



## LJMU Research Online

Evers, SL, Yule, CM, Padfield, R, O'Reilly, P and Varkkey, H

**Keep wetlands wet: the myth of sustainable development of tropical peatlands - implications for policies and management.**

<http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/id/eprint/9648/>

### Article

**Citation** (please note it is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from this work)

**Evers, SL, Yule, CM, Padfield, R, O'Reilly, P and Varkkey, H (2016) Keep wetlands wet: the myth of sustainable development of tropical peatlands - implications for policies and management. *Global Change Biology*, 23 (2). pp. 534-549. ISSN 1354-1013**

LJMU has developed **LJMU Research Online** for users to access the research output of the University more effectively. Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Users may download and/or print one copy of any article(s) in LJMU Research Online to facilitate their private study or for non-commercial research. You may not engage in further distribution of the material or use it for any profit-making activities or any commercial gain.

The version presented here may differ from the published version or from the version of the record. Please see the repository URL above for details on accessing the published version and note that access may require a subscription.

For more information please contact [researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk](mailto:researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk)

<http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/>

1 **Title:** Keep wetlands Wet: The Myth of Sustainable Development of Tropical Peatlands –  
2 Implications for Policies and Management

3 **Running Head:** Myths of Sustainable Development of Southeast Asian Tropical Peatlands.

4 **Stephanie Evers**<sup>1, 6\*</sup>, **Catherine Yule**<sup>2, 6</sup>, **Rory Padfield**<sup>3, 6</sup>, **Patrick O'Reilly**<sup>4, 6</sup> and **Helena**  
5 **Varkkey**<sup>5, 6</sup>

6

7 <sup>1</sup> University of Nottingham Malaysia Campus, Jalan Broga, 43500 Semenyih, Selangor,  
8 Malaysia,

9 <sup>2</sup> Monash University Malaysia, Jalan Lagoon Selatan, Bandar Sunway, 47500 Subang Jaya,  
10 Selangor, Malaysia

11 <sup>3</sup> Malaysia-Japan International Institute of Technology, Universiti Teknologi Malaysia, Jalan  
12 Semerak, 54100, Malaysia

13 <sup>4</sup> Crops For the Future, Jalan Broga, 43500 Semenyih, Selangor, Malaysia

14 <sup>5</sup> Department of International & Strategic Studies and Asia-Europe Institute, University of  
15 Malaya, Jalan Universiti, 50603 Kuala Lumpur, Wilayah Persekutuan Kuala Lumpur,  
16 Malaysia

17 <sup>6</sup> Tropical Catchment Research Initiative (TROCARI); [www.trocari.com](http://www.trocari.com)

18 **\*Corresponding Address:** [Stephanie.Evers@nottingham.edu.my](mailto:Stephanie.Evers@nottingham.edu.my), +60 3 8924 8763

19 **Paper Type:** Review Article

20 **Abstract**

21 Pristine tropical peat swamp forests (PSFs) represent a unique wetland ecosystem of  
22 distinctive hydrology which support unique biodiversity and globally significant stores of soil  
23 carbon. Yet in Indonesia and Malaysia, home to 56% of the world's tropical peatland, they  
24 are subject to considerable developmental pressures, including widespread drainage to  
25 support agricultural needs. In this paper we review the ecology behind the functioning and  
26 ecosystem services provided by PSFs, with a particular focus on hydrological processes as  
27 well as the role of the forest itself in maintaining those services. Drawing on this, we review

28 the suitability of current policy frameworks and consider the efficacy of their  
29 implementation. We suggest that while policies in Indonesia and Malaysia, as well as  
30 regionally, are often based around the narrative of oil palm and other major monocrops as  
31 drivers of prosperity and development, we also show that this narrative is also being  
32 supported by on a-priori claims concerning the possibility of sustainability of peat swamp  
33 exploitation via drainage-based agriculture through the adherence to best management  
34 practices. We discuss how this limits their efficacy, uptake and the political will towards  
35 enforcement, and consider how both narratives (prosperity and sustainability) clearly exclude  
36 important considerations concerning the ecosystem value of tropical PSFs which are  
37 dependent on their un-impacted hydrology. Current research clearly shows that the actual  
38 debate should be focused not on how to develop drainage-based plantations sustainably, but  
39 on whether the sustainable conversion to drainage-based systems is possible at all.

#### 40 **Keywords**

41 Tropical Peatlands, Hydrology, Climate change, Policy, Management, Indonesia, Malaysia,  
42 COP21

#### 43 **Introduction**

44 Tropical lowland peat swamp forests (PSFs) are unique ecosystems. Defined by their  
45 hydrology, they are permanently waterlogged and in their natural state, flood up to 50 cm or  
46 more during the wet season. As a consequence, the peat substrate is anaerobic, highly acidic  
47 (pH2.9-4) and low in nutrients. These conditions inhibit heterotrophic and root respiration  
48 and also organic matter decomposition (Yule & Gomez, 2008; Mezbahuddin *et al.*, 2014).  
49 Consequently, plant material slowly and only partially decomposes resulting in a net  
50 accumulation of organic matter. The peat forms over millennia to create domes up to 20 m  
51 deep (Page *et al.*, 2011). As a consequence, these systems are globally significant carbon (C)

52 stores, holding 11-14% (69Gt) of global peat C (Page *et al.*, 2011). As the formation of peat  
53 is controlled by the rate and extent of microbial decomposition of plant matter, maintenance  
54 of net organic C accumulation is controlled by litter type and production rate, soil biotic  
55 community assemblage and critically, the associated habitat conditions, including most  
56 importantly, the hydrology of the ecosystem in which these interactions occur.

57 Southeast Asia contains an estimated 56% of all tropical peatlands (Page *et al.*, 2011), mostly  
58 in Indonesia and Malaysia. Southeast Asian peatlands are also some of the deepest, averaging  
59 5.5-7m (Page *et al.*, 2011), compared to South American peats; averaging 0.5-6m (Page *et*  
60 *al.*, 2011). These peats represent long-term C stores, with the majority of Southeast Asian  
61 peats, especially those in coastal areas, at 3000-7000 years BP (Dommain *et al.*, 2011).  
62 However, inland regional peats can be much older. For example, samples collected from  
63 Sebangau, Kalimantan were found to be up to 28,000 years BP (Wüst *et al.*, 2011)

64

65 The substantial expansion of agroforestry in the both Malaysia and Indonesia has created  
66 significant demand for land. The relatively small human populations in large and contiguous  
67 areas of peat swamps coupled with perceptions of these areas as economically unproductive  
68 ‘wastelands’ (Government of Malaysia, 2015), has contributed to a idea that PSFs offer a  
69 large, and relatively cheap land bank for large-scale agroforestry (Varkkey, 2016). Within the  
70 last two decades, forest cover on peat swamps has reduced from 77 to 36% in Indonesia and  
71 Malaysia (Miettinen *et al.*, 2012a) with industrial plantations covering approx. 20% of the  
72 region’s peatland (Miettinen *et al.*, 2012b). Commercially, mono-cropping of palm oil in  
73 Malaysia currently contributes 5-6% of GDP (MPOB, 2011) and its growth as an industry is  
74 closely associated with the countries’ rapid modernisation, as is evidenced through its  
75 popular characterisation as the ‘golden crop’ (Varkkey, 2016). The overall contribution of

76 palm oil to the Indonesian economy stands at 7% (IST & GCP, 2014). Combined, both  
77 countries account for 85% of global production.

