissions from oil palm plantations, as the temperature sensitivity of organic matter decomposition is predicted to increase with recalcitrance, as higher activation energies are required for catalysis, in line with kinetic theory (Bosatta and Ågren, 1999; Davidson and Janssens, 2006).

GHG emissions from drained tropical peatland conversion are at present overlooked in GHG emission budgets as considered by the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change (IPCC, 2006; IPCC, 2014). However, given their important role in the global carbon cycle and the pressures they are exposed to from both land use and climate change, it is vital to develop a mechanistic understanding of the controls of GHG emissions from forested and converted peatlands to underpin the delivery of evidence-based sustainable land use management and policy (Evers et al., 2017). Therefore, this study aims to improve our understanding of the impact of anthropogenic activities, e.g. drainage and deforestation, on soil organic matter stability and subsequent GHG fluxes from tropical peatlands. To achieve this, we address three specific hypotheses linked to how land use and temperature changes alter peat lability and CO₂ and CH₄ fluxes: Our first hypothesis (1) “land conversion of drainage-based oil palm plantation results in depletion of labile substrates in surface peat affected by drainage, but not in deeper peat layers” is based on the notion that drainage promotes aerobic decomposition in surface peat but not in deeper peats below the water-table where anoxic conditions remain (Cownenberg et al., 2010; Jauhiainen et al., 2008). Because substrate lability is often a predictor of GHG emissions in tropical peatlands (Hoyos-Santillan et al., 2016; Wright et al., 2011), we hypothesise that (2) “ex situ anaerobic CO₂ and CH₄ production will be lower in the later stages of land conversion to oil palm plantation as a result of depletion of labile carbon”. In line with kinetic theory (Bosatta and Ågren, 1999; Davidson and Janssens, 2006) we also hypothesise that (3) “the impact of substrate depletion on GHG production is exacerbated by higher temperatures, with the strongest impact in surface peat”.

2. Materials and methods

2.1. Study sites

Field data and sample collection was conducted in November–December 2014 in North Selangor Peat Swamp Forest, Malaysia. The North Selangor Peat Swamp Forest comprises Raja Musa Forest Reserve, Sungai Karang Forest Reserve, Sungai Dusun Wildlife Reserve and part of Bukit Belata Forest Reserve Extension, and overall covers an area of 81,304 ha. The central area of the reserve is secondary mixed forest; the majority of the area was selectively logged from the 19th century up until the 1980s, and a significant area of the northern edge of the reserve has already undergone oil palm conversion (Kumari, 1996). Four stages or classes of land conversion were identified (forest, drained forest, young oil palm plantation and mature oil palm plantation), and five replicate study sites were sampled in each class (Figs. 1 and 2). The forest sites chosen for this study had not been subject to logging for approximately 40 years; as a result the forest sites were in areas of high canopy density (trees >25 m, canopy coverage >80%) (Global Environment Centre, 2014). Drained sites comprised a similar forest structure but large drainage ditches (2–3 m wide and ca. 2 m deep) had been dug every few hundred meters, 6 months prior to field work, thus lowering the water-table. Secondary mixed forest and drained sites contained trees such as: Macaranga pruinosa, Campnosperma coriaceum, Blumeodendron tokbrai, Shorea platycarpa, Parar tocarpus venenosus, Ixora grandiflora, Pterannandra galeata; ferns: Stenochlaena palustris, Asplenium longissimum, Nephrolepis biserrata; palm: Cytrostachys sp.; sedges: Cyperus rotundus and abundant stands of Pandanus atrocarpus (Yule and Gomez, 2009).

Recently planted young oil palm sites, where both artificial lowering of the water-table (drainage) and deforestation had occurred were chosen for sampling. Oil palm seedlings were planted 6 months prior to sampling. The final sites chosen were mature oil palm, where the oil palm trees were first generation and ca. 10–15 years old. Detailed site characteristics are summarised in Table 1.

