

# LJMU Research Online

Champ, FM, Nesti, MS, Ronkainen, NJ, Tod, DA and Littlewood, MA

An Exploration of the Experiences of Elite Youth Footballers: The Impact of Organizational Culture

http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/id/eprint/13039/

Article

**Citation** (please note it is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from this work)

Champ, FM, Nesti, MS, Ronkainen, NJ, Tod, DA and Littlewood, MA (2018) An Exploration of the Experiences of Elite Youth Footballers: The Impact of Organizational Culture. Journal of Applied Sport Psychology, 32 (2). pp. 146-167. ISSN 1041-3200

LJMU has developed LJMU Research Online for users to access the research output of the University more effectively. Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Users may download and/or print one copy of any article(s) in LJMU Research Online to facilitate their private study or for non-commercial research. You may not engage in further distribution of the material or use it for any profit-making activities or any commercial gain.

The version presented here may differ from the published version or from the version of the record. Please see the repository URL above for details on accessing the published version and note that access may require a subscription.

For more information please contact <a href="mailto:researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk">researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk</a>

http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/

1	An Exploration of the Experiences of Elite Youth Footballers:
2	The Impact of Organisational Culture
3	Francesca M. Champ
4	University of Central Lancashire, Liverpool John Moores University
5	Mark S. Nesti
6	Liverpool John Moores University
7	Noora J. Ronkainen
8	Liverpool John Moores University
9	David A. Tod
10	Liverpool John Moores University
11	Martin A. Littlewood
12	Liverpool John Moores University
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	

22

### Abstract

The present study explored how the organisational cultural experiences of elite youth 23 footballers shaped their identity development and behaviour. The first author occupied the 24 25 position of sport psychology practitioner-researcher within one professional football club over a 3-year duration. Traditional ethnographic research methods were employed, including; 26 observations, field notes, reflections, and informal interviews. A Cultural Sport Psychology 27 (CSP) perspective on identity as a social construction, and research on the cultural 28 characteristics of professional football were used as frameworks to make sense of the data. 29 30 Despite the introduction of the Elite Player Performance Plan (EPPP) in 2012, the traditional masculine culture of professional football dominated the studied club. Creative non-fiction 31 vignettes revealed that youth players were encouraged to develop their self-stories focused on 32 33 a single-minded dedication to professional football. The limited identity-related resources offered at both club, and cultural level is detrimental for players in terms of their well-being, 34 and long term psychological development. From the results of this study, we suggest that future 35 sports psychology practice within professional football may best be delivered at an 36 organisational level. However, in order for a sport psychologist to be effective in this role they 37 must develop an understanding of the sub-cultural features and characteristics of the 38 organisation. In line with this, there would be great value in introducing a focus on 39 organisational culture within sport psychology professional training and education routes. 40

41

42 football

43

44

45

2

Keywords: cultural sport psychology, identity, psychological development, youth,

46

An Exploration of the Experiences of Elite Youth Footballers:

47

# The Impact of Organisational Culture

A number of researchers (e.g., Cushion & Jones, 2006; Kelly & Waddington, 2006; 48 Nesti, 2010; Parker, 1995; Roderick, 2006) have highlighted the highly competitive and 49 masculine culture of professional football, and its potential to influence the experiences of 50 players who operate within this social context. In this paper, we define organisational culture 51 as a 'glue' (Dowling, 1993) that binds together organisational members, history, and material 52 artefacts (e.g. logo, artefacts), and brings them towards a common purpose (Hatch & Schultz, 53 1997). The dominance of hegemonic constructions of masculinity within the organisational 54 culture of professional football (Parker, 1995; Roderick, 2006) is demonstrated by players' 55 displays of rigid hierarchical narratives of what constitutes a "real man" in terms of who can 56 57 withstand the most physical and emotional pain, and who can best keep their personal feelings to themselves (Smith & Sparkes, 2009). 58

59 Sport psychology scholars have noted that these environmental characteristics might not be conducive to the healthy psychological development and identity formation of youth 60 players as they progress in their developmental pathway within a professional football club 61 (e.g., Knapp, 2014; Mitchell, Nesti, Richardson, Midgley, Eubank, & Littlewood, 2014). Each 62 year, over 1000 boys are contracted to a professional football academy between the ages of 9 63 and 16 in England. In spite of this, very few boys will succeed in ever attaining a professional 64 contract. In fact, Anderson and Miller (2011) stated that only 10% of academy players who 65 receive a youth scholarship aged 16 will be successful in attaining a professional contract at 66 67 the age of 18. Despite such low statistical chances of success, most of these boys are constructing their lives solely within professional football (Brown & Potrac, 2009). Such 68 foreclosure at this formative time when adolescents should be engaging in developmental tasks 69

of exploring their identities and possibilities in life has the potential to bring long-standing
consequences to their development and well-being. A number of studies exploring athlete
identity and career transitions have showcased the processes of identity narrowing, and its
negative consequences for athlete well-being if they get deselected or injured (Bruner, MunroeChandler, & Spink, 2008; Gordon & Lavallee, 2011; Stambulova, Alfermann, Statler & Cote,
2009; Wylleman, Alfermann, & Lavallee, 2004).

76 Sports psychology researchers have used traditional research methods (e.g., semistructured interviews, questionnaires) to explore some of the psychological challenges that 77 78 young players may face as they progress within a football academy (Mills, Butt, Maynard, & Harwood, 2012; Reeves, Nicholls, & McKenna, 2009). Although these have certain merits (e.g. 79 interactive, allow for probing, controlled answering order (Weiss, 1994)), and have been useful 80 81 in identifying a range of potential stressors, researchers have not yet explored the impact of the professional football culture on the psychological development of youth players from the 82 position of an insider (Maitland et al., 2015). Insider research is conducted within an 83 organisation where the researcher is also a member (Greene, 2014), and can be beneficial in 84 deepening our understanding of the experiential realities of youth players embedded in these 85 environments by allowing us to "understand the cognitive, emotional and/or psychological 86 precepts of participants as well as possess a more profound knowledge of the historical and 87 practical happenings of the field" (Chavez, 2008, p.481). 88

To summarise, the psychological development and identity formation of elite youth footballers has largely been unexplored over a longitudinal time frame. Furthermore, there is limited research from sports psychology practitioners who have actually explored this social context from the position of an insider (Nesti, 2010). The longitudinal observation of the participating organisation in their natural setting will allow for a deeper understanding of key stakeholders natural actions and behaviours (Patton, 2005).

95 The current paper addresses this specific gap in the literature, and employed insider ethnographic research principles across three footballing seasons to attain a more holistic 96 understanding of the challenges faced by youth footballers. Unlike cross-sectional studies, and 97 98 one off interviews, this study has the potential to provide insight into the processes of identity development over a long period of time (Atkinson & Hammersley, 1994). The in-depth analysis 99 100 of extensive fieldwork can allow for developing a deeper understanding of the daily experiences of youth players and their potential implications for identity development. This 101 kind of holistic understanding of players lived realities is necessary for developing culturally 102 103 informed and effective applied sport psychology services. Secondly, it will enhance sports psychology practitioners awareness of the unique socio-cultural challenges that players must 104 successfully navigate if they are to 'make it' as a professional footballer. Our aim is to address 105 106 the following research objectives:

To examine the organisational cultural experiences of elite youth footballers as they
 progress within one professional football club over three full seasons

109 2. To gain an understanding of how elite youth footballers' experiences within the110 professional football culture influences their identity development and behaviour

### 111 Theoretical approach

One way to extend understandings of youth player identity development within professional football is to use a cultural sport psychology (CSP) lens (Ryba & Wright, 2010). In the last decade, sport psychology researchers have focussed attention onto the topic of culture with the aim of developing a more contextualised understanding of marginalised voices and identities (see McGannon, Curtin, Schinke, & Schweinbenz, 2012). More specifically, CSP highlights the self-identity as *simultaneously* social and cultural, rather than reducing them to isolated mechanisms within the mind, as with mainstream approaches in sport psychology (see

119 McGannon & Smith, 2015). Grounded in social constructionism, CSP centralises language, narrative, and discourse in the construction of self-identities (Douglas & Carless, 2009; 120 McGannon & Smith, 2015). In this paper, we define identity as particular form of social 121 122 representation that represents the relationship between the individual and others (Chryssochoou, 2003). Using cultural sport psychology allows us to advocate for an 123 exploration of youth player identity as a socio-cultural construction (McGannon et al., 2012). 124 Within this framework, youth player identity is regarded as the product of individual, social, 125 and cultural narratives intertwined (McGannon et al., 2012). Conceptualising youth player 126 127 identity in this way allows for novel insights into the influence of the professional football culture on player identity and behaviour. 128

129

### Method

130 In the last decade, ethnography has been increasingly used as a research method in sport (Cushion & Jones, 2006; DeRond, 2008). We adopted this approach because it was the most 131 appropriate method to answer the research questions. Tedlock (2000) suggested that "by 132 entering into close and relatively prolonged interactions with people... in their everyday lives, 133 ethnographers can better understand the beliefs, motivations, and behaviours of their subjects 134 135 than they can by using any other approach" (p.456). Closely aligned with this is the notion that ethnography is inductive, accepts that there are multiple ways of both seeing and interpreting 136 things, and acknowledges the influence of the researcher on the research process (Atkinson & 137 Hammersley, 1994). In this way, ethnography aligns with the cultural tenets of CSP in 138 advocating a view of knowledge as situated and theory-laden, and open to alternative 139 interpretations (McGannon & Smith, 2015). The use of ethnography in this study by an applied 140 practitioner provides an emic view (i.e., that of a cultural insider) on the experiences of elite 141 youth footballers, and opens up new avenues for consideration (Krane & Baird, 2005). More 142 specifically, I (first author) used ethnographic methods to contextualise a series of highly 143

personalised stories, and convey lived experiences relating to the tellers' personal and cultural understandings (Richardson, 2000). In the following sections, the plural (we) is used to signify the research team whereas the singular form (I) relates to the first author. The aim of using first person voice is to evoke an emotional response from the reader by creating an intimate connection between themselves and the authors.

