

Determining the Definition and Components of Successful Soccer Referee Performance

John Westbrooks^{1,3}, David A. Low¹, Thomas E Brownlee²

¹Research Institute of Sport and Exercise Sciences, Liverpool John Moores University, UK

²School of Sport, Exercise and Rehabilitation Sciences, University of Birmingham, UK

³Professional Referee Organization

Address for correspondence:

John Westbrooks

Professional Referee Organization

Email: John.Westbrooks@proreferees.com

Abstract

There has been little work examining the intricacies of what makes a soccer referee successful. The aim of this study was to determine what the definition of a successful referee performance is and what are the characteristics of a successful referee from a broad range of stakeholders in Major League Soccer (MLS) and the Professional Referees Organisation (PRO). The study used Delphi methodology to ask 6 MLS General Managers, 2 MLS Coaches, 1 MLS League Officer, 4 PRO Referees and 10 PRO Assistant Referees, 8 PRO Staff and 5 PRO Assessors, and 2 PRO2 Referees two questions: 1. Their definition of a successful referee performance. 2. Their opinion on the characteristics of a successful referee. The result was a 7-point definition of a successful referee performance and 26 characteristics of a successful referee. There were ten characteristics that overlapped with previous work examining successful referees. This study was able to develop a definition of a successful referee performance and determine the characteristics of a successful referee.

Keywords: Match Official, Successful Referee, Soccer Referee, Football Referee

Introduction

The performance of a soccer referee is a key aspect of a modern football match. The current duties of a referee according to the International Football Association Board (IFAB) are to “1. Enforce the laws of the game. 2. Control the match in cooperation with the other match officials. 3. Act as timekeeper, keep a record of the match and provide the appropriate authorities with a match report including information on disciplinary action and any other incidents that occurred before, during or after the match. 4. Supervise and/or indicate the restart of play.” The performance of these duties leads a referee to make approximately 200 decisions during a match (Helsen and Bultynck, 2004). Ultimately any one of these decisions can have an influence on the outcome of the match. They must work as a team with 2 assistant referees, a 4th official, the video assistant referee (VAR), and assistant video assistant referee (AVAR). They must be able to effectively communicate with their teammates while moving across the pitch and monitoring play. Furthermore, the financial value of the professional game and success in competitions have exponentially increased in recent years meaning that the potential financial impact of each decision has also increased. For example, Major League Soccer signed a 10-year broadcast deal with Apple starting in 2023 worth 250million US dollars a year compared to 90million US dollars a year previously (Quillen, 2022). Thus, decision-making is one of the most important aspects of a referee. It is therefore important to understand what a successful referee performance is as well as which characteristics are possessed by a successful referee.

The large increase in money within Major League Soccer drives an increased focus on the performance of the referee in these matches. This creates the need to understand what referee performance looks like in this league. The definition of a successful referee needs to be developed so that a target can be created to guide coaching and education of officials to meet the expectations of the league. The isolation of the individual traits is important to target the specific areas of improvement needed for each official. This will allow the targeted use of limited resources to efficiently meet the expectations of the league. The inclusion of coaches, general managers and league officers is important both to include their perspective in the results and to help foster buy in and cooperation from stakeholders who sometimes have a hostile relationship with officials.

Research into referee success is relatively sparse with very few research groups having examined it to date. Slack et al., (2013) interviewed 15 English Premier League referees and organized 111 raw-data themes into 8 higher-order themes containing 24 lower-order themes. Their themes combined referee specific items with organizational/structural pieces and environmental factors to create an all-encompassing view of what can lead an official to be successful. This was the first investigation into what factors underpin a successful referee and therefore a key piece of referee research. However, including factors outside of the referee themselves limits the ability to create a referee evaluation tool from this work. Pina et al (2019) interviewed referees and assistant referees, referee coaches, referee committee members, practicing and academic sport psychologists, observers, journalists, and physical and technical coaches. They developed 3 major categories and 24 subcategories for what determines successful referee performance. One significant piece of this work is that it displayed the interconnectedness of different traits and how they can affect multiple aspects of referee excellence. However, by setting the focus as the match not the referee it limits the ability to create an assessment tool from this work. The crossover of different traits would make using this study to design the tool very complex. There are two potential limitations of these studies. They do not include viewpoints from other individuals such as coaches, general managers or league officers within the league and they are not formatted in a way to allow the evaluation of the officials on the study outcomes. This latter limitation is important to better understand an official's performance relative to the definition of success and thus prescribe appropriate training interventions for development.