2.2. Field sampling

In total, twenty 900 m² (30 m by 30 m) field plots were marked out (five plots in each of the four land conversion stages). Forest and mature oil palm areas were located widely around the North Selangor Peat Swamp Forest to maximise spatial distribution, though access constraints and challenging terrain also influenced final locations. Drained and young oil palm plantation sites were constrained to two main representative areas. Sample points were selected randomly within plots using random number tables to determine direction and distance from the south west corner of the plot. GPS coordinates were recorded for each corner and are provided in Tonks et al., 2017.

In each of the plots, we took three peat samples from depths 0–5 cm and 50–55 cm that covered mostly oxic and anoxic conditions respectively. We extracted samples using a side-filling Russian Peat Corer (Van Walt, UK), with a 50 cm long sampling chamber. Immediately following extraction, we bagged and sealed the peat samples to avoid moisture loss.

2.3. Laboratory incubations

Samples were transported from North Selangor, Malaysia to University of Nottingham, UK and frozen until analysis to avoid decay during storage. At time of incubation, we removed the samples from the
freezer and left them to defrost in a cold room (4 °C) before sub-sampling and subsequent incubation of the peat samples under anaerobic conditions (i.e. simulating flooded conditions) at two temperatures: 25 and 30 °C. We acknowledge that the cold stage of the samples may have impacted on the original peat microbial community composition (Arnold et al., 2008; Lee et al., 2007; Verchot, 1999), however, we still expect the activity of the microbial community to be strongly controlled by the peat organic chemistry and incubation conditions.

Prior to incubation, 3 g of dry weight equivalent peat samples were placed in 125 ml serum bottles (80 in total) and flooded with 1 cm$^3$ of water. We flushed the serum bottles with nitrogen for 2 min to displace oxygen and create anaerobic conditions before sealing with a rubber septa (13 × 19 × 12 mm; Rubber B.V., Hilversum, NL), and an aluminium crimp top. Serum bottles were placed in either 25 °C or 30 °C temperature control rooms to replicate ambient and elevated soil conditions.
To allow the microbial community time to recover from disturbances (freezing/thawing and handling during preparation of the microcosm) we left the samples for 7 days. After that the serum bottles were opened to the air to dissipate accumulated headspace gases and then flushed with nitrogen for 2 min and re-sealed. Following another 7 days of incubation, headspace gas samples (5 mL) were collected weekly by syringe from each serum bottle and analysed immediately by gas chromatography (GC-2014, Shimadzu UK LTD, Milton Keynes, UK) over 4 weeks.

We analysed CO₂ and CH₄ concentration using a single injection system, with a 1 mL sample loop that passed the gas sample using N₂ gas against time. The GHG data was converted to mass per volume and mass of headspace (dm³)

Table 1  
Soil and site characteristics for sampling locations in North Selangor. Annual precipitation from January 2015–December 2015 represents regional values. Means ± one SEM.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Characteristics</th>
<th>Forest</th>
<th>Drained forest</th>
<th>Young oil palm</th>
<th>Mature oil palm</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>pH</td>
<td>3.4 ± 0.06</td>
<td>3.7 ± 0.06</td>
<td>3.7 ± 0.08</td>
<td>3.9 ± 0.08</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OM %</td>
<td>94.1 ± 1.3</td>
<td>88.8 ± 2.5</td>
<td>86.1 ± 5.93</td>
<td>77.3 ± 5.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moisture content (%)</td>
<td>62.3 ± 28</td>
<td>46.3 ± 22</td>
<td>33.9 ± 9</td>
<td>56.5 ± 21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C/N ratio</td>
<td>34.5 ± 2.7</td>
<td>28.2 ± 1.2</td>
<td>37.9 ± 4.0</td>
<td>29.1 ± 3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean annual precipitation (mm)</td>
<td>209.5 ± 34</td>
<td>209.5 ± 34</td>
<td>209.5 ± 34</td>
<td>209.5 ± 34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Water table depth (cm)</td>
<td>6.0 ± 22</td>
<td>-14 ± 23</td>
<td>-39 ± 15</td>
<td>-21 ± 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Shear strength (kPa)</td>
<td>8.4 ± 0.6</td>
<td>6.8 ± 0.9</td>
<td>7.8 ± 0.6</td>
<td>9.7 ± 0.6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\[ PV = nRT \]  
(1)