# 149 *Philosophical underpinning*

150 This research is situated within CSP genre and thus within a social constructionist, interpretive paradigm. Within a social constructionist perspective (Atkinson & Hammersley, 151 1994), meaning is derived from interpretation, and knowledge is only considered significant in 152 so far as it is meaningful (Smith & McGannon, 2017). Furthermore, the methodological 153 perspective was underpinned by a relativist ontology (a belief that there are multiple social 154 realities), a subjectivist epistemology (knowledge is created through social interaction) and a 155 naturalistic set of methodological procedures (data collection occurs in the world of the 156 participants) (Cornbleth, 1990). 157

# 158 Biographical positioning

I did not purport to approach the field setting as a blank slate, or from an objective 159 position, instead I brought a number of identities to the field. More specifically, these 'selves' 160 were a researcher based self, a self who was a sport psychology practitioner, a self who was a 161 female, a student, an early career practitioner, and a passionate football fan. Furthermore, I 162 come from a footballing family; some of whom were successful in having a professional 163 football career, and others fell at the final hurdle before attaining a professional contract. I 164 acknowledge that these identities will have influenced what I observed within the professional 165 football club, how I felt about what I experienced in the club, and what I have reported in this 166 study (Cornbleth, 1990). For example, observing the long-term impact of the professional 167

football culture on the psychological development of close family members left me with a number of pre-determined beliefs and ideas before I entered the organisation (e.g. ruthless approach to players deemed not good enough). Because of this, I was drawn to those individuals who I observed to be isolated from their teammates, and categorised by staff as 'psychologically weak'.

# 173 Participants

For the purposes of the study, we have chosen to represent the participating organisation 174 using the pseudonym 'Burrington City FC'. Burrington City FC is a medium sized club that 175 has been in existence for over 100 years. In excess of 50 support staff (aged 22-60) are 176 contracted to work with academy players in the U9-U23 age groups occupying a range of roles 177 (e.g. coaching staff, education team, scouting team). I interacted with a number of these 178 179 individuals on a daily basis, for example the coaching department, the department of science and medicine, and the education officers. However, other than the club chef, I was the only 180 female employed by Burrington City FC based at the training ground. Like many other clubs, 181 Burrington City FC has seen better days financially and remains reliant on the successful 182 development, and subsequent sale of academy players to survive. Despite this, the club is still 183 one of the 92 UK teams currently in the English Football League, and takes great pride in the 184 academy set up and its record of producing players that go on to play at the highest professional 185 level. 186

### 187 Developing the ethnography

Once access is gained, ethnography enables the researcher to embed himself or herself within the cultural practice as an insider, and observe the daily working practices of an organisation over a prolonged period of time (Atkinson & Hammersley, 1994). This engagement often lasts for several months, but can take place over a number of years (Krane

192 & Baird, 2005). In this study, I was familiar with Burrington City FC prior to taking on the role as practitioner-researcher. More specifically, I was granted access for the completion of an 193 MSc sport psychology placement in the season beforehand. The successful completion of this 194 195 placement resulted in me being offered a dual role as a practitioner-researcher embedded within the culture of study for a further 3 years. More specifically, I was responsible for the delivery 196 of psychological support to academy footballers and support staff within one professional 197 football club 3 days per week. Methods of support included; individual support sessions, group 198 workshops, stakeholder education, and pitch based delivery. My philosophy of practice was 199 200 embedded within a holistic humanistic consulting approach (Friesen & Orlick, 2010). I felt that this approach was appropriate for the individuals that I was working with, as they ranged from 201 12 to 23 years of age, and many were yet to attain a senior professional contract. Therefore, 202 203 these young athletes were in a vulnerable position in that their youth contract could have been terminated at any time, and their affiliation with the club would in that case be terminated. I 204 felt that adopting a humanistic consulting philosophy over a longitudinal period helped me to 205 206 develop strong and trusting relationships with these youth players. My role within the organisation changed and progressed over time. The organisational chaos (Galbraith, 2004) 207 experienced by the organisation as a function of staff turnover meant that I was required to 208 deliver aspects of organisational psychology. For example, I was required to manage delicate 209 and challenging relationships between different stakeholders, and departments. 210

Occupying a dual role as a practitioner-researcher was a key feature of the research. Krane and Baird (2005) highlighted the benefits of a research method where the researcher is embedded within an organisation. They suggested that doing ethnography allows us to truly hear the voices of coaches, athletes, and practitioners, and therefore will deepen our understanding of their experiences. However, the challenge for the researcher here is how to make sense of, and create meaning in this world. Wittgenstein (1953) believed that we cannot

learn a language or understand how a social group communicates unless we take part in the
form of life in which the language is used. Therefore, by spending a prolonged period of time
within an organisation the researcher becomes "saturated with first-hand knowledge of the
setting" (Morrill & Fine, 1997, p.435). This has particular relevance for the present research
given the culturally endemic feature of language and banter in professional football, which
often outsiders may fail to understand or recognise (Parker, 1995).

### 223 Data Collection

I collected the data using a variety of methods often employed in ethnographic research 224 including; observations, reflections, informal interviews, and field notes (Kahan, 1999). I 225 observed players and staff within the academy set up of Burrington City FC from September 226 2014 to May 2017; during this time, three full playing seasons and three preseasons were 227 228 completed. In total, I spent over 3000 hours within the professional football club, and accumulated over 300 pages of field notes within the reflective log. The purpose of the 229 observations was to develop an understanding of the setting and culture, interactions and 230 activities that took place within the setting, the people who took part in the activities, and the 231 meaning of what was observed from the perspective of those who were being observed 232 233 (Lofland & Lofland, 1984). Initially, the data collection phase had a broad focus on deepening our knowledge and understanding of the world that I was embedded within. However, as the 234 doctoral project progressed it became clear that the professional football culture had a 235 significant impact on the development and behaviour of individuals within the organisation, 236 consequently the impact of this on the psychological development of players became a focal 237 point. 238

Based on the events that I had observed within Burrington City FC, I completed field notes in a reflective journal after each occasion I was present in the club (Atkinson &

241 Hammersley, 1994). We chose not use a separate research log and reflective journal, rather we used the reflective journal to document both the field notes, and personal reflections (Ortlipp, 242 2008). The purpose of combining both the field notes, and the researcher's reflections was to 243 use the field notes to facilitate critical reflection (Maharaj, 2016). By having these situated 244 together, I could return to particular events, and reflect on the continued impact. In line with 245 Bogdan and Biklen (1982) my reflexive journal was both descriptive, and reflective. The field 246 notes were descriptive, dated, and recorded key details. Following each field note entry, I added 247 my own reflections using the connotation RC (Reflective Comments); these contained my 248 249 interpretations of the day's events from the perspective of both a sport psychology practitioner, and a doctoral researcher. Engaging in this reflective process forced me to think about each 250 aspect of the day, and to explore how I understood their meaning. Furthermore, taking the time 251 252 to write about these events further engrained them into my memory, and provided an initial outlet for recording impressions and ideas before a more systematic analysis. 253

254

# 4 Data analysis and Representation

The first step of the data analysis was to extract the data documented in the field notes 255 and the reflective log. From the raw data, I conducted a social constructionist thematic analysis 256 257 (see Braun & Clarke, 2006). The initial grouping of the themes was inductive (Javadi & Zarea, 2016). More specifically, we used a subjective judgement of those events that related to the 258 impact of the professional football culture on the experiences of youth players (Schinke, 259 Papaioannou, & Shack, 2016). These events were plotted chronologically on a timeline that 260 represented the 3-year duration of the study (Kolar et al., 2015). The purpose of the timeline 261 was to create a visual representation of the data, and allow us to more clearly depict patterns in 262 the data. Sheridan, Chamberlain, and Dupuis (2011) suggested that timelines have particular 263 value for narrative forms of research in documenting, recording, and deepening our 264 understanding of our participant's experiences over time. In addition to this, the timeline was 265

used as a method to identify evolutions in the research over the 3-year study duration.
Following this, I then discussed the themes with my research team members, and re-read the
notes pertaining to each event to further engrain the data in my memory. Based on critical
discussion, I added notes to the timeline with the aim of identifying parallels and recurring
events. We then used a CSP perspective on identity as a social construction (McGannon &
Smith, 2015), and research on the cultural characteristics of professional football as
frameworks to make sense of the data.

