

# LJMU Research Online

Domeher, D, Abdulai, RT and Yeboah, E

Secure property right as a determinant of SME's access to formal credit in Ghana: Dynamics between Micro Finance Institutions and Universal Banks

http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/id/eprint/3631/

### **Article**

**Citation** (please note it is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from this work)

Domeher, D, Abdulai, RT and Yeboah, E (2016) Secure property right as a determinant of SME's access to formal credit in Ghana: Dynamics between Micro Finance Institutions and Universal Banks. Journal of Property Research. ISSN 1466-4453

LJMU has developed LJMU Research Online for users to access the research output of the University more effectively. Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Users may download and/or print one copy of any article(s) in LJMU Research Online to facilitate their private study or for non-commercial research. You may not engage in further distribution of the material or use it for any profit-making activities or any commercial gain.

The version presented here may differ from the published version or from the version of the record. Please see the repository URL above for details on accessing the published version and note that access may require a subscription.

For more information please contact <a href="mailto:researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk">researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk</a>

# List of Tables

Table 1: Demographic characteristics of bank officials

| <b>Demographics of</b> | categories     | N=108 | Valid % |  |
|------------------------|----------------|-------|---------|--|
| officials from         |                |       |         |  |
| lending institutions   |                |       |         |  |
| Gender                 | Male           | 70    | 64.8    |  |
|                        | Female         | 38    | 35.2    |  |
| Age                    | <30yrs         | 23    | 21.3    |  |
|                        | 30-45yrs       | 52    | 48.1    |  |
|                        | Above 45yrs    | 33    | 30.6    |  |
| Institution type       | UB             | 57    | 52.8    |  |
|                        | MFI's          | 51    | 47.2    |  |
| Years at current       | <5yrs          | 34    | 31.5    |  |
| institution            | 5-10yrs        | 42    | 38.9    |  |
|                        | Above 10yrs    | 32    | 29.6    |  |
| position               | Credit officer | 54    | 50      |  |
|                        | Loans manager  | 41    | 38      |  |
|                        | Branch manager | 13    | 12      |  |
| Years at current       | <5yrs          | 39    | 36.1    |  |
| position               | 5-10yrs        | 46    | 42.6    |  |
|                        | Above 10yrs    | 23    | 21.3    |  |

Source: Field survey

Table 2: Chi square test for association between the type of lender and lenders' perception on the statement that property registration is not necessary (RENNEC) to make landed property suitable for use as collateral.

RENNEC \* Institution Type Crosstabulation

|        |                   |                           | Institution       | Туре   |        |
|--------|-------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|--------|--------|
|        |                   |                           | Universal<br>bank | MFI    | Total  |
| RENNEC | strongly disagree | Count                     | 15                | 3      | 18     |
|        |                   | % within RENNEC           | 83.3%             | 16.7%  | 100.0% |
|        |                   | % within Institution Type | 26.3%             | 5.9%   | 16.7%  |
|        |                   | % of Total                | 13.9%             | 2.8%   | 16.7%  |
|        | disagree          | Count                     | 23                | 8      | 31     |
|        |                   | % within RENNEC           | 74.2%             | 25.8%  | 100.0% |
|        |                   | % within Institution Type | 40.4%             | 15.7%  | 28.7%  |
|        |                   | % of Total                | 21.3%             | 7.4%   | 28.7%  |
|        | Neither agree nor | Count                     | 7                 | 11     | 18     |
|        | disagree          | % within RENNEC           | 38.9%             | 61.1%  | 100.0% |
|        |                   | % within Institution Type | 12.3%             | 21.6%  | 16.7%  |
|        |                   | % of Total                | 6.5%              | 10.2%  | 16.7%  |
|        | agree             | Count                     | 9                 | 17     | 26     |
|        |                   | % within RENNEC           | 34.6%             | 65.4%  | 100.0% |
|        |                   | % within Institution Type | 15.8%             | 33.3%  | 24.1%  |
|        |                   | % of Total                | 8.3%              | 15.7%  | 24.1%  |
|        | strongly agree    | Count                     | 3                 | 12     | 15     |
|        |                   | % within RENNEC           | 20.0%             | 80.0%  | 100.0% |
|        |                   | % within Institution Type | 5.3%              | 23.5%  | 13.9%  |
|        |                   | % of Total                | 2.8%              | 11.1%  | 13.9%  |
| Total  |                   | Count                     | 57                | 51     | 108    |
|        |                   | % within RENNEC           | 52.8%             | 47.2%  | 100.0% |
|        |                   | % within Institution Type | 100.0%            | 100.0% | 100.0% |
|        |                   | % of Total                | 52.8%             | 47.2%  | 100.0% |