Where \( P \) is the atmospheric pressure (\( \approx 1 \) atm), \( V \) is the volume of headspace (dm³), \( n \) is the number of moles of gas, \( R \) is the ideal gas constant (0.08205746 L atm K⁻¹ mol⁻¹), and \( T \) is temperature (273.15 + room temperature in °C).

\[ E = \left( \frac{nm}{at} \right) \times 1000 \]  
(2)

where \( E \) is the flux of each gas (mg m⁻² h⁻¹), \( n \) is the number of moles (CO₂ or CH₄), \( m \) is the molar weight (CO₂: 44.01 and CH₄: 16.04), \( a \) is the area of soil core used and \( t \) is the time in the hour.

2.4. Rock-Eval 6 pyrolysis

Rock-Eval pyrolysis is a technique which has been used recently to trace bulk changes in organic matter composition and degree of composition (Dinsar et al., 2003; Newell et al., 2016). This technique predicts reliable soil C contents and is an appropriate and novel tool for assessing the vulnerability of SOC stocks (Saenger et al., 2013). For a more detailed description on Rock-Eval pyrolysis as applied to tropical peats see Upton et al. (2018) and Girkin et al. (2018).

Surface and subsurface peat samples were analysed using a Rock-Eval 6 analyser. Freeze-dried powdered peat samples (60 mg) were heated at 300 °C for 3 min before an increase in temperature to 650 °C at a rate of 25 °C per minute in an inert N₂ atmosphere. Residual carbon was subsequently oxidized from 300 °C to 850 °C at a rate of 20 °C per minute. The release of hydrocarbons during the two-stage pyrolysis process was detected by a flame ionization detector, with an infrared cell detecting the release of CO and CO₂ during the thermal cracking of the organic matter. Rock-Eval analysis generated a range of standard parameters including:

- S1, a measure of free hydrocarbons released on heating to 300 °C.
- S2, hydrocarbons released on the thermal cracking of organic matter for temperatures up to 850 °C.
- TpkS2 corresponds to the temperature when the maximum amount of hydrocarbons was released during pyrolysis.
- Total organic carbon (TOCORG) is calculated from the sum of the carbon moieties (HC, CO and CO₂).
- The Hydrogen Index (HI mg HC g⁻¹ TOC), a measure of hydrocarbons released relative to TOC, was calculated from S2 × 100 / TOCORG.
- The Oxygen Index (OI mg O₂ g⁻¹ TOC), corresponding to the amount of oxygen released as CO and CO₂ relative to TOCORG, was calculated from S3 × 100 / TOCORG.
- The labile, intermediate and passive C pools (Cl, Ci, and Cp, respectively) which correspond to the deconvolution of S2 pyrograms into six Gaussian signals (F1–F6) based on maximising R² coefficient values. F1–F6 values have previously been attributed to organic compounds of increasing complexity and recalcitrance (Dinsar et al., 2003; Sebag et al., 2006).
- F1–F2 signals represent high labile fresh plant material including simple polysaccharides, HC compounds are pyrolysed below 360 °C.
- F3 relates to increasingly humified macromolecules which are pyrolysed between 360 and 450 °C.
- F4–F6 signals can be attributed to the presence of highly mature and recalcitrant soil organic matter, or charcoal, where HC are pyrolysed above 450 °C.
- Cp represents the highly labile hydrocarbon compounds (F1 and F2), Ccl corresponds to the more stabilised soil carbon pool (F3), and Cc2 represents the highly recalcitrant passive pool (F4–F6) (Saenger et al., 2013).