In the final step, we developed a series of creative vignettes to illustrate key issues in 273 relation to identity development in youth players. The purpose of creative non-fiction is not to 274 make up the setting and events, rather to describe a situation as accurately as possible using the 275 techniques of fictional writing (e.g. composite characters, tone shifts) to create an evocative 276 277 and thought provoking text. For example, in our study we make use of composite characters, vernacular language, tone shifts, allusions, and metaphors. Blodgett et al. (2015) advocated the 278 use of vignettes as a research strategy that supports cultural praxis, that is research that aims to 279 increase cross-cultural understandings and deliver culturally informed services (Schinke et al., 280 2012, p.34). The content of the ethnographic creative non-fiction is grounded in the analysis of 281 over 3000 hours of observation, and dialogic exchanges with key stakeholders (e.g. players and 282 staff), which demonstrates significant embeddedness in the study environment. We represented 283 the research findings in the form of three stories, these were refined as the writing developed 284 285 to ensure that they faithfully represented the themes that had been identified (Smith, 2013). In addition to this, we used direct quotations from stakeholders that were documented in the 286 reflective log, but the manner in which the stories are presented was chosen to best represent 287 288 the themes, plots, and theoretical points generated from the data analysis (Smith, 2013). The vignettes that are presented in the following section each encompass the narrative of a different 289 individual within Burrington City FC. The aim of using creative non-fiction as a method of 290

data representation was to deepen our understanding of the holistic challenges faced by eliteyouth footballers in the professional football culture.

# 293 Research Quality and Methodological Rigour

Our approach to research quality was guided by Smith and McGannon (2017) who argued that 294 research quality is ground in member reflections, critical dialogue, and its contribution to 295 knowledge. More specifically, the researcher engaged in member reflections throughout the 296 research project. Member reflections involved sharing the research findings, and engaging in 297 dialogue with the members of the professional football club (Tracy, 2010) on appropriate 298 occasions during data collection (e.g. the end of each season). The aim of this was to explore 299 gaps in the results, and similarities shared concerning interpretations of the findings (Schinke 300 et al., 2016). These member reflections enhanced the credibility of the research by offering an 301 302 opportunity for collaboration, and reflexive elaboration, and allowed us (research team) to establish a greater understanding of the meaning that participants attached to events. In addition 303 to this, the member reflections informed the data analysis as they provided dialogue to add 304 further interpretation to the events that I had observed. This is reflected in the vignettes, where 305 direct quotations from individuals at the centre of the events are presented to demonstrate their 306 thoughts and feelings. Secondly, I engaged in a process of dialogue with 'critical friends' 307 (Morrow, 2005) following each season of my involvement with Burrington City FC. I 308 presented the raw data that had been collected during the season, and my interpretations of this 309 data. Following each presentation, we had a round table discussion, here research team 310 members challenged some of my interpretations, and encouraged me to examine the data 311 through multiple lenses (e.g. the perspective of different stakeholders within the organisation). 312 Finally, in line with Smith, McGannon, and Williams (2015), we hope that our research is 313 judged on whether it makes a meaningful contribution to the field of sport psychology. We aim 314

to show that this study deepens our knowledge and understanding of how professional footballcultures influence youth player psychological development.

## 317 *Ethical considerations*

Ethnographic researchers have highlighted some of the ethical challenges that arise as 318 a result of using ethnographic research methods (Atkinson & Hammersley, 1994; Brewer, 319 2000). For example, declaration of research intent, informed consent, and ensuring participant 320 confidentiality are some of the specific challenges for those occupying the position of insider 321 practitioner-researcher. In this study, ethical approval was sought from the relevant University 322 ethics board, and the concept of relational ethics (Ellis, 2007) was considered. The basic 323 premise of relational ethics is that ethical decisions are made within the context of the 324 researcher's relationship with the participant/s (Pollard, 2015). Confidentiality was assured for 325 326 all individuals within the study as no real names were included, and no information that may lead to the identification of any individual has been used (Brewer, 2000). However, occupying 327 a dual role as a practitioner-researcher within the organisation raised ambiguity regarding the 328 organisation's anonymity, as it may be possible for readers to identify the organisation of study 329 via other means. Although the issue of confidentiality was not raised by the participating 330 organisation, we decided that all information would be anonymized as far as possible, and I 331 understood my responsibility to act in the best interests of the participants at all times. More 332 333 specifically, I strived to act in a humane manner that aligned with the respect and connectedness 334 that I had developed for those in the organisation (Ellis, 2007), whilst also adhering to my role as a sport psychology researcher (Guillemin & Gillam, 2004). For example, we considered the 335 participants circumstances, and the potential implications of the published data on the 336 337 organisation, and those at the centre of each narrative. As a result of this, I ensured that the research objectives were made clear to the participants, and I consulted with stakeholders 338 (players and support staff) at different stages of the study (member reflections). 339

# 340 Methodological Reflections

The occupation of a dual role as an insider practitioner-researcher within Burrington City FC 341 presented a number of challenges. Firstly, I had to manage the time consuming and often 342 conflicting roles of a sport psychology practitioner, and a doctoral researcher. For example, 343 Burrington City FC placed a clear focus on my responsibility to provide psychological support 344 to the youth players. They argued that this was the role that would have a direct and 'immediate' 345 impact on the performance of the players. Consequently, I felt that my role as a researcher was 346 overlooked. In an attempt to overcome this challenge, I reminded the participants of the nature 347 of the study and the research objectives at appropriate stages of the data collection. Secondly, 348 being embedded within Burrington City FC for a longitudinal period meant that I had 349 developed deep connections with, and an emotional tie to some of the individuals within the 350 351 organisation. Therefore, I found it challenging to ensure that I took a step back from the organisation and explored the data from different lenses. It was through continual reflection 352 and discussions with the research team members that I learnt to manage my positioning on the 353 insider vs outsider continuum (Linbeck, 2001). Each of these challenges demonstrate the 354 importance of appropriate support networks (e.g. peers, critical friends, supervisory support) 355 in questioning, challenging, and ultimately supporting practitioner-researchers during data 356 collection and beyond. 357

358

# **Results and Discussion**

What follows are a series of three separate, but interrelated narratives that aim to illuminate the daily experiences of academy footballers within one professional football club over a 3-year time period of practitioner-researcher engagement. These narratives are connected in that they all explore the influence of the professional football culture on the

identity, development, and/or the consequent behavior of a youth player contracted toBurrington City FC.

# 365 'This lad hasn't got what it takes'

379

Burrington City FC is renowned for giving young players a chance at senior level. The following narrative explores the experiences of a second year scholar (Nathan) during his transition from the academy to the 1<sup>st</sup> team environment. Nathan was the stand out player for the U18 age group, and as a result of the 1<sup>st</sup> team's recent results and performances he had been granted his first ever senior (1<sup>st</sup> team) start for Burrington City FC.

371 *It didn't go to plan. Nathan was substituted at half time after making a mistake that led to the* 

372 *opposition scoring. He was replaced by an experienced professional, nearly twice his age.* 

On the Monday morning, Nathan reported to the training ground along with the rest of the 1<sup>st</sup> team squad. Ryan had called off training, instead they were going to watch the DVD from the weekend's game. Nathan took some hefty criticism during the DVD session, afterwards he left the video room head down. Two days later Nathan approached me, he mentioned what had happened in the DVD room, how embarrassed he was by the criticism he received, and how humiliated he felt. Nathan suggested that he trained worse than ever before today, his

confidence was shattered, and he was terrified of making a mistake.