78

79 The process of peat swamp conversion has been, and remains a subject of considerable  
80 controversy in both nations and internationally. Those in support argue for expansion of oil  
81 palm on grounds of national economic development. Central to this narrative is the principle  
82 that, both countries have the right to utilise their natural resources in order to achieve  
83 development goals (Hezri & Hasan, 2006). This has been supported by the production and  
84 promotion of ‘divergent knowledge’ (Goldstein, 2015); that is, the production and  
85 widespread use of data that suggests the minimal impacts or even environmental benefits of  
86 conversion (e.g. World Growth, 2011). This data is often funded by industry research bodies  
87 and primarily published in industrial and non-peer reviewed journals (Goldstein, 2015)). Yet  
88 while it is largely written off by the international scientific community, such data is employed  
89 to sway debates on PSF management, challenging evidence presented by conservation  
90 advocates and fuelling support for continued peatland conversion as part of the development  
91 agenda (Goldstein, 2015). Where acknowledgement of impacts is given, the popular  
92 discourse emerging is that ecological harm committed in the course of doing so can be  
93 significantly mitigated via sustainable development practices (e.g. Government of Indonesia,  
94 2009). As a consequence, the current research and development trajectory around palm oil  
95 focuses on the sustainable management or ‘wise use’ (Joosten & Clarke, 2002) of plantations  
96 and other drainage-based agriculture on tropical peatland (Padfield *et al.*, 2014; Hansen *et al.*,  
97 2015). While these studies have strengthened arguments for improved plantation  
98 management, they have also supported a concept of sustainable palm oil on both peat and  
99 mineral soils primarily via the voluntary adoption of a range of sustainability measures by the

100 industry (e.g. Roundtable for Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO, 2012); Melling *et al.*; Othman *et*  
101 *al.*, 2011).

102 While the palm oil sustainability lobby has claimed some success, a growing local and  
103 international literature (Padfield *et al.*, 2014) is focused not on optimal management but on  
104 the functioning of intact PSFs, loss of function with conversion and role of tropical PSFs in  
105 regulating a host of important ecosystem services, including carbon sequestration, flood  
106 regulation, biodiversity and water supply. These efforts have highlighted the link between  
107 peatland degradation and global carbon emissions. For example, Hooijer *et al.*, (2010)  
108 estimated that CO<sub>2</sub> emissions due to peat degradation, fire and fluvial losses  
109 following peatland drainage in Southeast Asia contribute the equivalent of 1.3% to 3.1%  
110 of current global CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from fossil fuels. Consequently, these studies have raised  
111 significant questions concerning the direct and indirect environmental impacts of the palm oil  
112 industry on PSFs and the implications that current concepts around sustainability have for the  
113 protection of PSFs. In light of this body of literature, this paper will seek to explore one  
114 particular critical issue surrounding the development of peatlands which to to-date is often  
115 avoided; primarily, that before considering how to sustainably manage peat swamps for  
116 drainage-based plantations, we must first consider if we *should*. In this paper we seek to  
117 unpack some of the a-priori assumptions surrounding the sustainable exploitation of peat  
118 swamps via intensive monoculture and question if it is an achievable goal. In order to do so  
119 we address four questions:

- 120 1. What are the critical elements of a PSF that contribute to its functioning and provision  
121 of ecosystem services?
- 122 2. What are the impacts of development of these PSFs in terms of ecosystem loss and  
123 subsequent environmental pressures?

124 3. To what extent do current public and private initiatives serve to ameliorate the  
125 negative impacts of peat conversion?

126 4. And critically, given our understanding of peatland functioning, is sustainable  
127 development of peatlands possible, and under what conditions?

128

## 129 **PSF Functioning and Ecosystem services**

130 Tropical PSFs provide a range of local, regional and globally significant environmentally and  
131 economically significant ecosystem services (Rieley & Page, 2001). Those most  
132 fundamentally recognised include significant carbon sequestration and storage, rich  
133 biodiversity (including a range of endemic, specialised and endangered species, uniquely  
134 adapted to this wetland environment; Posa *et al.*, (2011), and important local hydrological  
135 regulation, such as water storage, protection against sea water intrusions (Kumari, 1996) and  
136 reducing the impact of flooding during the wet season (Wösten *et al.*, 2008).

### 137 *Carbon sequestration*

138 Unlike temperate peats, tropical peatlands in their natural state are primarily forested. These  
139 forests comprise uniquely adapted species; trees with tolerance to waterlogged and low  
140 nutrient conditions (Ng & Ibrahim, 2001; Ong *et al.*, 2015) and also high C sequestration  
141 capacity (Dommain *et al.*, 2014). However, while all tropical forests are important for above-  
142 ground C sequestration via production of woody biomass, PSFs store a further 5-40 times as  
143 much C below ground (Warren *et al.*, 2012). Sequestration of C in tropical peats can be much  
144 greater than temperate peats due to higher rates of primary production. As a consequence,  
145 sequestration rates can exceed  $80 \text{ g C m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$  (as opposed to the  $8\text{-}61 \text{ g C m}^{-2} \text{ yr}^{-1}$  recorded  
146 for higher latitude peats) (Roulet, 2000; Page *et al.*, 2004).

148 The plant communities of peat swamp forests are distinct from dryland forests such as  
149 lowland dipterocarp forests because their inhabitants require many adaptations to survive in  
150 the waterlogged, unstable, toxic (due to high levels of phenolic compounds such as tannins  
151 and humic acids), acidic, peat environment where the forest floor is seasonally flooded (Table  
152 1). Posa *et al.*, (2011) estimated that 11% of peat swamp plant species are endemic. Physical  
153 adaptations such as buttress, stilt and knee roots as well as pneumatophores provide stability  
154 and enhance gas exchange while an extremely thick surface root mat facilitates oxygenation  
155 and rapid uptake of nutrients from senescent leaves as soon as they fall. The plants also invest  
156 in physical (e.g. spines, thorns, toughness) and chemical (e.g. aromatic oils, latex, resins,  
157 secondary phenolic compounds) defences against herbivores and microbes (Yule, 2010).  
158 Leaching of phenolic compounds from senescent leaves creates the characteristic acidic  
159 blackwaters of PSF, which retard microbial decomposition (Freeman *et al.*, 2004).  
160 Consequently, clearing of the natural vegetation removes the source of the organic matter  
161 which forms the peat and also reverses the physical conditions required for peat accretion.  
162 These flooded forests, with their micro-topography of hummocks and pools, seasonal  
163 flooding and Dissolved Organic Carbon (DOC)-rich acidic water are vital for an array of  
164 uniquely adapted taxa including more than 200 freshwater fish species (Posa *et al.*, 2011)  
165 many of which (more than 102 species) are found nowhere else (i.e. stenotopic and unique to  
166 the habitat; Giam *et al.*, (2012), such as *Paedocypris progenetica*, the smallest known  
167 vertebrate in the world (Kottelat *et al.*, 2006). These habitats are also important habitats for a  
168 range of endangered large and charismatic fauna (Posa *et al.*, 2011) (Table 1). For example,  
169 the richest remaining habitats for orangutans are high-quality swamp forests and lowland  
170 alluvial forests (Russon *et al.*, 2001). PSFs are also important for proboscis monkeys  
171 (Phillips, 1998), the flat-headed cat, Sunda clouded leopard, marbled cat (Cheyne *et al.*,



172 2009) and Sumatran tiger (Wibisono & Pusparini, 2010), as well as being the preferential  
 173 habitat of the endangered false gharial (Bezuijen *et al.*, 2001).