2.5. Statistical analysis

Differences in Rock-Eval parameters and indices were assessed using linear mixed effects models fitted using Residual Maximum Likelihood (REML) to account for variable dependence between sampling plots. Conversion class and depth were selected as fixed effects and sites as random effects. Fluxes of CH₄ and CO₂, proportion of carbon in Ccl, Ci and Cp, and total organic carbon were log-transformed to meet assumptions of normality and were also assessed using REML. Rock-Eval analysis provides multiple parameters, and to summarise these and to assess which were important in regulating GHG fluxes we used Principal Component Analysis (PCA), based on correlation matrices. All statistical analyses were conducted in GenStat (v17.07).

3. Results

Thermolabile hydrocarbons (S1 i.e. poorly stabilised SOC), which are released on heating at 300 °C, were significantly different between land uses in surface peats (F₃,₃₂ = 7.79, \( P < 0.001 \), Fig. 3a), with the highest concentrations measured at drained sites, followed by young oil palm, forest and mature oil palm. More recalcitrant hydrocarbons (S2 i.e. greater thermostable C) which are released between 300 and 650 °C are released relative to TOC, was calculated from S2 × 100 / TOCORG. TpkS2 provides an overall assessment of the energy of the C bonds of molecules, and can be interpreted as the amount of energy required for microorganisms to decompose SOM. TpkS2 showed an increase with land conversion towards oil palm plantations (F₃,₃₂ = 3.85,
p < 0.05, Fig. 3c). The lower TpkS2 values in forest and drained sites (403 and 416 °C respectively) are characteristic of the thermal breakdown of more labile polysaccharides and lignins. In contrast, values over 420 °C, as measured in young and mature oil palm sites (425 and 441 °C respectively), are typical of increasingly immature humic substances (Disnar et al., 2003). TOC was high and showed little variation between forest, drained and young oil palm sites (ranging from 45% to 47%); however, TOC was significantly lower in the mature oil palm sites with 37% (F<sub>3,32</sub> = 2.92, p < 0.05, Fig. 3d).

In surface peats, HI (i.e. the amount of hydrogen relative to the amount of organic carbon) decreased from 312 mg HC g<sup>-1</sup> TOC<sub>RE6</sub> at the drained sites to 252 mg HC g<sup>-1</sup> TOC<sub>RE6</sub> in mature oil palm sites (F<sub>3,32</sub> = 2.73, p = 0.060, Fig. 3e). OI (i.e. the amount of oxygen relative to the amount of organic carbon) increased from 180 mg O<sub>2</sub> g<sup>-1</sup> TOC<sub>RE6</sub> in the forest sites to 132 mg O<sub>2</sub> g<sup>-1</sup> TOC<sub>RE6</sub> in the recently planted sites (F<sub>3,32</sub> = 2.73, p = 0.060, Fig. 3f). In forest and drained sites, HI was higher in the subsurface compared to surface peats, and, similarly with OI, higher concentrations were measured in forest, drained and young oil palm sites in the subsurface peats (Fig. 3e & f).

In surface peats at forest, drained and recently planted sites, the labile carbon pool (C<sub<l</sub>) was the largest of the three pools, accounting for 69%, 61% and 50% respectively (Fig. 4a). In contrast, C<sub<l</sub> differed significantly in mature oil palm sites from the other land uses (F<sub>3,16</sub> = 3.41, p < 0.05, Fig. 4a) and accounted for only 15% of carbon. A similar trend was observed in subsurface peats in the C<sub<l</sub> pool, with a decrease in lability with conversion stages, although not significant (F<sub>3,16</sub> = 0.04, p = 0.84, Fig. 4b). The intermediate carbon pool (C<sub<i</sub>) varied significantly in surface peats (F<sub>3,16</sub> = 3.83, p < 0.05, Fig. 4a) with mature oil palms sites having the largest contribution in this pool of 67%. The passive pool (C<sub>p</sub>) differed significantly between sites in the...
surface peats ($F_{3,16} = 4.58, p < 0.05, \text{Fig. 4a}$) with the highest contribution at drained sites and the lowest in forest sites (29% and 5% respectively).