He didn't start the next game, or the game after, and the week after that he was dropped from the squad completely. Nathan hadn't played a game of football in nearly a month, and was struggling to understand whether this was a punishment for his mistake, or if it was because he wasn't needed anymore. In an individual support session with Nathan he commented, "Everyone thinks it's all this cause your now with the 1<sup>st</sup> team, the coaches say it's such an amazing experience and how good it is for your career. But the truth is, I'm not playing any games. I get that I made the mistake, but they did not even give me time to make up for it, they 387 brought me off at half time and I've not had a chance since. If they don't think I'm good enough they should just tell me, I'd accept that. But I'm in no man's land right now". Nathan felt 388 rejected. He went on to explain that his transition to the 1<sup>st</sup> team environment was not only 389 390 hindering his footballing development; it was ruining his relationship with the other players in his own age group... "The lads don't sit with me anymore, they always give me the 'Ohh your 391 too big time (important) for us now', or 'shouldn't you sit with the pros'. I never asked for any 392 of this, and they don't seem to get that. The 1<sup>st</sup> team don't socialize with me, they think I'm a 393 kid, and now the U18s aren't the same with me. I'm not wanted by any age group, I wish I 394 395 could just go back to the U18s and be normal like the rest of them". It was clear that Nathan was affected by the comments of the others in his age group. Nathan's experiences continued 396 in this manner, and over the next couple of months he was in and out of the 1<sup>st</sup> team squad. 397 398 Although he was still training with the 1<sup>st</sup> team he had been playing some games back with the U18 age group. I sat with Nathan each week to discuss his experiences, his negativity was 399 overwhelming. Nathan could no longer see any positives in the situation he found himself in. 400 401 He was experiencing a number of psychological stressors, such as low self-belief, isolation, a dip in form, and career transition. Eventually, Ryan and Paul had decided that Nathan would 402 be better off transitioning back to the U18s full time. His reputation was tarnished amongst the 403 staff, and he now carried the label "that lad hasn't got what it takes". 404

405 Analysis

As a result of Nathan's transition to the 1<sup>st</sup> team, and eventually back down to the U18's again, he encountered a range of deep and negative emotions that resulted in him questioning his identity within Burrington City FC. The transition from youth to senior level has been highlighted within sport psychology as one that may pose a number of psychological challenges for the athlete to overcome, inclusive of the threat to an individual's identity (Cacija, 2008; Morris et al., 2016; Stambulova, Pehrson, & Olsson, 2017). Pummel, Harwood, and Lavallee

412 (2008) argued that the commitment and sacrifice required by athletes during the transition from youth to senior level might lead to narrowing of identity development which could have 413 adverse effects on their well-being later. Nathan's movement to the 1<sup>st</sup> team was unpredicted, 414 415 involuntary, and as a consequence of the environment that he found himself within. The cultural discourse used by staff at Burrington City FC about, and towards Nathan, demonstrated 416 their perceptions on the psychological characteristics (e.g. resilience, toughness, leadership, 417 masculinity) that youth players need in order to be successful. Given the cultural characteristics 418 of professional football (e.g., working class traditions, short-term contracts, and punishments 419 420 for failure), it is suggested that the challenges individuals face during the transition from youth to senior level within this particular social context may be greater than in some other sports 421 (Nesti, 2012). Although Nathan had not yet completed his scholarship, the story he constructed 422 about moving up to the 1<sup>st</sup> team environment was signified by a lack of social support, and 423 losing his sense of self-worth. 424

It has been suggested by Nesti and Littlewood (2011) that if a player is to successfully 425 navigate their way through the volatile, and ruthless football culture, they must possess a clear 426 sense of self, and be flexible to respond to the situations that they are exposed to. The 427 428 professional football culture had a significant and negative impact on Nathan's youth to senior transition. For example, coaches were ruthless when criticizing his performance in the video 429 430 room, and did not grant him a second opportunity to showcase his ability. The cultural 431 narratives and discourses surrounding 'the right kind of a character' acted as confirmation that he was not yet equipped with the psychological attributes to succeed at 1<sup>st</sup> team level (Blodgett, 432 Schinke, McGannon, & Fisher, 2015). Unable to align his personal experiences with the 433 434 dominant narrative Nathan's grew isolated within the organization, and his performance level and self-confidence dropped. 435

# 436 Here today, gone tomorrow: The experience of being sent on loan

437 Since the replacement of reserve teams with the U23 age group in football academies, it has become increasingly common for clubs to loan out players either before, or once they 438 attain a professional contract. The aim of this is to expose young individuals to senior football, 439 440 and explore whether they are ready for the transition from academy football to the so-called 'men's' game. Burrington City FC sent a number of U18 players on loan to local clubs for the 441 final few months of each season. The following story describes a second year scholar's 442 (Connor) loan experience, how he made sense of this experience. Connor signed for the club 443 when he was 10 years old, and based on my own observations, and discussions with other 444 445 stakeholders at Burrington City FC he was a confident, well liked and professional individual who had good relationships with both the players and coaches. 446

Connor was called into the U18 manager's office before the scholars were dismissed. Tony 447 448 (U18 manager) and Harry (U18 assistant manager) informed him that he was going on a 3month loan to Shackleton Town FC until the end of the football season. Connor was further 449 informed that his loan would begin the next day. However, as his loan club was non-league 450 (semi-professional), he would still be based at Burrington City FC on the days that he did not 451 train with Shackleton Town. In the first instance Connor didn't respond well, he couldn't 452 understand why he had been sent out on loan, and why he had been given less than a day's 453 notice. In an individual support session, Connor commented, "I play for the 23s nearly every 454 week, that's where I'll be next season if I get a pro. So shouldn't I be judged on how well I play 455 for them, not some dodgy non-league outfit?". I asked him to go away and think further about 456 the situation that he found himself in, and how he could turn it into a positive. A couple of days 457 later he returned to the club, with a more optimistic outlook on what lay ahead... "I spoke to 458 459 my dad about it last night, he said it's a good opportunity, they already know I've got the talent, it's just proving myself physically. The U18s games are too easy for me now, and I don't always 460 start for the U23s so I'll take it as it comes, and show em what I've got". In his first game, 461

Connor did exactly that and was rewarded with man of the match. On the Monday morning, 462 he reported to Burrington City FC. He walked tall, his shoulders broad; Connor was full of 463 energy, and enthusiastic to talk about his first game. In an individual support session, he spoke 464 about how welcoming the players were, and the positive praise he received from the manager. 465 *Connor had enjoyed the game and spoke as though Shackleton Town FC now meant something* 466 to him. Before he left he asked if I knew why he wasn't involved in the U23 squad for their 467 game that afternoon, but before I had chance to answer he spoke again "It's probably because 468 they want me to rest up after Saturday, maybe they thought the physical side of the game would 469 470 take it out of me". Connor then left the room and high fived one of the other scholars in the 471 gym.

Despite Connor's 'man of the match' winning performance in his first game for Shackleton 472 Town FC, he failed to start any of their next three games. In addition to this, he had not been 473 a part of any of the U23 squads since his loan spell began. Concerned about what the staff at 474 Burrington City's thoughts were, Connor approached Shackleton Town FC's manager to 475 better understand why he had lost his starting position. He was informed that the club's other 476 right back; an old experienced professional had threatened to leave if "a young kid" started 477 in his position. The Shackleton Town FC manager explained to Connor that unless this player 478 had a 'howler' (very poor game) Connor would not be granted a start. Connor was angry, he 479 480 decided to speak to Tony and explain the situation he found himself in. Tony's response only 481 served to increase the anger further "That's men's football for you, it's a good learning experience, you've got to wait for your chance, and then take it". Connor didn't agree with 482 this, although he didn't dare say that to the manager. He believed that the writing was on the 483 484 wall, his time at Burrington City FC was coming to an end, and without game time he couldn't influence their decision. He continued "the other lads laugh at me; they think it's a joke that 485 I'm not starting. The other day Bruiser (youth team scholar) threw all my kit in the pool before 486

training, when I asked him why, he said, "well you won't be needing it much longer". This is 487 my career, and I've only got 3 weeks left. If I get released I will be fuming, no one has even 488 489 been to watch me, and the U23s gaffer (manager) ignores me. This isn't teaching me a lesson, 490 or helping me learn the game. I come here training and give 100%, I go and train with Shackleton town FC and do the same, but when it gets to the weekend no one cares. I doubt 491 they would even be bothered if I didn't turn up". In my consequent meetings with Connor, we 492 493 spoke very little about Burrington City FC and his loan experience. He mentioned a potential move to Scotland or America to continue pursuing his dream of becoming a professional 494 495 footballer. His focus was no longer on Burrington City FC, and by his own admission he was becoming more isolated from both his teammates and the rest of the organisation. His body 496 language had changed, he was slumped, he looked worn out, and carried himself as though he 497 had the weight of the world on his shoulders. A week later, an injury to one of the 1<sup>st</sup> team 498 players opened the door for him to start the last two U23 games of the season. Although lacking 499 500 in motivation, Connor noted that this was a nice way to finish, and looking back on his experiences over the last 8 years he didn't want his time at the club to end on a sour note. 501

Decision day arrived, the boys gathered in the changing rooms waiting to be called to their 502 fate. This was one of the biggest days of their lives; the last 10 years had all built up to this. 503 Today was the day that they would either achieve their dream and be given a professional 504 505 contract, or the day their world would come crashing down. The atmosphere in all areas of the 506 club was different. The players were quiet, nobody joked, and it was tense. The staff spoke about this being the worst day of the season, seeing the lads you have worked with for a number 507 of years leave the club in tears, their hopes and dreams crushed was not easy. Connor was 508 509 second to be told the news, and he was one of three players in his age group to be offered a professional contract. He now had a decision to make. Did he re-identify with the club, and 510 spend the next 12 months fighting for an extension to his contract despite the organisational 511

challenges that he had faced since being sent on loan, or did he leave, and explore his optionselsewhere.