174

175 Table 1: Endangered mammals and birds occurring in regional peat swamp forests (\* = close  
 176 association with water)

Family	Species	Common name	Notes	Authors
Cercopithecidae	<i>Macaca siberu</i>	Siberut macaque	Population declines due to hunting and habitat loss	Nijman <i>et al.</i> , 2008
Cercopithecidae	<i>Nasalis larvatus</i>	Proboscis monkey	* Population declines due to hunting and habitat loss	Nijman <i>et al.</i> , 2008; Posa <i>et al.</i> , 2011
Cercopithecidae	<i>Presbytis chrysomelas</i>	Bornean banded langur	Now considered one of rarest primates in the world. Occurs in < 5% of its historic range	Nijman <i>et al.</i> , 2008; Posa <i>et al.</i> , 2011
Cercopithecidae	<i>Presbytis chrysomelas cruciger</i>	Tri-coloured langur	Now only recorded from a small patch of degraded peat swamp forest in Maludam National Park in Sarawak. May already be extinct	Sebastian, 2002; Nijman <i>et al.</i> , 2008
Cercopithecidae	<i>Presbytis potenziani</i>	Mentawai langur	Lower densities in PSF than dryland forests due to lack of emergent resting trees and lack of suitable food	Quinten <i>et al.</i> , 2010
Cercopithecidae	<i>Simias concolor</i>	Pig-tailed langur	Densities in PSF comparable to those in dryland forests	Quinten <i>et al.</i> , 2010
Hylobatidae	<i>Hylobates klossi</i>	Gibbon	Population declines due to hunting and habitat loss	Nijman <i>et al.</i> , 2008; Quinten <i>et al.</i> , 2010
Hominidae	<i>Pongo pygmaeus</i>	Orang utan	Population declines due to habitat loss, poaching and pet trade	Morrogh-Bernard <i>et al.</i> , 2003; Nijman <i>et al.</i> , 2008
Felidae	<i>Neofelis diardi</i>	Sunda clouded leopard	Population declines due to habitat loss and poaching	Posa <i>et al.</i> , 2011
Felidae	<i>Panthera tigris</i>	Tiger	Population declines due to habitat loss and poaching - particularly for traditional Asian medicine	Posa <i>et al.</i> , 2011
Felidae	<i>Pardofelis marmorata</i>	Marbled cat	Population declines due to habitat loss and poaching	Posa <i>et al.</i> , 2011
Felidae	<i>Priornailurus planiceps</i>	Flat-headed cat	* Fish-eating river specialists. Rarely observed > 3 km from water.	Bezuijen <i>et al.</i> , 2001
Ursidae	<i>Helarctos malayanus</i>	Malayan sun bear	Population declines due to habitat loss and poaching	Latiff, 2005
Elephantidae	<i>Elephas maximus</i>	Asiatic elephant	* Population declines due to habitat loss and poaching	Bezuijen <i>et al.</i> , 2001
Tapiridae	<i>Tapirus indicus</i>	Tapir	Population declines due to habitat loss and poaching	Latiff, 2005
Mustelidae	<i>Lutra sumatrana</i>	Hairy nosed otter	*One of the rarest otter species. Eats fish and crustaceans. Recorded from Toa Daeng PSF in Thailand	Kanchanasaka, 2001
Viverridae	<i>Cynogale bennettii</i>	Otter-civet	* Semi-aquatic. Forages in water	Ross <i>et al.</i> , 2015

177

178

179 Due to extensive destruction of lowland forests, regional peat swamp forests are increasingly  
180 becoming refuges for terrestrial vertebrates, particularly because the high water tables and  
181 unstable peat substrate render accessibility for poachers difficult (Gumal, 2004).  
182 Furthermore, contrary to the common perception of low productivity, studies by (Cannon *et*  
183 *al.*, 2007), showed that Borneo PSF provide a more reliable food supply than lowland dryland  
184 forests because most do not exhibit supra-annual mast fruiting. Instead, fruits are available  
185 for extended periods of time (trees fruit for up to 8 months). Sebastian, (2002) noted that 57  
186 species of mammals (not including Muridae and Chiroptera) and 237 birds from Malaysian  
187 PSFs were listed by IUCN as globally threatened (no doubt these numbers are now higher).

188 *Local hydrological regulation and flood prevention*

189 Embodying the paradox of "high and wet" (Dau, 1823), intact PSF dome hydrology is self-  
190 regulating (Dommain *et al.*, 2010). Due to formation from woody debris, PSF peats have  
191 naturally large soil pore sizes (Huat *et al.*, 2011). Yet while these peats can store more water,  
192 they also have increased hydraulic conductivity. If constant, this would result in rapid  
193 drainage of water under dryer conditions. Yet, the juxtaposition is solved through the  
194 dynamic movement of surface soil layers. During flooding conditions, buoyant soils, with a  
195 more open pore surface structure, store excess water and in doing so, regulate peak discharge  
196 and reduce erosion. When natural water levels drop, soil buoyancy drops and gravity-driven  
197 compaction of surface soil reduces pore size and with it, hydraulic conductivity (Price, 2003).  
198 This mechanism by intact uppermost peat layers therefore limits the amplitude of water table  
199 fluctuations under varying meteorological conditions. Therefore, any artificial compaction

200 (such as that recommended by Melling *et al.* for monoculture) or drainage inhibits the self-  
201 regulating capability, effecting not only the area in question, but also the entire hydrological  
202 unit of the dome in terms of reduced water storage and regulatory capacity, and also  
203 expediting problems associated with land subsidence (See below).

204

205 The architectural complexity of the PSF is also critical to this self-regulation, playing a  
206 prominent role in regulating the run-off of water. Complex rooting systems of endemic PSF  
207 trees, especially those with buttress roots, form barriers to gravity-driven water movement off  
208 the dome (Takahashi *et al.*, 2001). The natural hummock-hollow surface patterns created by  
209 the vegetation rooting systems also act as a collection of small weirs (Herwitz, 1988). Given  
210 the natural tree zonation patterns on domes as described in previous studies (e.g. Page *et al.*,  
211 (1999), these hydrology-regulating structures dominate the edges of the dome, coinciding  
212 with where the surface topographic gradient is greatest and the retardation of surface run-off  
213 most critical, contributing to the storage of excess water during rain events and the controlled  
214 slow release during dry periods.