In addition to asking what are the traits of a successful referee it is possible to look at career and environmental factors that contribute to a referee being successful. Loghmani et al (2021) interviewed 12 Iranian FIFA referees and assistant referees about their career development focusing on two time periods, the early development period and the elite pathway period. They found officials who were exposed to soccer prior to officiating and who had a strong support network were more successful later in their career. In addition, goal setting and individual practice were important for an official to progress from the development period to the elite pathway. This study provides revealing information on how some factors that may help an official develop into a successful referee, but it does not identify the characteristics of a successful

referee. Mendes et al (2021) found that the length of time on the Portuguese National Referee Board, age, previous history of playing, and proximity to a dense population of other National Board officials were predictors of an official having a higher ranking. Overall, the methods of the aforementioned studies provide a different way of examining what a successful referee is. The results of these studies overlap in several areas that contribute to successful referee performance, but they do not specifically attempt to isolate the characteristics of successful referees. This prevents them from being used to create a game assessment model for referee performance allowing for the determination of areas of strength and weakness.

Despite this initial research into what constitutes a successful referee performance in Europe and the Middle East no research has been conducted into what is considered a successful referee in North America, specifically MLS. Furthermore, the viewpoint of stakeholders independent from referees, such as coaches, general managers, or league officials' regarding what attributes make a successful referee have not been obtained. Gathering the input of coaches, general managers, and league officials in addition to that of referees would further the understanding of what constitutes successful referee performance, especially the multi-faceted skillsets needed for a match official to be successful. The previous work on what makes a referee successful also has not been formatted in a manner that focuses directly on the referee. Identifying specific characteristics of a successful referee would allow for evaluation of a referee and could guide improvement of performance. Such information is critical for the development and promotion of referees and would thus help referees and their coaches/managers to objectively identify the requirements for a referee to advance their career. Therefore, the aims of this study are to determine the definition of successful referee performance and the characteristics of a successful referee from a broad range of stakeholders in MLS.

Methodology

Procedures

The Delphi study methodology was utilized to find a consensus on the definition of a successful referee performance and the items that make up a successful referee in MLS. The Delphi method

is a way to solve a complex situation through the organization of individual opinions into a cohesive consensus (Linstone and Turoff, 1975). The typical process is to send a questionnaire or question to a select group of topic experts. The results are then used to formulate a second round of questions. This process is continued until the research question is answered. (Skulmoski, Hartman and Krahn, 2007) A two-part Delphi study was utilized to determine the definition of a successful referee performance and the items which make up a successful referee. Approval obtained from Liverpool John Moores University (Reference# **19/SPS/053**). In stage 1, the aim was to reach out to individuals who had a stake in the performance of referees in MLS. The inclusion criteria were that the individual was a current Coach or General Manager for an MLS club, an Officer with MLS, a current Professional Referee Organization (PRO) Referee, Assistant Referee, Assessor or Staff member or a current PRO2 Referee. An email was sent out to the MLS Coaches and General Managers via an MLS Officer and to PRO Referees, Assistant Referees, Assessors, Staff and PRO2 Referees by PRO Management. The email detailed the purpose of the project and provided a link to complete the questionnaire for stage 1 online (Please see Appendix 1). The questionnaire remained open for 2 months from December 2019. All responses were anonymous. The questionnaire contained two open-ended questions: Question 1. What is your definition of a successful referee performance? Question 2. What characteristics (e.g., mental toughness, composure, focus etc.) or abilities (e.g., law knowledge, positioning, sprinting speed etc.) make a referee successful?

Once the survey for Stage 1 was closed, the results were analysed. The primary investigator (JW) used Thematic analysis to group the responses by similarity. An item was created if it was mentioned by 3 or more respondents. Two other investigators also grouped the raw results without having previously seen the primary investigator's groupings. The other two investigators grouped responses in a similar manner to the primary investigator, confirming the formation of the items.