514 Analysis

Given the time that Connor had spent as a part of Burrington City FC, I believed that 515 the club had a long standing and deep meaning to his self-concept (Kelman, 1958). Over his 8-516 year involvement with the club, Burrington City FC had grown to have a significant impact on 517 how Connor thought about, evaluated, and perceived himself (Baumeister, 1999). 518 Subsequently, it was evident that Connor had developed his identity within the dominant 519 narratives surrounding professional sport (Douglas & Carless, 2009). This was demonstrated 520 in an individual support session about his contract when he commented, "football is all I have 521 ever known, it is all I want to do". Given his tie with Burrington City FC over a significant 522 523 period of his life, and based on his self-stories we suggest that Connor was relying on a selfidentity constructed within the dominant narratives of this cultural context (Smith & 524 McGannon, 2017). As a result of this, the experience of a career transition posed a significant 525 threat to his sense of self. In an attempt to cope with the transition, Connor started to look for 526 ways in which he could identify with his new club (Shackleton Town FC). Connor began to 527 emphasise the importance of other avenues (e.g. university, other clubs); he spoke about his 528 time at Burrington City FC in the past tense, as though he believed it was over. This alternative 529 discourse might demonstrate that he was exploring his possibilities where to realise his football 530 career path outside this club (McGannon et al., 2012; Smith & Sparkes, 2009). 531

Those individuals who are enrolled on a youth scholarship within a professional football club have not yet secured a professional contract, and therefore have very little control over their career development both on a short-term and long-term basis (Roderick, 2006). Parker (1995) suggested that football managers hold all power over their players, and often use

536 the short-term nature of contracts to scare players into listening to any instructions that are given. When individuals fail to align their experiences with culturally dominant and desirable 537 identity positions, they may experience isolation, loneliness, and a lack of self-belief (Mitchell 538 539 et al., 2014). Nesti and Littlewood (2011) supported this suggestion, and noted that prior to attaining a professional contract individuals may engage in a range of measures to regain 540 control of their fate, and deal with the feelings of existential anxiety. Balancing these tensions, 541 and dealing with some of the other challenges that occur within the professional football culture 542 may have a detrimental effect on the identity formation and development of a youth player. 543 544 The lack of social support, and 'banter' (Parker, 1995) directed at or about individuals within the professional football club may also serve to increase the impact of culture on youth player 545 experiences. This is an example of the hegemonic masculinity scripts that young players use to 546 547 construct their identities within narrow cultural ideas of what it means to be a 'real man' (Smith & Sparkes, 2009). Gearing (1999) would suggest that this is not uncommon within professional 548 football clubs, where those who hold positions of power and influence use intimidating 549 550 methods of communication to highlight who is no longer valuable within the organization (Parker, 1995). Collinson (1988) supported this, and noted that the brutal jokes and direct 551 comments may signify rejection from the organization. Despite being subjected to discourses 552 that threatened the athletic identities that youth athletes have constructed, the cultural 553 environment also generally expects the players to mask over their true feelings and put on a 554 555 brave face (Gilbourne & Richardson, 2006). This illustrates how athletes need to continually perform an athletic identity, which aligns with notions of mental toughness and resilience 556 (Schinke et al., 2016). Youth players may behave, or act in a certain way to fit in with the 557 football narrative, and discourse as opposed to being authentic to their own values and beliefs 558 (Tibbert, Andersen, & Morris, 2015). 559

Finally, being offered a contract demonstrated how quickly fate can change in professional football. Nesti (2012) supported this, and noted that players often experience a number of positive and negative emotions during a season. Connor had experienced extremes of emotion over a period of only three months. The challenges that he faced were both personal, and interpersonal, and had influenced his personal and professional development and identity (Richardson *et al.*, 2004).

# 566 Power and influence: "You may as well go and sit in the stands mate"

At Burrington City FC it is common practice for first, and second year scholars to be 567 involved in the U23 squad during the football season. Primarily, this is for the coaches to attain 568 an understanding of those players who they believe will be capable of playing for the 1<sup>st</sup> team 569 in the future. Generally, the U23 fixtures are scheduled for a Monday, as this provides fringe 570 first team players and talented U18 players with the opportunity to attain extra game time 571 without interrupting the weekend schedule. At Burrington City FC, the players who were 572 involved in the U23 squad would be informed by text following the 1<sup>st</sup> team match on a 573 Saturday. The following story describes an event that occurred between a second year scholar 574 (Josh), and the U23 manager (Aiden) prior to kick off. 575

Monday morning arrived, and those players who were not involved in the U23 squad reported 576 for training. However, all of the second years were absent. They had each received a text from 577 Aiden, and were in the squad for the U23 game. Josh, and the rest of the second year scholars 578 were asked to report to the match stadium at 11.30am for a 1.00pm kick off. It is club policy 579 that staff, and U18 players watch all U23 home games. Therefore, half an hour before kickoff, 580 581 I set off from the training ground to head to the stadium with Alex, the youth team sports scientist. The players were out on the pitch warming up, but as I entered the stands to take a 582 seat I saw Josh sat there, head in his hands. "Josh, what you doing up there?" I asked. From 583

looking at his body language, I assumed he was ill. Josh quickly moved his hands, sat upright 584 and responded "Come up here a min and I'll explain". As I got closer to him, I noticed that 585 his face was a burning red; he spoke quietly to prevent anyone else from hearing. "I can't 586 believe what Aiden's just done, this place calls itself a football club, pfft" Josh was one of the 587 quieter members of the group, but he spoke with anger and passion. He explained that he 588 arrived at the ground as usual, and the squad had watched a pre-match video (DVD of the 589 590 oppositions last game) in the club lounge before entering the changing rooms. It was here that his ordeal began. As the players changed into their shorts and socks it became apparent that 591 592 there was one player too many. The U23 captain (Baldy) counted the players, there were 19. Match day squads should be made up of no more than 18, and therefore one player was going 593 to miss out. As Aiden entered the changing room, some of the more confident, older boys led 594 595 by Baldy informed Aiden of his mistake. Josh noted that the players were laughing and made 596 a rumbling noise as Aiden looked at each of the boys. In front of everyone, Aiden's eyes fixated on Josh, "Josh, you may as well go and sit in the stands mate! There's no point you being in 597 here if you're not in the squad anymore". Josh was left to pack away his boots to the sound of 598 laughter and cheering from the other players. He stated that he had been sat in the stands ever 599 since. As I was talking to Josh one of the head coaches, Jim turned up. He shouted over to Josh, 600 "OI, I thought you were in the squad", Josh replied, "No, Aiden got the numbers wrong". Jim 601 didn't comment, he just turned his head and continued his conversation. Josh moved to sit with 602 603 the rest of the U18 players. He never received an apology from Aiden, and the event was not mentioned again. The next month, Josh was released from Burrington City FC. 604

605 Analysis

Individuals signed to a professional football academy have been described as having to navigate their way through a 'school of tough knocks' (Roderick, 2006). Informing Josh in front of the rest of the players, and as bluntly as he did was a demonstration of the power

hierarchy that exists within this culture (Roderick, 2006), and influenced his self-identity. This 609 is supported by a social constructionist approach to self-identity, which centralizes the 610 influence of language in the construction of identity. This language clearly depicted whether 611 612 an individual was accepted, or rejected from the organization. In order to present himself as a 'footballer', Josh needed to perform an identity of someone who was not affected by the 613 situation he found himself in. This could be achieved by displaying behaviors that are 614 associated with that role (e.g. confirmation to those in positions of power, refusal to 615 demonstrate emotion). Josh had no option but to swallow his pride and listen to Aiden's 616 617 instructions.

The behavior of the other players further served to heighten the negativity of the 618 experience, and had a significant impact on how Josh constructed his identity. In line with the 619 620 suggestions of Kelly and Waddington (2006), Baldy and the other individuals were highlighting their position within the organisation, and used the situation as a psychological 621 test for Josh to see whether he would 'lose his head'. Further to this, such behaviors have been 622 highlighted as the traditional way within professional football for the older players to assess 623 whether younger players would be able to cope with the relentless and brutal 1<sup>st</sup> team 624 625 environment (Parker, 1995; Roderick, 2006). Professional football clubs are described by Gearing (1999) as total institutions, and therefore the other players in the age group may have 626 627 behaved in the way they did as a result of their own experiences and socialization (Goffman, 628 1959). However, the implications of this are concerning, in that they may prevent the healthy psychological transition from adolescence to adulthood (Gearing, 1999). In line with the 629 previous two vignettes, Josh had developed a narrow identity narrative that had been 630 631 constructed within the social context of Burrington City FC. Therefore, when he faced threats to this identity he found it difficult to find alternative narrative resources that could have helped 632 him in sustaining psychological well-being and navigating his way through these challenges. 633

However, we suggest that being excluded, or pushed out from a particular social group may
have a significant influence on a person's self-belief, and more importantly their perception of
'who they are' (Brougton & Neyer, 2001; Sparkes, 1998). Moments such as those experienced
by Josh often have a visible impact on an individual's identity, development, and consequent
behavior.