## 215 **Impacts from development of peat**

### 216 *Land Use Conversion*

217 Despite the globally significant ecological value, up to 84% of the 25MHa of peatlands found  
218 in Southeast Asia have been drained (Hooijer *et al.*, 2010). Since the 1970s, deforestation and  
219 drainage has been brought about not only by the accelerating demand for land for agriculture,  
220 but also the value of associated timber. Of the remaining 36% forest cover on PSFs in  
221 Indonesia and Malaysia (Miettinen *et al.*, 2012a), only 10% can be classed as in pristine  
222 condition (Miettinen & Liew, 2010). In areas not converted to agriculture and other land uses,  
223 deforestation is still widespread via both selective and clear-felled logging, resulting in solar

224 exposure, habitat loss, uncontrolled fires and widespread forest drainage and canal  
 225 construction to facilitate timber extraction.

226

227 Intact forest water table fluctuations generally range from -30 to +30cm, with water levels  
 228 above the soil surface for many months of the year (Pahang Forestry Department, 2005;  
 229 Hooijer *et al.*, 2012; Comeau *et al.*, 2013). Only during strong El Niño years is there evidence  
 230 of intact forest water table depths (WTDs) falling below 40cm (e.g. Usup *et al.*, 2004).  
 231 However, both Acacia and oil palm require drainage of soils for growth and productive yields  
 232 (Table 2), resulting in the requirement for extensive drainage throughout a given plantation.

233 Table 2: Examples of recommended oil palm plantation drainage levels according to the  
 234 range of studies and government research organizations detailed below. It should be noted  
 235 that all guidelines recommend immediate drainage when levels reach -25cm WTD.

From surface (cm)	From drains (cm)	Reference
-50 to -75	-	Melling <i>et al.</i>
-40 to -60	50-70	RSPO, 2012
-30 to -50*	35-60*	MPOB, 2011
-50 to -80	-	Mutert <i>et al.</i> , 1999

236 \* Specific depth range dependant on age class of plantation.

237

### 238 *Carbon Emissions*

239 Alteration of the soil environment via drainage and the resulting peat oxidation alters the  
 240 community composition, abundance, and activity levels of microorganisms, increasing rates  
 241 of decomposition and GHG emissions via enhanced extracellular enzyme activities (Freeman  
 242 et al. 1996) and increased microbial biomass (Mäkiranta *et al.*, 2009). Consequently, drained  
 243 peats revert from C stores to C sinks, with CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from drained peats ranging from  
 244 22 to 100t ha<sup>-1</sup> year<sup>-1</sup> (Murayama & Bakar, 1996; Hooijer *et al.*, 2012). Indeed, a number of  
 245 studies and associated models have shown a positive relationship between decreasing long-  
 246 term WTD and soil respiration as well as C losses (Couwenberg *et al.*, 2010; Hooijer *et al.*,

247 2010; Carlson *et al.*, 2012). For example, Hooijer *et al.*, (2010) suggested that that soil CO<sub>2</sub>  
248 emissions increase by 0.91 Mg ha<sup>-1</sup> year<sup>-1</sup> for every centimetre of long-term lowered WTD.  
249 However, (Carlson *et al.*, 2015) suggested that while positively correlated, WTD only  
250 described 45% of the variation in net C loss from plantation mass balance equations, with  
251 additional issues such as fertiliser application, fluvial flux from peat instability and plantation  
252 micro-site heterogeneity having potential to contribute. The debate over GHG emissions from  
253 converted peat soils has resulted in a narrative which often considers the peat merely as a  
254 medium for plantation growth, where the sole consideration for sustainability is to reduce soil  
255 respiration. Yet even at this level, considerations of net C balance (especially where  
256 comparisons are made with forest GHG emissions) must also consider the continuous  
257 contribution of natural PSF vegetation cover which is resistant to microbial decomposition.  
258 Significantly, oil palms do not produce such resistant litter, and require fertilizers and lime.  
259 Combined, this enhances microbial respiration and thus GHG emissions and replacement of  
260 organic matter is also greatly diminished. Indeed Hooijer *et al.*, (2012) showed that even at  
261 the highest possible WTD, only 20% deductions in total CO<sub>2</sub> emissions could be achieved.  
262 Similarly, even with WTD adherence consistent with sustainability certification group,  
263 RSPO, of 40-60cm annual average WTD, a significant net carbon footprint of *c.* 60 tonnes of  
264 CO<sub>2</sub> ha<sup>-1</sup>year<sup>-1</sup> results (derived from Page *et al.*, (2011b) and Jauhiainen *et al.*, (2012)).

265

#### 266 *Fluvial Carbon Losses*

267 In tropical PSF catchments, fluvial C fluxes are dominated by organic forms, contributing  
268 between approximately 370 Tg of total organic carbon (TOC) to marine pools (Meybeck,  
269 1993). The importance of these ‘blackwaters’ in relation to C loss from PSF conversion and  
270 drainage, have only recently come to the fore. Moore *et al.*, (2013) showed a 50% increase in  
271 fluvial C export due to artificial drainage as compared to intact sites. When included in total

272 emissions factors, there is a 20% increase in overall flux. However, how much of this  
273 aquatic-based C is actually degassed to the atmospheric C pool remains very poorly  
274 understood (Sjögersten *et al.*, 2014). Jauhiainen & Silvennoinen (2012) recorded substantial  
275 CO<sub>2</sub> (9 -16 tC-CO<sub>2</sub> ha<sup>-1</sup> year<sup>-1</sup>) and CH<sub>4</sub> (0.27-3.0 tC-CH<sub>4</sub> ha<sup>-1</sup> year<sup>-1</sup>) emissions from water  
276 surfaces of drainage canals in Sumatra (Acacia) and Borneo (abandoned peat).  
277 Furthermore, <sup>14</sup>C aging of DOC from disturbed TPSFs also show that much older (>1000 yrs)  
278 fluvial C is being released from disturbed sites, indicating increasing deep instability of  
279 drained peatlands (Moore *et al.*, 2013).

280

### 281 *Subsidence*

282 Subsidence is the combined processes of organic matter decomposition via oxidation,  
283 compaction and shrinkage of peat volume above the water table and compression below the  
284 water table. Hooijer *et al.*, (2012) found an average subsidence rate of 142cm for the first 5  
285 years after drainage (with 75cm lost in the first year), with levels stabilising at 5cm per year  
286 loss in soils of an annual average WTD of 0.7m. Others have found similar rates of long-term  
287 loss from 3.6cm (at 0.5m WTD) and even 8.9cm/yr (DID & LAWOO, 1996; Hensen *et al.*,  
288 2002, respectively), continuing as long as drainage of peat is ongoing. While these sites can  
289 initially be gravity drained, soil height will eventually reach sea or adjacent river levels, thus  
290 constraining the outflow of water, making surrounding peats undrainable and leading to  
291 increased intensity and frequency of flooding as well as potential seawater intrusion  
292 (Andriess, 1988). By modelling subsidence based on a conservative 3.5cm/yr soil height  
293 loss, Hooijer *et al.*, (2015) estimated flooding potential for the entire Rajang river delta  
294 850,000ha area, Sarawak at 42% in 25 years and an alarming 82% in 100 years. Given that  
295 these extensive peats have formed in the coastal lowlands of Southeast Asia, where tectonic  
296 movements over the last 8000 years have reduced the elevation of many coastal zones, peat

297 horizons regionally often extend below sea level. Such flood predictions can therefore be  
298 expanded to the larger coastal peats of Malaysia and Indonesia with drainage. These impacts  
299 will also be confounded by sea level rise and climate change. Therefore it is important to  
300 state that as well as globally catastrophic GHG emissions, subsidence will result in the  
301 irreversible loss of extensive coastal land in effected regions, impacting local communities,  
302 industries and ironically, the yield and revenue of the plantations responsible. The resulting  
303 income losses alongside increased expenditure required for flood defences and community  
304 rehousing, means that the economic and social sustainability of such practices must be  
305 seriously questioned.