Peats incubated at 25 °C and 30 °C exhibited a significant declining trend in GHG fluxes with conversion in surface samples ($F_{3,16} = 9.4, p < 0.001, \text{Table 2, Fig. 5}$), with a similar pattern, although less pronounced, in subsurface peats (Fig. 5). Peats incubated at 30 °C had significantly higher CO$_2$ fluxes across all land uses ($F_{1,48} = 35.1, p < 0.001, \text{Table 2, Fig. 5a and b}$) when compared to peats incubated at 25 °C with the highest mean fluxes from forest peats, with an average of 5.2 μg g$^{-1}$ h$^{-1}$ from peats incubated at 25 °C and 9.1 μg g$^{-1}$ h$^{-1}$ from peats incubated at 30 °C.

CH$_4$ fluxes were significantly greater in forest and drained sites compared to both oil palm plantation ages in surface peats ($F_{3,16} = 9.4, p < 0.001, \text{Table 2, Fig. 5c and d}$), with diminishing difference in deeper peats from the young and mature oil palm sites.

The scores and loading of the first and second principal components accounted for most of the variance for surface and subsurface peats, 60% and 50% respectively. The surface peats (Fig. 6a & c) display clustering in each land use, demonstrating a difference in Rock-Eval parameters between sites, whereas in subsurface peats (Fig. 6b & d) there appears to be no clustering of parameters for each land use. In surface samples, mature oil palm sites are best described by TpkS2 and OI, whereas drained sites are predominantly separated by S1, S2 and C$_l$ parameters (Fig. 6c). CO$_2$ fluxes are regulated by TpkS2 in surface peat but by S2 and HI in subsurface peats; and in contrast, CH$_4$ fluxes are regulated by C$_i$ pool in subsurface peats (Fig. 6d).

4. Discussion

4.1. Depletion of labile substrates with conversion to oil palm plantation

Land conversion resulted in a reduction in the labile carbon pool, which is highly available to the peat microbial community. Conversion from forest to mature oil palm resulted in a labile carbon pool reduction from ca. 70% to < 20%, with an accompanying increase in the intermediate carbon pool (from ca. 20 to 70%) in surface peat (Fig. 4). This supports the first hypothesis, which predicted that losses of labile carbon with land conversion would be most pronounced in surface peat. Depletion of labile carbon pools and a relative build-up of more recalcitrant carbon in surface peat is in line with selective depletion of carbohydrates and decreasing carbohydrate to aromatics ratios and peat loss following land conversion demonstrated at these and other sites in Southeast Asia (Matysek et al., 2017; Tonks et al., 2017). This is further supported by the greater thermal stability of the surface peat at the mature oil palm sites than forested and drained forested sites (Fig. 6a and c), which previously have been linked to peat degradation in tropical peatlands in Panama (Upton et al., 2018).