Josh was left questioning his self-worth and role within the organisation. He attempted 639 to find an explanation for the situation. However, those who Josh identified with (manger and 640 players) had demonstrated a lack of care towards his thoughts and feelings. This was a critical 641 moment for Josh, and invoked emotions of anger and rejection, demonstrated when I spoke to 642 him in the stands. For Josh, this narrative was a demonstration that he was not accepted at the 643 club (Tibbert et al., 2015). As noted in the previous analysis, de-selection is one of the most 644 645 commonly reported stressors within professional football (Finn & McKenna, 2010; Nesti & Littlewood, 2011; Nesti et al., 2012), and therefore Josh needed to appraise the situation and 646 figure out how he would cope going forward. Tibbert *et al.* (2015) suggested that the only way 647 to be successful would be to embrace the cultural norms and traditions of the club. Josh's 648 experience occurred only a small period before his contract was terminated, and therefore it 649 650 could be suggested that his experience on this day served as an indicator for what his future held with Burrington City FC. 651

652

### **General Discussion**

We explored player identity as a socio-cultural construction, and illustrated ways in which the dominant cultural narratives/ discourses shape how players understand themselves. Much of the previous research exploring the identity of young athletes (e.g., Gordon & Lavallee, 2011; Mitchell *et al.*, 2014; Nesti & Littlewood, 2011; Pummell, Harwood, & Lavallee, 2008) has used single semi-structured interviews, and relied on retrospective recall

658 for the data collection. This is limited in that the researcher has not observed the individual within the culture they exist, nor had the chance to develop a trusting relationship with them to 659 the same extent as can be achieved when using participant observation. Further to this, a range 660 661 of data collection methods (observation, field notes, and informal interviews) allowed for a more in-depth understanding of the psychological challenges faced by youth players, resulting 662 in the conclusion that youth players tend to construct their identities, and see their future 663 possibilities solely within the professional football context. This is concerning given the high 664 number of players who will eventually be released. Our suggestion supports previous findings 665 666 (e.g. Mitchell et al., 2015; Morris et al., 2016) and highlights the need for appropriate sport psychology support to be delivered at youth levels. Methodologically, this study contributes a 667 longitudinal perspective, where I was positioned within the professional football club, and 668 669 therefore understood the participants prior to, during, and following the events that they were exposed to. The use of ethnography as a research method allowed us to attain a deeper 670 understanding of the impact of the professional football culture on the identity development, 671 672 and consequent behaviors of youth players than has been attained previously.

From the findings that emerged we suggest that despite considerable changes in 673 674 professional football over recent years (e.g., introduction of the EPPP, global growth, increasing finances), the traditional masculine culture of professional football dominated in the 675 676 club studied. This culture was demonstrated through the everyday interactions of individuals 677 (Maitland et al., 2015) e.g displays of authority, banter, isolation of individuals, language. In 2012, the Premier League introduced the EPPP as a new youth development framework. The 678 EPPP provided guidance on all aspects of practice, and formalized the delivery of 679 680 psychological support. However, the findings from this study regarding the professional football culture supported those of Cushion and Jones (2006) who explored coaching practice, 681 and Roderick (2006) who explored the lived experiences of youth apprentices. More 682

683 specifically, the authoritarian management style, demonstration of power, dominance, and control, and punishments for not adhering to orders were all dominant cultural features that 684 influenced the identity and development of youth players. In particular, it was the behaviour of 685 coaches employed within Burrington City FC that aligned with these cultural features. Thus, 686 we have more confidence in confirming this understanding. Despite research conducted by 687 Cushion, Roderick, and others (e.g. Gearing, 1999; Parker, 1995) suggesting that this is not 688 beneficial for player development, the introduction of the EPPP appeared to have little to no 689 impact on changing the beliefs and behaviours of these individuals. In summary, the EPPP does 690 691 not appear to have addressed what it set out to do. There are a number of potential reasons to explain this, based on both my observations, and previous literature. 692

Firstly, a number of the coaches employed at Burrington City FC had progressed 693 694 through the club's youth system before either having a successful playing career or being released. It was suggested by Gearing (1999) that professional football clubs are total 695 institutions (closed social systems that require permission to enter and leave (Goffman, 1957), 696 and that the members within it are often socialized into a certain way of thinking and acting 697 that is in line with the dominant beliefs and values of the organisation. Having been involved 698 699 in professional football for a significant proportion of their lives, it may be suggested that the coaches have developed hegemonic beliefs that are reluctant to change. In turn, these 700 701 individuals act as key socialising agents. In addition to this, the coaches also want to survive 702 within this social context, and therefore most need to embody the cultural norms and 703 demonstrate successful performance outcomes. The final explanation is a lack of understanding 704 of sports psychology topics, and its value in youth player development. Pain and Harwood 705 (2004) who noted that coaches were reluctant to integrate sports psychology within their clubs, due to a perceived lack of importance, and lack of understanding of topics that fall outside the 706 general coaching domain, support this suggestion. 707

708 Our study extends the use of CSP as a theoretical approach to exploring culture in an organizational setting (e.g., Tibbert et al., 2014). Although identity has been explored 709 previously using athletic identity and Erikson's (1968) identity framework (Brown & Potrac, 710 711 2009; Mitchell et al., 2016) CSP as a theoretical framework has not been used to help us understand player identity development within the cultural context of professional football. In 712 line with the CSP perspective, we explored identity as a fluid concept that is performed in 713 particular ways depending on the cultural context that an individual exists (Schinke et al., 714 2016). However, the findings from this study indicate that the professional football culture, 715 716 which is all encompassing and offers limited identity-related resources at both club, and cultural level is detrimental to the psychological development of youth players. This supports 717 previous work such as Tibbert et al., (2015) who conducted a longitudinal case study of a youth 718 719 footballer within the specific sport subculture, and found that in order to be successful at the club the participant needed to embrace the norms and traditions of the hypermasculine football 720 culture. The manner in which individuals are encouraged to 'act' to be labelled with the tag 721 722 'footballer' may not be coherent with their more authentic sense of self, thoughts, feelings, attitudes, and beliefs. Therefore, when an individual is faced with a psychological challenge 723 they might not have the resources to be able to successfully navigate their way through 724 challenging experiences. 725

# 726 Applied implications

If granted the opportunity, future sports psychology delivery within professional football may include an initial period of observation to explore the best approach to applied practice. More specifically, we suggest that future sports psychology practice within professional football may best be delivered at an organisational level with the primary focus of creating an optimal environment for psychological development, and in turn performance (e.g. challenging, and supporting players in equal measure). Research has supported this, and

suggested that professional football is a performance-driven, high-pressure environment that places a short-term focus on achieving immediate results (Nesti, 2010). Chandler *et al.* (2016) noted that this level of pressure often leads to conflict, and it can be the sports psychologist who is allocated the organisational role of managing the consequences (e.g. re-building relationships, establishing roles and responsibilities). In line with this, it is believed that by creating an optimal development environment, players may have a smoother development journey within professional football clubs.

However, without an understanding of the sub-cultural features and characteristics of 740 an organisational culture, a sports psychologist may not be effective in this role. The results 741 and discussion sections of this paper demonstrated the need for applied sports psychology 742 practitioners to be aware of, and able to deliver organisational psychology support. In line with 743 744 this, there would be great value in introducing a focus on organisational culture within professional training and education routes. More specifically, this may include education on 745 the realities of working in professional and elite sport organisations (Eubank et al. 2014). At 746 undergraduate and postgraduate levels, this might incorporate sociological literature from those 747 with experience in elite sport contexts, such as Parker (1995), and Roderick (2006). This would 748 749 be beneficial in helping students to better understand the social context of sporting environments that they one day may work within. During professional training, this may be 750 751 delivered through a series of workshops presented by guest speakers from within a specific 752 sport culture, and placements where practitioners are given the opportunity to observe and 753 practice in these settings. In addition to greater education through practitioner education and training, it is suggested that trainee's supervisors may also play a significant role in increasing 754 755 their student's awareness of organisational psychology, particularly if they possess appropriate theoretical knowledge (e.g., the work of Fletcher and Wagstaff (2009) on organisational 756 psychology in elite sport, and more recently Eubank and colleagues (2014) on understanding 757

758 high performance sport environments). The sports psychologist may face a number of challenges when attempting this in practice (e.g., stakeholder attitudes and beliefs). Without 759 the support of key stakeholders, we suggest that the sports psychologist may find it close to 760 761 impossible to create a positive culture change. Secondly, influencing a football club on an organisational level may be a difficult and time-consuming process for any sport psychologist, 762 and may not be realistic given the short-term nature of many contracts, and lack of focus placed 763 on the discipline by many clubs. Furthermore, the suspicion demonstrated by professional 764 football clubs towards academics, and addition of a new member of staff attempting to change 765 766 tradition may not be well received.