**Chi-Square Tests** 

|                                 | Value               | df | Asymp. Sig.<br>(2-sided) |
|---------------------------------|---------------------|----|--------------------------|
| Pearson Chi-Square              | 23.748 <sup>a</sup> | 4  | .000                     |
| Likelihood Ratio                | 25.152              | 4  | .000                     |
| Linear-by-Linear<br>Association | 21.930              | 1  | .000                     |
| N of Valid Cases                | 108                 |    |                          |

a. 0 cells (.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 7.08.  $\,$ 

Table 3: chi square test for association between types of property documents accepted and lender type

Documentation types \* Institution Type Crosstabulation

|                     |                        |                              | Institution       | Туре   |        |
|---------------------|------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|--------|--------|
|                     |                        |                              | Universal<br>bank | MFI    | Total  |
| Documentation types | ONLY registered        | Count                        | 42                | 9      | 51     |
|                     | documents              | % within Documentation types | 82.4%             | 17.6%  | 100.0% |
|                     |                        | % within Institution Type    | 73.7%             | 17.6%  | 47.2%  |
|                     |                        | % of Total                   | 38.9%             | 8.3%   | 47.2%  |
|                     | Both registered &      | Count                        | 15                | 42     | 57     |
|                     | unregistered documents | % within Documentation types | 26.3%             | 73.7%  | 100.0% |
|                     |                        | % within Institution Type    | 26.3%             | 82.4%  | 52.8%  |
|                     |                        | % of Total                   | 13.9%             | 38.9%  | 52.8%  |
| Total               |                        | Count                        | 57                | 51     | 108    |
|                     |                        | % within Documentation types | 52.8%             | 47.2%  | 100.0% |
|                     |                        | % within Institution Type    | 100.0%            | 100.0% | 100.0% |
|                     |                        | % of Total                   | 52.8%             | 47.2%  | 100.0% |

## **Chi-Square Tests**

|                                    | Value   | df | Asymp. Sig.<br>(2-sided) | Exact Sig. (2-<br>sided) | Exact Sig. (1-<br>sided) |
|------------------------------------|---------|----|--------------------------|--------------------------|--------------------------|
| Pearson Chi-Square                 | 33.914ª | 1  | .000                     |                          |                          |
| Continuity Correction <sup>b</sup> | 31.703  | 1  | .000                     |                          |                          |
| Likelihood Ratio                   | 36.152  | 1  | .000                     |                          |                          |
| Fisher's Exact Test                |         |    |                          | .000                     | .000                     |
| Linear-by-Linear<br>Association    | 33.600  | 1  | .000                     |                          |                          |
| N of Valid Cases                   | 108     |    |                          |                          |                          |

- a. 0 cells (.0%) have expected count less than 5. The minimum expected count is 24.08.
- b. Computed only for a 2x2 table

Table 4: Important attributes of land-based collateral by institution type

|                            | UN              | UNIVERSAL BANKS (N=57) |                      |        | MICROFINANCE INSTITUTIONS (N=51) |           |                      |        |
|----------------------------|-----------------|------------------------|----------------------|--------|----------------------------------|-----------|----------------------|--------|
| <b>Property Attributes</b> | Least important | Important              | Critically important | median | Least important                  | Important | Critically important | median |
| Market value               | 0%              | 21.1%                  | 78.9%                | 6      | 0%                               | 31.4%     | 68.6%                | 5      |
| Documentary evidence       | 0%              | 24.6%                  | 75.4%                | 6      | 5.9%                             | 19.6%     | 74.5%                | 6      |
| of ownership               |                 |                        |                      |        |                                  |           |                      |        |
| Location                   | 0%              | 26.3%                  | 73.7%                | 5      | 15.7%                            | 39.2%     | 45.1%                | 4      |
| Registered property        | 43.3%           | 56.1%                  | 0%                   | 5      | 64.7%                            | 35.3%     | 0%                   | 3      |
| titles                     |                 |                        |                      |        |                                  |           |                      |        |
| Property Insurance         | 12.3 %          | 33.3%                  | 54.4%                | 5      | 45.1%                            | 33.3%     | 21.6%                | 3      |
| Leasehold/freehold         | 52.6%           | 40.4%                  | 7.0%                 | 2      | 54.9%                            | 37.3%     | 7.8%                 | 2      |
|                            |                 |                        |                      |        |                                  |           |                      |        |

Table 5: Man-Whitney test for differences between UBs and MFIs perception of the level of importance of various property attributes.