Table 2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>CO$_2$</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th>CH$_4$</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F-statistic</td>
<td>d.f.</td>
<td>p</td>
<td>SED</td>
<td>F-statistic</td>
<td>d.f.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land use</td>
<td>9.4</td>
<td>3,16</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>5.17</td>
<td>3,16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depth</td>
<td>63.7</td>
<td>1,48</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>37.57</td>
<td>1,48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Temp</td>
<td>35.1</td>
<td>1,48</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>12.75</td>
<td>1,48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land use × Depth</td>
<td>8.28</td>
<td>3,48</td>
<td>&lt;0.001</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>9.10</td>
<td>3,48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land use × Temp</td>
<td>0.18</td>
<td>3,48</td>
<td>0.909</td>
<td>0.02</td>
<td>0.33</td>
<td>3,48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Depth × Temp</td>
<td>3.05</td>
<td>1,48</td>
<td>0.087</td>
<td>0.01</td>
<td>6.53</td>
<td>1,48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Land use × Depth × Temp</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>3,48</td>
<td>0.623</td>
<td>0.03</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>3,48</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Significant differences in italics.
The changes in peat organic chemistry are linked to two main processes. First, lowered water-tables increase the oxygenation of the peat surface layer and enhance the degradation of organic polymers by bacteria and fungi (Couwenberg et al., 2010). The different responses between the surface and deeper peats to land use change in this study clearly demonstrate the impact of the long-term position of the water-table in peat, with the loss of labile carbon above the water-table and the preservation of significant quantities of labile organic material below the water-table.

Second, the shift in the vegetation litter inputs following conversion will also strongly impact on the relative abundance of the different carbon pools. In PSF, the vegetation adds carbon to the peat surface as litter and into the peat from the rhizosphere (Girkin et al., 2018b & 2018c), and thus contributes to maintenance of the peat carbon stores by compensating for carbon losses that result from concurrent decomposition (Jaunialinen et al., 2016). Little or no such inputs occur when sites are fully converted. Peat swamp forest litter is composed largely of coarse and fine roots, woody debris and leaf litter, and is rich in both cellulosic and more complex ligninoid substrates (Hoyos-Santillan et al., 2016; Miyajima et al., 1997). However, as lignin is resistant to decomposition and ligninolytic microbes are obligate aerobes, the amount of cellulosic substrates decrease as peat decomposition advances even under anoxic condition, explaining the depletion of labile carbon with depth even at the forest sites (Hoyos-Santillan et al., 2016). Taken together it is clear that the lowered water tables and reduced quality and quantity of litter inputs associated with land conversion strongly alters the peat organic chemistry as labile organic matter are depleted through greater decomposition processes and not replenished through fresh litter inputs.

4.2. Linking CO₂ and CH₄ fluxes and organic matter properties

As expected, potential CO₂ production from flooded peat was several orders of magnitude higher than CH₄ production, as shown previously in both disturbed and natural tropical wetlands (IPCC, 2014; Hoyos-Santillan et al., 2016), with fluxes of similar magnitude but slightly lower than those from pristine Neotropical peatlands (Sjögersten et al., 2018). Furthermore, emissions were consistently higher in surface peats suggesting these have greater production potential than degraded subsurface peats, likely reflecting substrate limitation of microbial decomposition processes with depth (Hoyos-Santillan et al., 2016; Sihi et al., 2018; Upton et al., 2018; Wright et al., 2011); though other factors may also play a role, e.g. shifts in the microbial community structure with depth in response to changes in peat properties (Jackson et al., 2009).

The successive reduction in ex situ CO₂ and CH₄ fluxes from waterlogged peat with progressively more advanced land conversion stages, together with the parallel depletion of labile carbon in surface peat (Fig. 5), suggests that the labile carbon pools strongly control GHG emissions in line with the second hypothesis which predicted that “ex situ anaerobic CO₂ and CH₄ production will be lower in the later stages of land conversion to oil palm plantation as a result of depletion of labile carbon”. Similar strong links between GHG fluxes from peats under anaerobic conditions and peat organic chemistry have previously been shown for undisturbed peatlands (Wright et al., 2011; Hoyos-Santillan et al., 2016), with greater fluxes found from peat with larger labile carbon pools. In contrast, no changes in GHG production were found with land conversion from the deeper peats, which is likely due to limited impacts of land conversion on decomposition in the peat that remained below the water-table even after drainage.