306

### 307 *Burning*

308 Lowering the WTD via drainage affects the moisture content of the peat making the organic  
309 matter extremely vulnerable to ignition. Fires in peatland not only burn the surface  
310 vegetation, but also the peat deposits up to 100 cm below the surface (Boehm *et al.*, 2001).  
311 While very shallow fires could be considered as carbon neutral (burning only the modern,  
312 rapidly cycled carbon; Trumbore, 2009) deep combustion following repetitive or deeper  
313 burning has the potential to affect centuries to millennia old C stores (Turetsky *et al.*, 2015).

314

315 Smouldering (or the slow, low-temperature, flameless burning of porous fuels) is the  
316 dominant form of burning in peat deposits. These fires can persist under low temperatures  
317 and in peat soils with high soil moisture and low oxygen, even crossing wet layers above  
318 250% moisture content (Huang & Rein, 2015). Further, the high wood content and low bulk  
319 density of tropical peat enables oxygen to be supplied to the deeper layers exacerbating deep  
320 combustion (Usup *et al.*, 2004), causing long-term damage to soil systems (Rein *et al.*, 2008).  
321 Hydrology and in particular, the WTD and the moisture content of the soil, govern the

322 ignition, spread and the ultimate extinction of a peat fire (Garlough & Keyes, 2011; Watts,  
323 2013).

324

325 Southeast Asian ‘haze’ episodes associated with peat forest burning are now considered to be  
326 an annual phenomenon (Varkkey, 2016). Indeed, in 1997, peat fires released approximately  
327 0.95 Gt of C, equivalent to ~15% of global fossil fuel emissions of the same time period  
328 (Page *et al.*, 2002). Apart from a decline in ecosystem function and biodiversity, altered  
329 biogeochemical processes and increased GHG emissions, human health issues have become a  
330 pressing issue. Peat fires contribute *c.* 80% of the regional haze (Applegate *et al.*, 2002). Air  
331 Pollution Index readings in Palangkaraya in Borneo in October 2015 reached >2000, the  
332 highest values ever recorded and far above the Emergency level of >500 (BMKG). Exposure  
333 to haze events has been shown to cause both immediate and delayed effects, increasing  
334 respiratory related mortality from 19-66% (Sahani *et al.*, 2014). Indeed, in the most recent  
335 2015 fires, an estimated 503,874 Indonesians were affected by haze related respiratory  
336 infections (BNPB, 2015, as cited in The Jakarta Post, 2015a). Economic losses related to haze  
337 are also significant, with estimates for the 2015 fires at \$16.1 billion for Indonesia (Center for  
338 International Forestry Research, 2015).

339

340 Un-drained pristine tropical swamps are generally fire-resistant, owing to the low-  
341 flammability of water-saturated soils (Turetsky *et al.*, 2015). Regional airport visibility  
342 records since the 1960s indicate no evidence of severe fires prior to large-scale conversion of  
343 PSFs to agricultural use (Field *et al.*, 2009).

344

345 *Social impacts*



346 Even though permanent human population density in PSFs is comparatively low, there are  
347 communities who live on their fringes and rely on the ecosystem services and livelihoods  
348 provided by the intact forest. In Indonesia alone, this figure reaches more than 10 million  
349 people (Mahmud, 2013). Local people have, for generations sustainably harvested paddy,  
350 sago, rattan, medicinal plants, roots, leaves, berries, honey, and birds' nests, both for their  
351 own subsistence and for exchange (van Noordwijk *et al.*, 2014), with fish being the highest  
352 value resource (Andiko, 2015). This resource is dependent on the maintenance of a pristine  
353 ecosystem (Ramakrishna, 2005). While the loss of PSF results in fish catch and associated  
354 income declines (Anshari & Armiyarsih, 2005), land development also effects water quality  
355 for bathing, washing and drinking as well as the increase in flooding events described above.

356

357 The extensive impact of peatland development in Malaysia and Indonesia has prompted a  
358 response in the form of policies and guidelines to promote environmentally sustainable  
359 development of peatlands. Such policies envision a 'win-win' scenario whereby ecosystem  
360 services are maintained and a productive, profitable yield from drainage-based agriculture  
361 achieved. In the following section, we will examine whether policies and management  
362 practices designed to sustainably manage these wetlands:

- 363 a) Take full account of the hydrological requirements for ecosystem functions;
- 364 b) Are implemented effectively, and
- 365 c) Have goals which are even achievable given the conflict between the hydrological  
366 requirements of a functioning peat swamp and the needs of drainage-based agriculture.

367

### 368 **Peatland policies: The global context**

369 While individual countries may have specific peatland land-use policies, in the tropics, only  
370 Malaysia and Indonesia have developed peatland-specific policies related to conservation and

371 sustainable development (Table 3). Globally, some umbrella protection is provided via  
 372 protected areas (PAs) legislation. The most important of which, is the Convention on  
 373 Wetlands of International Importance, known as the Ramsar Convention (Ramsar, 2014).  
 374 Established in 1971 the Ramsar Convention requires member states to identify, quantify and  
 375 value peatlands. Ramsar also urges its member countries to include at least one peatland site  
 376 designation per country (Anshari & Armiyarsih, 2005). Despite the increasing number of  
 377 designated Ramsar wetland sites in the world (2,234 sites at a total of 215 million hectares in  
 378 2016), they represent only a fraction of the total amount of global peatlands. Thus, the extent  
 379 to which PA designation implemented at a global level coincides with peatland areas in the  
 380 tropics appears low (Anshari & Armiyarsih, 2005). As such, policy initiatives instigated for  
 381 Indo-Malaysian peats are likely to strongly influence any future political reforms and  
 382 associated peatland functionality across tropical peatlands zones globally as development  
 383 (and oil palm expansion, specifically) puts increased pressure on frontiers such as Africa and  
 384 Central/South America.