The items created in Stage 1 were then placed into the survey for Stage 2 (please see Appendix 2). The link to the survey went out through the same channels as Stage 1. Participants were asked to rank the importance of the 7 items created by Question 1 and the 26 items created by Question 2 using a 7-point Likert Scale: 1 Not at all important, 2 Low Importance, 3 Slightly Important, 4

Neutral, 5 Moderately Important, 6 Very Important and 7 Extremely Important. Survey 2 was open for 3 months from February 2020.

There were 38 respondents to part 1 and 53 respondents to part 2 of the survey. The officiating experience of respondents ranged from Youth, MLS Academy Exhibition games to FIFA World Cup games. There were 12 former or current FIFA Officials who responded. The coaching experience included National Team, MLS, USL, College, High School, and youth soccer. The playing experience included National Team, Professional, College, Amateur and youth soccer. The breakdown of the respondents can be seen in Table 1.

Table 1 – Respondents’ roles within MLS and the number of respondents for each stage of the Delphi study.

Respondent	Role	38 Respondents in Stage 1	53 Respondents in Stage 2
MLS Coach	Head Coach in MLS	2	13
MLS General Manager	General Manager of an MLS team	6	13
MLS Officer	Works in the MLS office and has interactions around refereeing	1	2
PRO Assessor	Evaluates the performance of the referee during MLS matches	5	6
PRO Assistant Referee	Assistant Referees who work MLS matches	10	7
PRO Referee	Referees who work MLS Matches	4	3
PRO Staff	Works for PRO in Training or Coaching the Referees	8	5
PRO2 Referee	Primarily Referee 2 nd Division Men’s or 1 st Division Women’s matches, may be 4 th official in MLS	2	4

Analyses

At the end of Stage 2, the results were analysed. If an item was given a 5,6, or 7 by 70% or more respondents it was included. Previous literature has used 70% consensus as the benchmark for inclusion. (Kleynen *et al.*, 2014; van der Horst *et al.*, 2017). All items above 70% agreement were included.

Results

Question 1 Delphi Stage 1 and Stage 2

The first goal of the Delphi study was to establish a definition of what a successful referee performance is. The items in Table 2 were developed from the 89 total raw items mentioned by the respondents to Question 1 in Stage 1. Only items mentioned 3 or more times were included in Table 2 and taken forward to Stage 2. There were 7 items mentioned 3 or more times by respondents in Stage 1. There were 15 items mentioned just once which were discarded. All items included in Stage 2 met the 70% inclusion mark.

Table 2 – Responses to Stage 1&2 Question 1 “What is your definition of a successful referee performance?”

A Referee Performance is Successful when	Mentions	Agreement %
No one talks about their impact on the game/they do not negatively impact the game	17	94.4
They make very few errors/all major decisions are correct	15	94.4
They control the game	10	77.3
They correctly enforce the laws of the game	9	100
They protect the health and safety of the players	7	98.1
They communicate with the players	3	96.2
Both teams feel like they received equal treatment	3	75.5

Question 2 Delphi Stage 1 and Stage 2

The second goal of the Delphi study was to determine the characteristics of a successful referee. The items in Table 3 were developed from the 311 total raw items mentioned by the respondents to Question 2 in Stage 1. Only items mentioned 3 or more times were included in Stage 2. There were 26 items mentioned 3 or more times in response to Question 2. There were 4 items mentioned twice and 17 items mentioned once. All items included in Stage 2 met the 70% inclusion mark.

Table 3 – Responses to Stage 1&2 Question 2 “What characteristics (e.g., mental toughness, composure, focus etc.) or abilities (e.g., law knowledge, positioning, sprinting speed etc.) make a referee successful?”

Characteristics and Abilities of a Successful Referee	Mentions	Agreement %
Physical		
Physically Capable	29	98.1
Correct Positioning	20	98.1
Correct Movement	11	96.2
Proper Use of Body Language	6	98.1
Technical		
Knowledge of the Laws of the Game/ Ability to Apply the Laws of the Game	28	100
Football Understanding	14	100
Strong Communicator	14	98.1
Ability to Manage Players/Coaches	9	96.2
Ability to Anticipate Play	7	96.2
Teamwork	7	94.3
Makes the Correct Decisions	4	98.1
Experience	3	77.4
Psychological		
Composed Under Pressure	26	100
Focus	20	100
Mentally Tough	20	98.1
Confident	8	98.1
Adaptable	4	96.2
Courageous	4	90.6
Ability to Lead	3	90.6
Strong Personality	3	80.8
Professional		
Approachable	12	96.2
Committed	9	94.3
Humble	8	86.8
Mentally Prepared	6	100
Trustworthy	6	94.3
Student Mentality	4	90.6