# 767 Limitations

Sport researchers (e.g. Hayhurst, 2016; Sparkes & Smith, 2014) identify 768 769 generalisability as an issue that cannot be ignored in qualitative research. However, Lewis and Ritchie (2003) argued that we should not sacrifice such a rich and detailed understanding of 770 human beings within a social context based on traditional notions of generalisability, rather we 771 should explore alternative forms of generalisation (e.g. representational, naturalistic). In this 772 study, the findings resonate with my own experiences of the professional football culture and 773 774 its impact on close family members. In addition to this, the findings are similar to previous studies (e.g. Parker, 1996; Roderick, 2006), and thus are likely to be generalisable to 775 individuals embedded in a similar cultural and discursive contexts. Each researcher highlighted 776 777 the masculine, authoritarian, and challenging culture that exists for staff and players within professional football. Finally, we do not know where those players who were unsuccessful in 778 progressing through the academy are now, and therefore we don't really understand the long 779 term consequences of being immersed in this world to their personal development, identity and 780 well-being. This could be addressed by studies that look into former player's life trajectories a 781 782 number of years after they were released.

783

### Conclusions

Through the current study, we sought to extend understandings of the cultural 784 785 experiences of elite youth footballers over three competitive playing seasons, and explore how these experiences influenced player identity development and behaviour. From a social 786 constructionist view the narrative/discursive context of the football club encouraged the players 787 788 to develop self-stories focused on single-minded dedication to sport, which is likely to narrow 789 their life design and have detrimental effects on their well-being if they get de-selected. Further studies conducted within other professional football clubs since the introduction of the EPPP 790 791 would help us to better understand whether the findings from this study lie in isolation, or if they are generalizable across clubs in the UK (and Europe). In addition to this, it would deepen 792 our understanding of the conditioning effect of long-term exposure to professional football 793 environments (Gearing, 1999). The results of studies such as this may serve to inform the future 794 development of the EPPP framework, and consequently influence the daily working practices 795 of professional football clubs. Finally, a holistic and longitudinal examination of the challenges 796 that are faced by players within the specific development phases in isolation (e.g., FP, YDP, 797 PDP, Senior level) may allow for a more in-depth understanding of how player challenges 798 799 change as a function of age, and stage of development. This would build upon the research findings from this study. To date, only Nesti (2012), and Nesti (2013) have used case studies 800 to explore the experiences of elite senior level professional footballers. A clearer understanding 801 of the challenges that players face across their football careers may inform more effective 802 sports psychology practice. 803

804

805

807
-----

### References

- Anderson, G., & Miller, R. M. (2010). Inclusive masculilnity theory and the gendered politics
  of men's rugby. *Journal of Gender Studies*, 19, 249-261.
- 810 Atkinson, P., & Hammersley, M. (1994). Ethnography and participant observation. In:
- 811 *Handbook of qualitative research*. Thousand Oaks, California: Sage, 248-261.
- 812 Baumeister, R. F. (1999). The nature and structure of the self: An overview. In R. Baumeister
- 813 (Ed.), *The self in social psychology*. Philadelphia, PA: Psychology Press (Taylor & Francis),
- 814 1-20.
- Blodgett, A. T., Schinke, R. J., McGannon, K. R., & Fisher, L. A. (2015). Cultural sport
- 816 psychology research: conceptions, evolutions, and forecasts. *International Review of Sport*
- 817 *and Exercise Psychology*, 8(1), 24-43.
- 818 Bogdan, R., & Biklen, S. K. (1982). *Qualitative research for education: an introduction to*
- 819 *theory and methods*. Boston, MA: Allyn and Bacon.
- 820 Brewer, J. D. (2000). *Ethnography*. Buckingham: Open University Press.
- 821 Brewer, B., Van Raalte, J., & Linder, D. (1993). Athletic Identity: Hercules' muscles of
- Achilles' heel? International Journal of Sports psychology, 24, 237-254.
- 823 Broughton, E., & Neyer, M. (2001). Advising and Counselling Student Athletes. New
- 824 Directions for Student Services, 93, 47-53.
- Brown, G., & Potrac, P. (2009). 'You've not made the grade, son': de-selection and identity
- disruption in elite level youth football. *Soccer & Society*, 143-159.

- 827 Bruner, M. W., Munroe-Chandler, K. J., & Spink, K. S. (2008). Entry into elite sport: A
- 828 preliminary investigation into the transition experiences of rookie athletes. Journal of Applied
- 829 *Sport Psychology*, 20(2), 236-252.
- 830 Čačija, G, (2007). Qualitative study of the career transition from junior to senior sport in
- 831 Swedish basketball (C-thesis in Sport Psychology 41-60 p). School of Social and Health
- 832 Sciences, Halmstad University.
- 833 Chandler, C., Eubank, M. R., Nesti, M. S., & Tod, D. (2016). Personal qualities of effective
- 834 Sports psychologists: Coping with organisational demands in high performance sport.
- 835 International Journal of Sports psychology, 47(4).
- 836 Chavez, C. (2008). Conceptualizing from the inside: Advantages, complications, and
- demands on insider positionality. *The Qualitative Report*, *13*(3), 474-494.
- 838 Chryssochoou, X. (2003). Studying identity in social psychology: Some thoughts on the
- definition of identity and its relation to action. *Journal of Language and Politics*, 2(2), 225241.
- 841 Collinson, D. (1988). 'Engineering humour': Masculinity, joking and conflict in shop-floor
- relations. Organisation studies, 9(2), 181-199
- 843 Cornbleth, C. (1990). *Curriculum in context*. London and New York: Falmer.
- 844 Cushion, C. & Jones, R. L. (2006). Power, Discourse, and Symbolic Violence in Professional
- Youth Soccer: A Case of Albion Football Club. *Sociology of Sport*, 23(2), 142-161.
- 846 De Rond, M. (2008). The last amateurs; to hell and back with the Cambridge Boat Race
- 847 *crew*. London: Icon Books.

- 848 Douglas, K., & Carless, D. (2009). Abandoning the performance narrative: Two women's
- stories of transition from professional sport. *Journal of applied sport psychology*, 21(2), 213230.
- 851 Dowling, G. (1993). Developing your company image into a corporate asset. *Long Range*
- 852 *Planning*, *26*(2), 101-109.
- Ellis, C. (2007). Telling Secrets, Revealing Lives. Relational Ethics in Research with
  Intimate Others. *Qualitative Inquiry*, *13*(1), 3-29.
- 855 Erikson, E. (1968). *Identity, Youth and Crisis.* New York: Norton.
- Eubank, M., Nesti, M. & Cruickshank, A. (2014). Understanding high performance sport
- 857 environments: Impact for the professional training and supervision of Sports psychologists.
- 858 Sport and Exercise Psychology Review, 10, 30-36.
- 859 Fletcher, D. & Wagstaff, C. (2009). Organisational psychology in elite sport: Its emergence,
- application, and future. *Psychology of sport and exercise*, 10(4), 427-434.
- 861 Friesen, A. & Orlick, T. (2010). A Qualitative Analysis of Holistic Sports psychology
- 862 Consultants' Professional Philosophies. *The Sports psychologist, 24, 227-244.*
- 863 Gailbraith, P. (2004). "Organisational leadership and chaos theory: Let's be careful",
- Journal of Educational Administration, 42(1), 9-28.
- 865 Gearing, B. (1999). Narratives of Identity among former professional footballers in the
- 866 United Kingdom. Journal of Aging Studies, 13, 43-58.
- 67 Gilbourne, D. & Richardson, D. (2006). Tales from the field: Personal reflections on the
- 868 provision of psychological support in professional soccer. *Psychology of Sport and Exercise*,
- 869 7(3), 325-337.

- Books.
  Books.
- Gordon, S., & Lavallee, D. (2011) Career transitions. In: Morris, T., Terry, P. (ed.). The New
- 873 Sport and Exercise Psychology Companion, Morgantown, WV, USA: Fitness Information
- 874 Technology, pp. 567-582.
- Greene, M. J. (2014). On the inside looking in: Methodological insights and challenges in
  conducting qualitative insider research. *The qualitative report*, *19*(29), 1-13.
- 877 Guillemin, M. & Gillam, L. (2004). Ethics, reflexivity, and "ethically important moments" in
- 878 research. *Qualitative Inquiry*, 10(2), 261-280.
- Hatch, J. M., & Schultz, M. (1997). Relations between organizational culture, identity and
  image. *European Journal of marketing*, *31*(5/6), 356-365.
- Hayhurst, L. M. (2016). Sport for development and peace: a call for transnational, multi-
- sited, postcolonial feminist research. *Qualitative research in sport, exercise and health*, 8(5),
- **883** 424-443.
- Javadi, M. & Zarea, M. (2016). Understanding Thematic Analysis and its Pitfalls. *Journal of Client Care*, *1*(1), 33-39.
- Kahan, D. (1999). Coaching behaviour: A review of the systematic observation research
- 887 literature. *Applied Research in Coaching and Athletics Annual*, 14, 17-58.
- 888 Kelly, S. & Waddington, I. (2006). Abuse, intimidation and violence as aspects of managerial
- control in professional soccer in Britain and Ireland. *International Journal for the Sociology of Sport, 41*(2), 147-164.
- 891 Kelman, H. (1958). Compliance, identification, and internalization: Three processes of
- attitude change. *Journal of Conflict Resolution*, *2*, 51-60.