385 Table 3: Peatland policies in ASEAN with a specific focus on hydrology management.  
 386

Stakeholder	Country	Policy name & Author	Policy influence	Peatland hydrology policy specifics
Government	Malaysia	<i>Malaysian National Action Plan for Peatlands (2011)</i> - Ministry of Natural Resources & Environment	Overarching policy document for peatland management in Malaysia. Not legally binding, merely guidelines.	No detailed information provided on hydrology management. General recommendation provided on aspects such as fire prevention, zero-burn strategies to prevent impairing of hydrology, application of fertilizer within a defined schedule, and the need to establish a baseline of hydrology data.
Government	Indonesia	<i>Protection and Management of Peatland Ecosystem (2014)</i> - Republic of Indonesia (71/2014)	Overarching policy document for peatland management in Indonesia. Mandatory and legally binding.	Specific details on management of hydrology include: - Water table should be maintained at 40cm or below Guidance is also provided on the depth of peatlands for development. The policy states that it is prohibited to cultivate or develop peatland area if peat depth is > 3m. Peat >3m is automatically designated as a protected

				ecosystem. Where peat <3m and development has been authorized, 30% of the designated area should be protected. Peatland is classified as damaged if the water table is >1m below the surface of the peat.
Government	Indonesia	<i>Guideline on Oil Palm Plantation on Peatland (2009)</i> - Ministry of Agriculture (14/Permentan/PL.110/2/2009)	Overarching policy document for palm oil cultivation on peatland in Indonesia. Mandatory and legally binding.	Specific details on management of hydrology and include: - Water table should be maintained between 60 cm to 80 cm depth - Periphery drains are required to have a width of 4 meters, bottom width of 3 meter and with depth of 2 to 3 meter Guidance is also provided on the depth of peatlands for palm oil cultivation with recommendation that cultivation is not allowed where peat is >3 m deep and that the cultivation area must have a minimum of 70% of peat at < 3 meters.
Palm oil industry association	Malaysia	Various research publications - Malaysia Palm Oil Board (MPOB)	MPOB provide important guidance for planters cultivating on peat; however, policies are not enforceable and legally binding but preferred management guidelines	Specific details on management of hydrology include: - Groundwater level of 50-70 cm depth from the peat surface should be maintained for the best performance of oil palms. For Oil palm of 1-3 years, 30-40 cm water level from peat surface; For oil palms of age 4-7 years (Young mature oil palms), 35-45 cm water level from peat surface; for oil palms of > 8 years (Fully Mature), 40-50 cm water level from peat surface required. - Drought and peat fires should be avoided by maintaining a good water level of 40-50 cm in peatland drainage.
NGO	n/a	<i>Best Management Practices for Existing Oil Palm Cultivation on Peat</i> Roundtable for Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO)	RSPO is an independent and internationally recognised certifying agency for sustainable palm oil. Policies regarding peatland hydrology are not enforced nor linked to certification standard.	Specific details on management of hydrology include: A good water management system for oil palm effectively maintains a water-level of 50-70 cm (below the bank in collection drains) or 40-60 cm (groundwater piezometer reading) Water level in the canals and in the field should be controlled so as to prevent saltwater intrusion into the area Fertilizers application should be avoided during the raining season as the rain aids the leaching of fertilizers into the ground surface.
NGO	Malaysia and Indonesia	<i>A Quick Scan of Peatlands in Malaysia</i>	Influential NGO in Malaysia and	Specific details on management of hydrology include: The water table must be 20-30 cm below the

Wetlands International	Indonesia. Policy is not enforceable nor legally binding but preferred management guidelines.	surface of the peat or higher to avoid drying out and decomposition of the peat, with the subsequent release of carbon dioxide (CO <sub>2</sub> )
---------------------------	--	---

---

387

388

389

## 390 **Peatland Policies in Indonesia and Malaysia**

### 391 *Indonesia*

392 Driven by the large emissions factors cited from burning events, increasing regional pressure  
393 due to transboundary haze (Mahmud, 2013), Indonesia's status as the 3<sup>rd</sup> largest emitter of  
394 GHGs globally (van Noordwijk *et al.*, 2014) and more recently, local government and  
395 university scientists' verification of international emissions factors for peat soil in plantations  
396 (van Noordwijk *et al.*, 2014), Indonesian public policy has increasingly recognised the  
397 ecological importance of peatlands, reflected in a range of policies for conservation and best  
398 management practices. Among the earliest was Presidential Decree No. 32/1990, and then  
399 echoed by Government Regulation No. 26/2008, both of which stated that peat of >3m  
400 should automatically be designated as protected areas. Following this, the Regulation of the  
401 Ministry of Agriculture No. 14/2009 (*Guideline on Oil Palm Plantation on Peatland*)  
402 stipulated that where concessions have a peat thickness of >3m on >30% of their area, the  
403 entire concession should remain closed (Wibisino *et al.*, 2011). This regulation includes  
404 benchmarks for minimum WTD for palm oil on peatland, maximum widths and depths for  
405 drainage channels as well as more general cultivation requirements affecting hydrology  
406 (Government of Indonesia, 2009). Most recently, Government Regulation No. 71/2014  
407 (*Protection and Management of Peatland Ecosystem*) mandatorily prohibits the cultivation or

408 development of 30% of an uncultivated peat hydrological unit and then any area peat >3m in  
409 addition to this (Government of Indonesia, 2014). While the consideration of management in  
410 terms of peat hydrological units has merit, drainage of one part of the hydrological unit (even  
411 if on relatively shallow peat zones) will impact the runoff, erosion, drainage, subsidence and  
412 GHG emissions of the entirety of the peat area.

413 Indonesia has also established a national level moratorium on deforestation of primary forests  
414 and peatlands. The moratorium was enacted in the context of a national strategy for Reducing  
415 Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation (REDD+), to reduce GHG emissions  
416 projected for 2020 by 26–41% (Ministry of Forestry Indonesia, 2008). The moratorium was  
417 meant to freeze the issuing of new licenses to allow time for the Indonesian government to  
418 establish a degraded land database, required for identification of land acceptable for  
419 development, including oil palm plantations (World Growth, 2011). After a delayed start, the  
420 moratorium commenced in May 2011 with Presidential Instruction No. 10/2011  
421 (Rondonuwu, 2011), and was recently extended (a further 2 years) for the second time in  
422 2015.

423

424 Whilst there have been policy developments in Indonesia, problems related to this are  
425 twofold; firstly in terms of the consistency and appropriateness of these policies, and  
426 secondly concerning the political and economic capacity to enforce them. In relation to the  
427 first issue, there is a lack of continuity between policies related to peat, resulting in some  
428 serious contradictions. For example, while the Ministry of Agriculture Regulation No.  
429 14/2009 sets water levels targets for peat as 60-80cm, Government Regulation No. 71/2014  
430 specifies levels at 40cm. Contradictions aside, neither goal may be particularly helpful in the  
431 long run, given that subsidence and emissions are still substantial at either WTD (Hooijer *et*

432 *al.*, 2012). These contradictions may have arisen due to a more general land management  
433 conflict originating from the Constitution of 1945 (Article 33), which mandates the State to  
434 manage Indonesia's natural resources, 'for the benefit of the people' (Abdullah, 2002). This  
435 was based around a philosophy common throughout Southeast Asia (Hezri & Hasan, 2006;  
436 Government of Malaysia, 2015) that viewed natural resource exploitation as a tool to aid  
437 development. As a consequence, pristine forests or degraded land were viewed as 'wasteland'  
438 or 'idle' land if not exploited to support development (McCarthy & Cramb, 2009).