Discussion

The aims of this study were to determine the definition of a successful referee performance and the characteristics of a successful referee from a broad range of stakeholders in MLS. Using a Delphi study approach, seven items were identified in the definition of a successful referee performance which show that refereeing is a complex endeavour. The 26 items comprising the characteristics of a successful referee show the multi-disciplinary aspect of evaluating and training referees.

The definition of a successful referee as expressed by the participants here builds on the definition provided by IFAB (the body that determines the laws of the game of Association Football) by adding 4 new pieces. These new parts emphasize the more complex role of a match official as the game of football has developed over time. It has grown from simply keeping time and signalling when the ball goes out of play to managing the players and coaches and attempting to keep the participants safe. Their responsibility for making correct decisions and minimizing their impact on the game has increased with the increasing monetary value of the leagues and teams (Ozanian and Teitelbaum, 2023). The goal in this study of expanding the definitional duties of a referee are an attempt to signify their increasing importance on the pitch. Giel and Brewer (2020), Webb (2020) and Dawson et al. (2021) have highlighted the large amount of abuse suffered by referees at all levels and the reduction in active referees. Increasing the definition of the duties of a successful referee could lead to an increased level of respect for the job they have to perform. Furthermore, conducting this research at the highest level could also mean that it may filter down to lower levels where future top-level referees are being developed.

The purpose of investigating referee performance is to ultimately try to understand how to make them better. The rationale for this study was to consider viewpoints from inside and outside of refereeing to build a consensus opinion of what characteristics a successful MLS referee possesses. A coach or general manager of a team may put a greater emphasis on certain aspects of a referee compared to what a referee assessor may focus on. It was important that these characteristics be framed in a way that focused on the referee themselves as opposed to their environment. The results also allow for the characteristics to later be examined within and outside of the context of a match.

While there are differences in focus and methodology between the previous and the current attempt to understand what makes a successful referee (Slack et al, 2013), (Pina et al. 2019), (Loghmani et al, 2021), (Mendes et al, 2021). Teamwork, game management, football understanding, experience and communication with participants were mentioned by each of these previous and the present study as an important component to a successful referee. These five aspects came through regardless of differences in focus of the studies; referee traits, organizational structure and environmental factors (Slack et al, 2013), execution of the match (Pina et al, 2019), career evaluation (Loghmani et al, 2021), descriptive traits of National Board Officials (Mendes et al, 2021) and characteristics of a successful referee (present study) or the methods utilized: analysis of a descriptive data set (Mendes et al, 2021), interviews (Slack et al, 2013; Loghmani et al, 2021; Pina et al, 2019) and survey (present study). In addition to these five characteristics agreed upon by these studies, physically capable, correct positioning and mentally tough are shared by Slack et al (2013), Pina et al (2019) and the present study and have been extensively examined in the referee literature. The combination of agreement between these three studies and the large footprint of examination of these characteristics in the literature lends credibility that these three characteristics be included as primary characteristics of a successful referee. As mentioned by the present study and Slack et al (2013) “makes the correct decision” was also part of the definition of a successful referee performance and is examined for both quantity (Helsen & Bultynck, 2004; Castillo et al.,2019) and quality (Castillo *et al.*, 2019)(Hossner *et al.*, 2019)(Mallo *et al.*, 2012) (Mascarenhas et al., 2013). This creates a set of nine primary characteristics that have strong support in the literature and seventeen secondary characteristics that have agreement between the present study and one previous study (Slack et al, 2013), (Pina et al. 2019), (Loghmani et al, 2021), (Mendes et al, 2021)as well as examination of the broader referee literature. Those who are interested in assessing and improving referee performance should focus on these nine primary characteristics and such characteristics could be used to develop an assessment metric for referees.