These findings clearly demonstrate that the loss of peat due to enhanced decomposition following conversion results in more recalcitrant peat which limits GHG emissions under waterlogged conditions. However, it is important to note that this substrate limitation of GHG emissions is most likely controlled by the anaerobic conditions which limit the microbial communities’ capacity to utilise more complex organic molecules (e.g. lignin and humic substances). Under aerobic conditions, CO₂ fluxes would likely remain high across the conversion gradient as has been shown in situ in peatlands in South Selangor, Malaysia (Matysek et al., 2017), as the oxygen availability supports the activity of microbial communities capable of degradation of complex organic molecules (Hoyos-Santillan et al., 2016).
The relatively lower fluxes of both CO₂ and especially CH₄ from the mature oil palm sites suggest that although re-flooding of oil palm plantations may result in some CH₄ emissions in line with Jauhiainen et al. (2016), raising water-tables will not increase CH₄ emissions to the levels of those found in intact PSFs in the short term. Limited increases in CH₄ production following rewetting of peats that have been exposed to prolonged periods of oxic conditions has been reported previously from high latitude peatlands (Sjögersten et al., 2016) as well as tropical peatlands (Jauhiainen et al., 2008, 2016). This is likely linked to slow recovery of the methanogenic communities from oxic peat conditions. Indeed, functional shifts in microbial community composition, e.g. decline in macro fungi abundance, in response to conversion of PSF to oil palm plantations, as has been shown previously at these sites (Shuhabad et al., 2017), suggests that strong impacts of land conversion should be expected on the microbially mediated decomposition processes. In the longer term, microbial communities and pools of labile substrates may recover if water-tables are raised and the native vegetation reintroduced (Jauhiainen et al., 2008; Jauhiainen et al., 2016). As peat swamp forests have higher percentage canopy cover, denser canopy closure (Yule and Gomez, 2009) and greater litter inputs than oil palm plantations (Guillaume et al., 2015), restoring peat swamp forests would likely increase pools of labile organic matter in surface peats which could shift microbial community functionality towards its original form (Nurulita et al., 2016). However, replacing the organic matter lost via rapid decomposition during the conversion would only recover slowly as the NPP of tropical peat swamp forests are low (ca. 1200 g C m⁻² yr⁻¹) when compared to the CO₂/C stock loss rates reported from recently drained oil palm plantations (Couwenberg et al., 2010; Matysek et al., 2017; Sjögersten et al., 2014).

4.3. Impact of temperature on surface and subsurface fluxes

The strong impact of temperature on both anaerobic CO₂ and CH₄ fluxes suggests that their production is highly sensitive to higher temperatures in line with findings from tropical peatlands in Panama (Sjögersten et al., 2018). The anaerobic CO₂ fluxes were consistently higher at 30°C than 25°C across depths and land conversion stages suggesting that the microbial community was temperature limited. The substantial increase in anaerobic CO₂ fluxes at the forest and drained sites at the 30°C treatment indicate that the large labile C pool at these sites (Fig. 4.) supports high CO₂ emissions at the 30 °C treatment indicate that the large labile C pool at all sites with high labile carbon supplies (forest) but also from sites dominated by degraded organic matter (oil palm plantations) during periods of high water tables.

Acknowledgements

We thank the Royal Geographical Society (with IBG) for funding this project through the Ralph Brown expedition award (to PA), with additional support from the University of Nottingham (RBEA0414RGS112250). We are very grateful to the Selangor State Forestry Department for granting forest reserve access and in providing field ranger support (including Mr. Mohd Rosli B. Md Kadim (Rosli), Mr. Sabaruddin Mohd Shahid (Din) and the rest of the team at Raja Musa and Sungai Karang Forestry Offices) as a follow-up to the 2013 Biodiversity Expedition organized in association with Malaysia Nature Society; and also to staff at the Global Environment Centre, Selangor. We are thankful to Dr. Mohd Puat B. Dahalan for facilitating the research and we also thank PKPS Agricultural Development Corporation for granting site access.

References