| Ranks          |                  |     |           |              |  |  |  |
|----------------|------------------|-----|-----------|--------------|--|--|--|
|                | Institution Type | Ν   | Mean Rank | Sum of Ranks |  |  |  |
| Location       | Universal bank   | 57  | 61.31     | 3494.50      |  |  |  |
|                | MFI              | 51  | 46.89     | 2391.50      |  |  |  |
|                | Total            | 108 |           |              |  |  |  |
| Market value   | Universal bank   | 57  | 56.75     | 3234.50      |  |  |  |
|                | MFI              | 51  | 51.99     | 2651.50      |  |  |  |
|                | Total            | 108 |           |              |  |  |  |
| Land rights    | Universal bank   | 57  | 57.03     | 3250.50      |  |  |  |
|                | MFI              | 51  | 51.68     | 2635.50      |  |  |  |
|                | Total            | 108 |           |              |  |  |  |
| Land insurance | Universal bank   | 57  | 67.74     | 3861.00      |  |  |  |
|                | MFI              | 51  | 39.71     | 2025.00      |  |  |  |
|                | Total            | 108 |           |              |  |  |  |
| Registration   | Universal bank   | 57  | 64.49     | 3676.00      |  |  |  |
|                | MFI              | 51  | 43.33     | 2210.00      |  |  |  |
|                | Total            | 108 |           |              |  |  |  |
| Documentation  | Universal bank   | 57  | 55.80     | 3180.50      |  |  |  |
|                | MFI              | 51  | 53.05     | 2705.50      |  |  |  |
|                | Total            | 108 |           |              |  |  |  |

### Test Statistics<sup>a</sup>

|                        | Location | Market value | Land rights | Land insurance | Registration | Documentation |  |
|------------------------|----------|--------------|-------------|----------------|--------------|---------------|--|
| Mann-Whitney U         | 1065.500 | 1325.500     | 1309.500    | 699.000        | 884.000      | 1379.500      |  |
| Wilcoxon W             | 2391.500 | 2651.500     | 2635.500    | 2025.000       | 2210.000     | 2705.500      |  |
| Z                      | -2.468   | 872          | 911         | -4.761         | -3.576       | 501           |  |
| Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed) | .014     | .383         | .362        | .000           | .000         | .616          |  |

a. Grouping Variable: Institution Type

Table 6: possession of registered property titles and its effect on loan conditions

| Loan conditions      | % of total respondents (108) |         |       |        |  |  |
|----------------------|------------------------------|---------|-------|--------|--|--|
|                      | Disagree                     | Neutral | Agree | Median |  |  |
| Lower interest rate  | 55.6                         | 25.9    | 18.5  | 2      |  |  |
| Lower fees           | 62.0                         | 21.3    | 16.7  | 2      |  |  |
| Larger amounts       | 59.3                         | 23.1    | 17.6  | 2      |  |  |
| Longer maturity time | 59.3                         | 36.1    | 4.6   | 2      |  |  |

Table 7: Mann-Whitney test for difference between banks and MFIs regarding their perceptions on the impact of formal property title on loan terms

#### Ranks

|                | Institution Type | Ν   | Mean Rank | Sum of Ranks |
|----------------|------------------|-----|-----------|--------------|
| Interest       | Universal bank   | 57  | 56.96     | 3247.00      |
|                | MFI              | 51  | 51.75     | 2639.00      |
|                | Total            | 108 |           |              |
| fees           | Universal bank   | 57  | 57.46     | 3275.50      |
|                | MFI              | 51  | 51.19     | 2610.50      |
|                | Total            | 108 |           |              |
| Amount         | Universal bank   | 57  | 58.51     | 3335.00      |
|                | MFI              | 51  | 50.02     | 2551.00      |
|                | Total            | 108 |           |              |
| repayment time | Universal bank   | 57  | 53.68     | 3060.00      |
|                | MFI              | 51  | 55.41     | 2826.00      |
|                | Total            | 108 |           |              |

## Test Statistics<sup>a</sup>

|                        | Interest | fees     | Amount   | repayment<br>time |
|------------------------|----------|----------|----------|-------------------|
| Mann-Whitney U         | 1313.000 | 1284.500 | 1225.000 | 1407.000          |
| Wilcoxon W             | 2639.000 | 2610.500 | 2551.000 | 3060.000          |
| Z                      | 899      | -1.085   | -1.458   | 302               |
| Asymp. Sig. (2-tailed) | .369     | .278     | .145     | .763              |

a. Grouping Variable: Institution Type