While understanding the characteristics of a successful referee is an important step it is critical to determine what it means for a referee to possess these characteristics. Creating definitions and criteria for each of these characteristics is a vital next step to allow for the creation of a

referee evaluation tool. Weston et al (2012) gives an overview of the physical work done by a referee during a match and while this gives a good picture of the demands placed upon the referee, it does not provide criteria for what it means to be successful in the category of physically capable. Is simply meeting the demands described in the review by Weston et al (2012) sufficient to be “successful” or does the official who wants to be successful need to strive for more? This same examination can also be applied to “correct positioning”. Hossner et al (2019), De Oliveira et al (2011) and Mallo et al (2012) have looked at what correct positioning means. There was not a consensus for what is the correct position for a referee relative to the ball. Is it 11-25m as a result of the combination of the recommendations of 11-15m (Mallo et al., 2012) and 20-25m (De Oliveira et al., 2011)? Does it depend on a number of different factors, i.e., speed, point of contact, number of players, angle of view? The characteristic “Makes the correct decision” follows the same pattern. Is there a threshold of % correct decisions that counts as successful? Does one incorrect big decision negate all the other decisions being correct or vice versa? The same questioning can be performed for the seven other primary characteristics and the 17 secondary characteristics previously discussed. An attempt to evaluate a performance based solely on these characteristics as they are now could lead to wildly different results as each item is open to interpretation. There ideally needs to be a criteria or definition created for each of these items with respect to a referee’s performance.

This study focusing directly on the referee themselves created a scaffold of a successful referee. What is needed next is to fill in each of these characteristics. Ideally a future study would consult subject matter experts to create a definition and scoring scale for each of these criteria. This could then be used to examine the relationship between these different characteristics and if they can be used to differentiate between levels of match official. The presence or absence of one of these characteristics in a referee could provide an area for improvement either within a category or between categories. The creation of the major categories allows for a high-level evaluation of where a referee is successful or unsuccessful. The individual characteristics then allows for a deeper dive into where within the major category a referee is successful or unsuccessful. The inclusion of viewpoints of coaches/general managers while not separated out in the present study helps to provide further support that the characteristics agreed upon by the

past and present studies are seen as important by stakeholders in referee performance outside of just those related specifically to refereeing.

The objective of this research was to create a basis from which to create an evaluation tool of referees to determine areas of strength and weakness. This could then be used to drive personal coaching and education to maximize the distribution of resources spent to improve officiating. In addition, it could help accomplish one of the objectives set out by Webb et al. (2021) of creating a clearly defined pathway for advancement. Any league or organization could determine what level of performance is needed in each of the categories before an official is ready for advancement.

Limitations

There are some limitations to this study that are worthy of consideration. Firstly, it is possible that the separation of individual variables is not the best way to evaluate match officials and a holistic evaluation would be more effective. Another limitation of this work is that it did not specifically ask about the effect of VAR on the success of the referee. Furthermore, this same work performed in other leagues may come to different conclusions based on how that culture views what it means for a referee to be successful. Moreover, this study also did not examine any potential differences in opinion between the different groups of respondents. Finally, this work investigated first division MLS referees and did not ask about lower division referees indicating that the findings specifically relate to a higher level and some caution might be needed if applying the results to lower playing/referee levels.

Conclusion

This work was able to define what a successful referee performance means within MLS and what the characteristics of a successful MLS Referee are. There were seven items in the definition of a successful referee performance showing that refereeing is a complex endeavour. The 26 characteristics and abilities of a successful MLS Referee indicate that evaluating and training referees is a multi-disciplinary endeavour. The criteria developed from this study can provide a framework for future research to develop assessment tools to evaluate match officials as well as education tools to help referees.

Declaration of Interest

The authors report there are no competing interests to declare.