439

440 Secondly, concerning political and economic capacity to effectively implement the policies,  
441 there is evidence that patronage-based political arrangements in Indonesia allow the oil palm  
442 industry considerable scope for side-stepping formal policy procedures (Carlson *et al.*, 2013).  
443 Medrilzam *et al.*, (2014) demonstrated that well-connected 'elite patrons' (often retired  
444 government officials) employed as 'functional directors' to perform 'extra-economic  
445 functions' are common amongst top-tier plantation firms. These 'directors' often use their  
446 influence and connections to bypass important procedures in the land licensing process, for  
447 instance the AMDAL (*analisis Dampak lingkungan*, or environmental impact assessment)  
448 requirement. In principle, the AMDAL process should allow for the identification of  
449 peatlands and associated depths (as defines in the policy parameters above) and thus denial of  
450 licenses. However, well-connected companies often gain 'special' approvals to proceed with  
451 land opening before the AMDAL is carried out (Zakaria *et al.*, 2007), rendering all policies  
452 restricting development on peat impotent (Varkkey, 2016). Consequently, up to 25% of  
453 concessionaires deviate from this rule and plant on deep peat anyway (Silvius & Kaat, 2010).  
454 Decentralization of these processes also contributes to this paralysis; with district  
455 governments issuing 26 million ha of oil palm concessions between 2000-2010, despite only  
456 10 million being agreed at the federal level (Ito *et al.*, 2014).

457

458 Similarly, until September 2014, Indonesia was the only member state not to ratify the  
459 ASEAN agreement on transboundary haze pollution (Government of Malaysia, 2011).  
460 Indonesia's non-ratification was driven by both external (lobby group) and internal  
461 (parliamentary-level) pressure. Some of the strongest and most influential lobby groups are  
462 the Indonesian Sustainable Palm Oil (ISPO) Commission and Indonesian Palm Oil  
463 Association (GAPKI). GAPKI strongly lobbies for 'the preservation of their heritage and way  
464 of life', referring to the status quo of open burning operations in land clearing and the use of  
465 peatlands for plantations. Its lobbying raised concerns over the legal consequences of  
466 ratification (Sijabat, 2007), specifically liability clauses related to peatlands and use of fire  
467 (Budianto 2008) would threaten the sector's practices (Varkkey, 2016). Given the close  
468 personal relationships between GAPKI members and certain parliamentarians, it was no  
469 surprise that many parliamentarians echoed these concerns. However, the irony is that  
470 Indonesia already has all these provisions in their existing peatlands legislation.

471

472 Again in relation to the REDD+ moratorium detailed above, similar policy weaknesses have  
473 been reported (IPCC, 2014). For example it has been argued that the REDD+ moratorium  
474 was watered down due to inherent political and private interests (Rondonuwu, 2011;  
475 Simamora, 2011) bolstered by patronage networks. For example, the government decided that  
476 as part of REDD+, plantation investments (including those on peatlands) already approved by  
477 the Indonesian government would not be affected by the moratorium (Kuala Lumpur Kepong  
478 Berhad, 2010). Also, it was observed that there was a substantial increase in the permits for  
479 large-scale conversions granted just before the moratorium was enacted (Government of  
480 Indonesia, 2009). Combined, it is questionable whether REDD+ moratorium can be more

481 effective than previous regulations in restricting the use of peatlands for plantation purposes  
482 (Varkkey, 2016).

483

484 Following the severe 2015 haze events, declarations outlined in October 2015  
485 (Mongabay.com, 2015) suggest a new and more assertive direction in relation to public  
486 policy. Proposed measures include: a halt to all new forest clearance within peatlands (even  
487 those in existing concessions), a ban in the use of fire for land clearance and lastly, that all  
488 newly established plantation areas which experienced fire in the last haze event should be  
489 earmarked for rehabilitation. This was announced in parallel with plans to establish a new  
490 Peatland Rehabilitation Agency. All this reflects strong intention; however Indonesia still  
491 must overcome all the pre-existing constraints described above.

492 *Malaysia*

493 In Malaysia, the policy framework for peatland management is even less specific and weaker.  
494 Hezri & Hasan, (2006) suggest that the lack of commitment to environmental sustainability in  
495 Malaysia dates back to Prime Minister Dr Mahathir's late 1980s commitment to 'upholding  
496 the right to development of countries in the South, against the "eco-imperialist" position of  
497 the wealthy North'. Yet the main driver for policy stagnation appears to be the  
498 decentralisation of land policy. Originating from the constitution of 1960, but still in place  
499 today, land, forests, water and other natural resources (primary sector) are under State  
500 jurisdiction while the then limited tertiary sector (e.g. services, banks, tourism and also now  
501 oil) was and still is, Federally controlled. Originally this arrangement meant that the then  
502 buoyant tin and rubber sectors provided state governments with substantial revenues.  
503 However, the decline of these industries means that in recent years, the Federal revenues  
504 significantly exceed that of the state (Memon, 1999). The conservation of lands for



505 ecosystem services and conservation raises no income, and as any environmental disaster  
506 (such as flooding) is covered by federal funds, there is little incentive for states to maintain  
507 habitat or ecosystem service functionality. Thus, while at a Federal level policies such as  
508 Environmentally Sensitive Areas (ESAs) within the Environmental Quality Act 1974  
509 acknowledge the hydrological importance of peatlands and their need for 1km buffer zones,  
510 at a state level, policies are often contradictory (e.g. 100m in Selangor State).

511

512 Unfortunately, PSFs and their hydrological requirements have not been officially recognised  
513 under the Forestry Act (1991) (Gomez, 2009). However, in 2011, the Ministry of Natural  
514 Resources and Environment launched the *National Action Plan for Peatland Management*  
515 (NAP) providing key management strategies and targets (Busch *et al.*, 2015). However, NAP  
516 lacks specific details on how to undertake such strategies, including hydrology management.  
517 Furthermore, NAP is not legally binding, so there is no obligation for land owners, cultivators  
518 or managers to implement policy. Similarly, the Malaysian Palm Oil Board (MPOB), one of  
519 the foremost palm oil industry associations also provides guidance for cultivation on peat,  
520 such as recommendations for WTD (see van Noordwijk *et al.*, 2014). However, even if  
521 enforced, WTDs suggested promote significant GHG loss anyway.

522

523 Currently, it should be noted that policies related to peatland management remain focused on  
524 haze and peatland burning (especially in Indonesia), reflecting the diplomatic challenges  
525 concerning the transboundary impacts (Marti, 2008). Reduction of carbon emissions is seen  
526 as a secondary argument (Ramlah & Lizanah, 2000), which is compounded by the fact that  
527 most global estimates do not include emissions from decomposition of carbon in peatlands in  
528 carbon emission and climate change models (Ramsar, 2015). Ironically, this has raised  
529 concerns that if the governments involved are able to successfully implement haze and

530 burning related reductions, the need to protect peatlands for the reduction of net soil  
531 respiration, biodiversity conservation or other ecosystem values may disappear from the  
532 agenda (Miettinen *et al.*, 2013).

533

534 Overall, the efficacy of policies and guidelines for the sustainable management of peatlands  
535 and the conservation of PSFs in Malaysia and Indonesia have been hindered due to the  
536 perception that they are in conflict with the national economic development priorities and the  
537 interests of the sectors such as palm oil and acacia. For example, Indonesia's official goal for  
538 the palm oil sector is to reach a CPO output of 40 million tonnes per year by 2020 (Boer *et*  
539 *al.*, 2012; Hameiri & Jones, 2013). In order for the government's yield goals to be achieved,  
540 the country has little option other than to continue establishing plantations on restricted  
541 peatland areas (Varkkey, 2016). Indeed, research has shown that strategies of commercial  
542 plantations to increase productivity in Indonesia especially, have primarily focused on  
543 expansion of new land, rather than replanting or yield increase research (Suharto, 2011). The  
544 ongoing need for new land helps to explain the ambiguity surrounding peatland policies in  
545 both countries. Yet even attaining yield improvements, without strong policy implementation,  
546 there is a risk that improvements of any profit margins will only serve to justify further  
547 expansion into marginal lands such as peat.