- 893 Knapp, B.A. (2012). Smash Mouth Football: Identity Development and Maintenance on a
- 894 Women's Tackle Football Team. Journal of Sport and Social Issues, 38(1), 51-74.
- Kolar, K., Ahmad, F., Chan, L., & Erickson, P.G. (2015). Timeline Mapping in Qualitative
- 896 Interviews: A Study of Resilience with Marginalized Groups. International Journal of
- 897 *Qualitative Methods*, *14*(3), 13-32.
- Krane, V. & Baird, S. (2005). Using Ethnography in Applied Sports psychology. *Journal of Applied Sports psychology*, *17*(2), 87-107.
- 900 Lewis, J., & Ritchie, J. (2003). Generalising from qualitative research. *Qualitative research*
- 901 *practice: A guide for social science students and researchers*, 2, 347-362.
- Lindbeck, A., & Snower, D. (2001). Insiders versus Outsiders. *The Journal of Economic Perspectives*, 15(1), 165-188.
- 904 Lofland, J. & Lofland, L. H. (1984). Analyzing social settings. Belmont, California:
- 905 Wadsworth Publishing Company.
- 906 Maharaj, N. (2016). Using field notes to facilitate critical reflection. *Reflective*
- 907 *Practice*, *17*(2), 114-124.
- 908 Maitland, A., Hills, L. A., & Rhind, D. J. (2015). Organisational culture in sport-A
- 909 systematic review. Sport Management Review, 18(4), 501-516.
- 910 McGannon, K.R., Curtin, K., Schinke, R.J., & Schweinbenz, A.N. (2012). (De) Constructing
- 911 Paula Radcliffe: Exploring media representations of elite running, pregnancy, and
- motherhood through cultural sport psychology. *Psychology of Sport and Exercise*, *13*(6), 820829.

- 914 McGannon, K.R., & Smith, B. (2015). Centralizing culture in cultural sport psychology
- 915 research: The potential of narrative inquiry and discursive psychology. *Psychology of Sport*916 & *Exercise*, 17, 19-87.
- 917 McGillivray, D., Fearn, R., & McIntosh, A. (2005). Caught up in and by the beautiful game:
- 918 A case study of Scottish professional footballers, *Journal of Sport and Social Issues*, 29(1),
  919 102-123.
- 920 Mills, A., Butt, J., Maynard, I., & Harwood, C. (2012). Identifying factors perceived to
- 921 influence the development of elite youth football academy players. *Journal of sports*
- *sciences*, *30*(15), 1593-1604.
- 923 Mitchell, T.O., Nesti. M., Richardson, D., Midgley, A.W., Eubank, M., & Littlewood, M.
- 924 (2014). Exploring athletic identity in elite-level English youth football: a cross-sectional
- approach. Journal of Sports Sciences, 32(13), 1294-1299.
- 926 Morill, C., & Fine, A. (1997). Ethnographic Contributions to Organizational Sociology.
- 927 Sociological Methods & Research, 25(4), 424-451.
- 928 Morris, R., Tod, D., & Oliver, E. (2016). An Investigation into Stakeholders' Perceptions of
- 929 the Youth-to-Senior Transition in Professional Soccer in the United Kingdom. *Journal of*
- 930 Applied Sport Psychology, 28, 375-391.
- 931 Morrow, S.L. (2005). Quality and Trustworthiness in Qualitative Research in Counselling
- 932 Psychology. Journal of Counselling Psychology, 52(2), 250-260.
- 933 Nesti, M. S. (2012). Sporting recommendations for spiritual encounters: Delivering sports
- 934 psychology inside the English Premier League. Physical Culture and Sport, Studies and
- 935 *Research*, 14-23.

- 936 Nesti, M., Littlewood, M., O'Halloran, L., Eubank, M., & Richardson, D. (2012). Critical
- 937 Moments in Elite Premiership Football: Who Do You Think You Are? *Physical Culture and*
- 938 Sport. Studies and Research. 56, 23-32.
- 939 Ortlipp, M. (2008). Keeping and using reflective journals in the qualitative research
- 940 process. *The qualitative report*, *13*(4), 695-705.
- Pain, M. & Harwood, C. (2004). Knowledge and perceptions of sports psychology within
- 942 English soccer. Journal of Sport Sciences, 22, 813-826
- 943 Parker, A. (1995). Great Expectations: Grimness or Glamour? The Football Apprentice in the
- 944 1990s. *The Sport Historian*, 107-126.
- 945 Patton, M. Q. (2005). *Qualitative research*. John Wiley & Sons, Ltd.
- 946 Pollard, C.L. (2015). What is the Right Thing to Do: Use of a Relational Ethic Framework to
- 947 Guide Clinical Decision-Making. *International Journal of Caring Sciences*, 8(2), 362.
- 948 Reeves, C.W., Nicholls, A.R., & McKenna, J. (2009). Stressors and coping strategies amont
- 949 early and middle adolescent premier league academy soccer players: Differences according to
- age. Journal of Applied Sport Psychology, 21(1), 21-48.
- 951 Richardson, L. (2000). New writing practices in qualitative research. *Sociology of Sport*952 *Journal*, *17*, 335-352.
- 953 Roderick, M., (2006). The work of professional football: A labour of love?. London :
- 954 Routledge
- 955 Ryba, T.V., & Wright, H.K. (2010). Sport psychology and the cultural turn: Notes toward
- 956 cultural praxis. *The cultural turn in sport psychology*, 3-28.

- 957 Schinke, R.J., McGannon, KR., Parham, W.D., & Lane, A.M. (2012). Towards Cultural
- Praxis and Cultural Sensitivity: Strategies for Self-Reflexive Sport Psychology Practice. *Quest*, 64(1), 34-46.
- 960 Schinke, R., Papaioannou, A.G., & Schack, T. (2016). Sport psychology in emerging
- 961 countries: An introduction. *International Journal of Sport and Exercise Psychology*, 14(2),
- 962 103-109.
- 963 Sheridan, J., Chamberlain, K., & Dupius, A. (2011). Timelining: visualizing experience.
  964 *Qualitative Research*, 11(5), 552-569.
- 965 Smith, B. (2013). Disability, sport, and men's narratives of health: A qualitative study.
- 966 *Health Psychology*, *32*(1), 110-119.
- 967 Smith, B., & McGannon, K.R. (2017). Developing rigor in qualitative research: problems and
  968 opportunities within sport and exercise psychology. *International Review of Sport and*969 *Exercise Psychology*, 1-22
- 970 Smith, B., McGannon, K. R., & Williams, T. (2015). Ethnographic creative non-fiction:
- 971 Exploring the what's, why's and how's. In L. Purdy & G.Molner (Eds.), *Ethnographies in*
- 972 *sport and exercise*, 59-73. London: Routlegde.
- 973 Smith, B. & Sparkes, A. C. (2009). Narrative inquiry in sport and exercise psychology: What
- is it, and why might we do it? *Psychology of Sport and Exercise*, 10(1), 1-11.
- 975 Sparkes, A. C. (1998). Athletic identity: An Achilles' heel to the survival of self. *Qualitative*976 *health research*, 8(5), 644-664.
- 977 Stambulova, N., Alfermann, D., Statler, T., & Cote, J. (2009). ISSP position stand: career
- 978 development and transition of athletes. International Journal of Sport and Exercise
- 979 *Psychology*, 7, 395-412.

- 980 Stambulova, N., Pehrson, S., Olssson, K. (2017). Phases in the junior-to-senior transition of
- 981 Swedish ice hockey players: From a conceptual framework to an empirical mode.
- 982 International Journal of Sports Science and Coaching, 12(2), 231-244.
- 983 Tibbert, S., Andersen, M., & Morris, T. (2015). What a difference a "Mentally Toughening"
- year makes: the acculturation of a rookie. *Psychology of Sport and Exercise*, 17, 68–78.
- 985 Tierney, K. J. (2002). The Field Turns Fifty: Social Change and the Practice of Disaster Field
- 986 Work. In: *Methods of Disaster Research*. Phildelphia: Xlibris, 349-374.
- 987 Tracy, S. J. (2010). Qualitative Quality: Eight "Big-Tent" Criteria for Excellent Qualitative
- 988 Research, Qualitative Enquiry, *16*(10), 837-851.
- 989 Weiss, R. S. (1994). Learning from strangers: The art and method of qualitative
- 990 *interviewing*. New York: The Free Press.
- 991 Wittgenstein, L. (1953). *Philosophical investigations*. Oxford: Blackwell.
- 992 Wylleman, P., Alfermann, D., & Lavallee, D. (2004) Career transitions in sport: European
- 993 perspectives, *Psychology of Sport and Exercise*, *5*(1),7-20.