References

- Castillo, D., Raya-Gonzales, J., Oidui, U., Camara-Tobalina, J., Castellano-Paulis, J and Yanci-Irgoyen, J. (2019) 'Analysis of the success in soccer match officials' decisions during an international tournament according to contextual factors. *RICYDE. Revista Internacional de Ciencias del Deporte*. doi:10.5232/ricyde, 15(57), pp. 225–234.
- Dawson, P., Webb, T. and Downward, P. (2021) 'Abuse is not a zero-sum game! The case for zero tolerance of match official physical and verbal abuse', *European Journal of Sport Science*, pp. 1–8. doi:10.1080/17461391.2021.1881619.
- De Oliveira, M.C, Orbetelli, R. and De Barros Neto, T.L. (2011) 'Call Accuracy and Distance from the Play: A Study with Brazilian Soccer Referees', *International Journal of Exercise Science*, 4(1), pp. 30–38.
- Giel, T. and Breuer, C. (2020) 'The determinants of the intention to continue voluntary football refereeing', *Sport Management Review*, 23(2), pp. 242–255. doi: 10.1016/j.smr.2019.01.005.
- Helsen, W. and Bultynck, J.-B. (2004a) 'Physical and perceptual-cognitive demands of top-class refereeing in association football', *Journal of Sports Sciences*, 22(2), pp. 179–189. doi:10.1080/02640410310001641502.
- Hossner, E.-J, Schnyder, U., Schmid, J., and Kredel, R. (2019) 'The role of viewing distance and viewing angle on referees' decision-making performance during the FIFA World Cup 2014', *Journal of Sports Sciences*, 37(13), pp. 1481–1489. doi:10.1080/02640414.2019.1570898.
- Kleynen, M., Braun, S., Bleijlevens, M., Lexis, M., Rasquin, S., Halfens, J., Wilson, M., Buerskens, A., and Masters, R. (2014) 'Using a Delphi Technique to Seek Consensus Regarding Definitions, Descriptions and Classification of Terms Related to Implicit and Explicit Forms of Motor Learning', *PLOS ONE*, 9(6), p. e100227. doi: 10.1371/journal.pone.0100227.
- Law 5 - The Referee | IFAB* (no date). Available at: <https://www.theifab.com/laws/latest/the-referee/#decisions-of-the-referee> (Accessed: 7 March 2022).
- Linstone, Harold & Turoff, Murray. (1975). *The Delphi Method: Techniques and Applications*. 10.2307/3150755.
- Loghmani, M., Cuskelly, G. and Webb, T. (2021) 'Examining the career dynamics of elite football referees: a unique identification profile', *Sport Management Review*, 24(3), pp. 517–542. doi:10.1080/14413523.2021.1879556.
- Mallo, J., Frutos, P.G., Juarez, D., and Navaro, E (2012) 'Effect of positioning on the accuracy of decision making of association football top-class referees and assistant referees during competitive matches', *Journal of Sports Sciences*, 30(13), pp. 1437–1445. doi:10.1080/02640414.2012.711485.

Mascarenhas, D., Button, C., and Dicks, H. (2013). Physical Performance and Decision Making in Association Football Referees: A Naturalistic Study. *The Open Sports Sciences Journal*, 2. 10.2174/1875399X00902010001.

Mendes, S., Travassos, B., and Oliveria, E.P. (2021) 'The Portuguese referee performance model', *International Journal of Sports Science & Coaching*, 16(5), pp. 1117–1125. doi:10.1177/17479541211006321.

Pina, JA., Passos, AM., Cavalho, H., and Maynard, T. (2019) 'To be or not to be an excellent football referee: different experts' viewpoints', *Journal of Sports Sciences*, 37(6), pp. 692–700. doi:10.1080/02640414.2018.1522940.

Quillen, I.N. (2022) *Judging Major League Soccer's New TV Deal with Apple May Take Years*, *Forbes*. Available at: <https://www.forbes.com/sites/ianquillen/2022/06/16/judging-major-league-soccers-new-tv-deal-with-apple-may-take-years/>.

Skulmoski, G.J., Hartman, F.T. and Krahn, J. (2007) 'The Delphi Method for Graduate Research', *Journal of Information Technology Education: Research*, 6(1), pp. 1–21.

Slack, L., Maynard, L., Butt, J., and Olusoga, P. (2013) 'Factors Underpinning Football Officiating Excellence: Perceptions of English Premier League Referees', *Journal of Applied Sport Psychology*, 25. doi:10.1080/10413200.2012.726935.

Teittelbaum, J. and Ozanian, M. (2023) 'The World's Most Valuable Soccer Teams 2023', *Forbes*. Available at: <https://www.forbes.com/lists/soccer-valuations>.

van der Horst, N., Backz, F., Goedhard, E., and Huisstede, B. (2017) 'Return to play after hamstring injuries in football (soccer): a worldwide Delphi procedure regarding definition, medical criteria and decision-making', *British Journal of Sports Medicine*, 51(22), pp. 1583–1591. doi:10.1136/bjsports-2016-097206.

Webb, T., Dicks, M., Thelwell, R., van der Kamp, J., and Rix-Lievre, G. (2020) 'An analysis of soccer referee experiences in France and the Netherlands: Abuse, conflict, and level of support', *Sport Management Review*, 23(1), pp. 52–65. doi: 10.1016/j.smr.2019.03.003.

Webb, T., O'Gorman, J. and Markham, L. (2021) 'Striving for excellence: talent identification and development in English football refereeing', *European Sport Management Quarterly*, 0(0), pp. 1–19. doi:10.1080/16184742.2020.1864748.

Weston, M., Castagna, C., Impellizzeri, F., Bizzini, M., William, A., and Gregson, W. (2012) 'Science and Medicine Applied to Soccer Refereeing', *Sports Medicine*, 42(7), pp. 615–631. doi:10.2165/11632360-000000000-00000.

Defining A Successful Referee Performance

Introduction

You are being contacted due to your role within Major League Soccer. This project is a partnership between Liverpool John Moores University and the Professional Referee Organization Performance and Analysis Department. The first aim of this project is to create a unified definition of what constitutes a successful referee performance. The second aim of this project is to create a list of key characteristics and abilities that make up a successful referee.

Background

Although it is clear a referee can have a major impact on the outcome of a football match, there is currently no clear definition of what makes a successful referee performance in the MLS. According to the International Football Association Board (IFAB), the current duties of a referee are to “1. Enforce the laws of the game. 2. Control the match in cooperation with the other match officials. 3. Act as timekeeper, keeps a record of the match and provide the appropriate authorities with a match report including information for disciplinary action and any other incidents that occurred before, during or after the match. 4. Supervise and/or indicate the restart of play.” In order to improve the quality of officiating there needs to be a definition what it means for a referee to be successful. The end goal is to utilize the results of this project to guide the training and selection of referees for Major League Soccer to enhance the profile of the league.

You are part of a panel consisting of MLS Team General Managers, MLS Coaches, MLS Players, MLS Officers, PRO Referees, PRO Management Staff, PRO Assessors, PRO Assistant Referees and Developmental Referees. As

subject matter experts you are asked to participate by responding to three brief questionnaires.

Questionnaire 1. A. What is your definition of a successful referee performance?

B. What are the characteristics and abilities of a successful referee?

Questionnaire 2. How would you rank these answers (1-5).

Questionnaire 3. How would you rank these answers(1-5).

After the third questionnaire's results are compiled, it is anticipated that the panel of experts' responses will form a consensus in answering Question 1, parts A and B.

This study has been ethically approved by Liverpool John Moores University Research Ethics Committee Reference number:19/SPS/053

I hereby agree to participate in this research project.

Yes

No

- Please select your role in relation to Major League Soccer

MLS Team General Manager

MLS Coach

MLS Officers

MLS Player

PRO Referee

PRO Assistant Referee

PRO Assessor

PRO Staff

Development Group Referee

If you were/are a referee/assistant referee, what was the highest level you officiated and how many years did you officiate?

If you were/are a coach, what is the highest level you have coached and for how many years did you coach

If you were/are a player, what is the highest level you played and how many years did you play?

Questionnaire 1

Thank you for taking the time to participate in this research project. The first part of this project consists of answering two questions. In the appropriate box below please provide your answers to the two questions.

Q1A. What is your definition of a successful referee performance?

Q1B. What characteristics (e.g., mental toughness, composure, focus etc.) or abilities (e.g., law knowledge, positioning, sprinting speed etc.) make a referee successful? Please list as many characteristics and abilities as you can.

Final Page

Thank you for taking the time to complete the 1st of 3 questionnaires. Questionnaire 2 will be sent to you in early January.



Appendix 2

Defining a Successful Referee Performance Part 2

Page 1: Introduction

Thank you for taking the time to complete part 1 questions A and B. I have consolidated your answers into themes. For part 2 of the survey, the goal is to get consensus on which themes should be included in defining successful referee performance. A consensus will be formed by having each item ranked on a 1-7 scale with 1 = not important and 7= Extremely important.

Below is a reminder as to the purpose of this project.

This project is a partnership between Liverpool John Moores University and the Professional Referee Organization Performance and Analysis Department. The first aim of this project is to create a unified definition of what constitutes a successful referee performance. The second aim of this project is to create a list of key characteristics and abilities that make up a successful referee.

Background

Although it is clear a referee can have a major impact on the outcome of a football match, there is currently no clear definition of what makes a successful referee performance in the MLS. According to the International Football Association Board (IFAB), the current duties of a referee are to “1. Enforce the laws of the game. 2. Control the match in cooperation with the other match officials. 3. Act as timekeeper, keeps a record of the match and provide the appropriate authorities with a match report including information on disciplinary action and any other incidents that occurred before, during or after the match. 4. Supervise and/or indicate the restart of play.”

In order to improve the quality of officiating there needs to be a definition of what it means for a referee to be successful. The end goal is to utilize the results of this project to guide the training and selection of referees for Major League Soccer in order to enhance the profile of the league.

You are part of a panel consisting of MLS Team General Managers, MLS Coaches, MLS Players, MLS Officers, PRO Referees, PRO Management Staff, PRO Assessors, PRO Assistant Referees and PRO2 Referees. As subject matter experts you are asked to participate by responding to three brief questionnaires.

Question A. What is your definition of a successful referee performance?

Question B. What are the characteristics and abilities of a successful referee?

1. Did you complete the 1st Survey?

Yes

No

2. Please select your role in relation to Major League Soccer

MLSTeam General Manager

MLS Coach

MLS Officers

MLS Player

PRO Referee

PRO Assistant Referee

PRO Assessor

PRO2 Referee

PRO Staff

Below are the themes collected from the responses to Question A. What is your definition of a successful referee performance?

A theme was created when there were more than 2 responses relating to that theme. Please rate the importance of each item.

3.

Please don't select more than 1 answer(s) per row.

	1– Not at all important	2– Low importance	3– Slightly important	4– Neutral	5– Moderately important	6– Very important	7– Extremely important
They control the game							
They communicate with the players							
No one talks about their impact on the game/they don't negatively impact the game							
They correctly enforce the laws of the game							
They make very few errors/all major decisions are correct							

They protect the health and safety of the players							
Each team feels like they received equal treatment							

Below are the themes collected from the responses to Question B. What are the characteristics and abilities of a successful referee?

The responses were divided into 4 major categories: Physical, Technical, Psychological, and Professional. The responses were then combined to create a theme. A theme was created when there were more than 2 responses relating to that theme.

Please rate the importance of each item.

Physical Characteristics and Abilities

4.

Please don't select more than 1 answer(s) per row.

	1– Not at all important	2– Low importance	3– Slightly important	4– Neutral	5– Moderately important	6– Very important	7– Extremely important
Physically Capable							
Correct Movement							
Correct Positioning							
Correct Use of Body Language							

Technical Characteristics and Abilities

5.

Please don't select more than 1 answer(s) per row.

	1– Not at all important	2– Low importance	3– Slightly important	4– Neutral	5– Moderately important	6– Very important	7– Extremely important

Strong Communicator							
Football Understanding							
Knowledge of the laws of the Game							
Ability to Apply the Laws of the Game							
Ability to Anticipate Play							
Ability to Manage Players/Coaches							
Makes the Correct Decisions							
Utilizes Teamwork							
Has Experience							

Psychological Characteristics and Abilities

6.

Please don't select more than 1 answer(s) per row.

	1– Not at all important	2– Low importance	3– Slightly important	4– Neutral	5 – Moderately important	6– Very important	7– Extremely important
Composed Under Pressure							
Focused							
Confident							

Resilient (Mentally Tough)							
Adaptable							
Courageous							
Ability to Lead							
Strong Personality							

Professional Characteristics and Abilities

7.

Please don't select more than 1 answer(s) per row.

	1– Not at all important	2– Low importance	3– Slightly important	4– Neutral	5– Moderately important	6– Very important	7– Extremely important
Trustworthy							
Committed							
Student Mentality							
Approachable							
Humble							
Mentally Prepared							

1 Page 4: Final page

2 Thank you for taking the time to complete Survey 2.

3

4

5