548

#### 549 *Additional policies and policy initiatives*

550 Beyond national policies, a number of regional and international actors are playing prominent  
551 roles in developing policies, projects and initiating discussions at local and regional levels.  
552 Regionally driven initiatives include the *ASEAN Peatland Management Initiative* (APMI)  
553 (2002) and the *ASEAN Peatland Management Strategy* (APMS) and *Action Plan for*  
554 *Sustainable Management of Peatlands in ASEAN Member Countries (2006-2020)*, both under

555 the purview of the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) Secretariat. The goals  
556 of the APMI were *'to promote sustainable management of peatlands through collective*  
557 *efforts and enhanced cooperation among ASEAN Member Countries towards achieving local*  
558 *support and sustaining livelihood options, regional benefits through reduced risk of fire and*  
559 *its associated haze and contributing globally in minimizing impacts of climate change as a*  
560 *result of carbon release from peatlands'* (ASEAN Secretariat, 2003). The APMS more  
561 specifically served as a guide for peatland management in the region. Stemming from the  
562 APMS, management plans are also being devised for specific sites in the ASEAN region and  
563 driven by non-governmental organisations such as Malaysia's Global Environment Centre  
564 (GEC).

565 In this context, NGOs have shown themselves to play a pivotal role in coordinating both  
566 government and non-government stakeholders in the development of local and state peatland  
567 management plans not only within Malaysia but also on a regional scale. These NGOs are  
568 commendable for their efforts despite the challenges they face in terms of governmental  
569 constraints related to policy limitations and implementation capacity. On a more global scale,  
570 other NGOs such as Wetlands International and the International Mire Conservation Group  
571 have been pushing for countries to develop peat-specific policies. However the response from  
572 target governments has been slow (Gründling & Grobler, 2005).

573

574 Further, there are some corporations that are taking a new position regarding the cultivation  
575 of peatlands which has the potential to have wide-reaching impacts on the status of remaining  
576 peatlands in Southeast Asia and beyond (Padfield et al. *in press*). One such example is  
577 Wilmar International, one of the world's largest traders of palm oil, who committed to 'no  
578 deforestation, no peatland and no exploitation' in December 2013 (Wilmar International,  
579 2014). Included in this commitment was no further planting on peat soil regardless of depth,

580 and it extends to all operations within the supply chain, including subsidiaries and third  
581 parties from whom Wilmar purchase (Varkkey, 2014). Currently, only a small number of the  
582 largest corporations have made similar policy commitments and thus the effect of this new  
583 corporate position on the wider management of peatlands is still unclear (Padfield *et al.*, *in*  
584 *press*).

585

586 Finally, RSPO is an internationally recognised certifying agency for sustainable palm oil,  
587 composed of a range of stakeholders from NGOs to producers and processors, and has  
588 developed management guidelines for growers on aspects such as peatland hydrology  
589 management (RSPO, 2012). Yet as with government agencies such as MPOB, joining the  
590 scheme is not compulsory and even if adhering, having existing concessions on peat does not  
591 currently disqualify growers from being certified as sustainable, and thus, further promoting  
592 the ‘cake-and-eat-it’ narrative that peat-based palm oil can be sustainable.

593

594 Indeed, the challenge that the persistence of this narrative of sustainability poses to efforts to  
595 change policies in relation to peatland is significant. It echoes the more general optimism of  
596 ecological modernisation with its assertion that developmental and environmental goals can  
597 be pursued simultaneously without hard choices. In this context we should consider the  
598 ‘hidden intentionalities’ (De vries, 2007) underlying such policies. In this case, it is the notion  
599 of sustainability itself, which sets the debate in terms of how mitigation can be best achieved,  
600 rather than in terms of whether it is possible to mitigate or not. Yet this pursuit of sustainable  
601 drainage-based agricultural development is in conflict with current scientific understanding  
602 reviewed here, showing that even with best management practices, C losses, loss of  
603 ecosystem function, subsidence, flooding, biodiversity reduction and loss of future peat  
604 accretion are all undeniable consequences. However, the avoidance of these issues has

605 important implications in relation to what types of data policy makers are likely to employ in  
606 the process of decision making, who are identified as the key stakeholders and what are  
607 regarded as satisfactory outcomes.

608

609 **Conclusions and Recommendations: Key policy challenges for peatland hydrology**  
610 **management**

611 This paper has reviewed the current status of scientific research on tropical PSFs and existing  
612 peatland policies in Indonesia and Malaysia. More specifically, it has demonstrated the role  
613 that the PSF's unique hydrology plays in the maintenance of ecosystem services, and its  
614 vulnerability in the face of any human activities which involve drainage. In simple terms, if a  
615 swamp is drained, it is no longer a swamp. While the conversion of PSFs has been portrayed  
616 as a developmental necessity, this paper also alludes to the economic, social and  
617 environmental costs associated with this approach. Such costs include the short- and long-  
618 term impact of peat fires and transboundary haze, and associated health and income impacts  
619 to millions of people in both nationally and regionally. Increasingly, these costs also include  
620 losses predicted in yield and land area due to subsidence and associated flooding to vast  
621 coastal areas of the region, and financial implications of future flood control investments  
622 (Hooijer *et al.*, 2015). These, when combined with global costs from climate change, may  
623 offset the short-term perceived benefits gained from drainage-based agriculture.

624

625 This paper has also questioned the notion of the sustainable development of peatlands. Here,  
626 we have shown that even where current guidelines and/or policies to control WTDs and limit  
627 development to only certain proportions of peat domes are fully implemented, such  
628 'sustainable' practices inevitably result in significant GHG emissions (Hooijer *et al.*, 2012;  
629 RSPO, 2012), long-term subsidence of peat soils, significant flooding and loss of land area in

630 South East Asian coastal peatlands (Hooijer *et al.*, 2015), not to mention significant losses to  
631 biodiversity. Given the current state of knowledge, we are still forced to conclude that *any*  
632 development on peat involving drainage and clearance of forest is fundamentally  
633 unsustainable and should be formally recognized as such.

634

635 Protecting the remaining areas of PSF and restoring key degraded systems thus makes  
636 economic, social and environmental sense. Significantly, under the United Nations  
637 Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC) 2013 policy (Decision 2/CMP.7)  
638 countries can account for GHG emission sources from wetland drainage as well as C storage  
639 via rewetting of wetlands. Following on from the recent COP 21 agreements, critical  
640 examination of the efficacy of management guidelines and hydrology policy practices for  
641 peatlands to reduce emissions will be crucial for achieving these GHG emission goals (Marti,  
642 2008). Such policies would require robust and targeted interventions based on the wealth of  
643 recognised scientific understanding (Goldstein, 2015). However, whilst there have been  
644 considerable policy developments, notably by the Indonesian Government and a selection of  
645 non-state actors, this paper has highlighted the challenges that confront any efforts to  
646 implement such a strategy. These include;

647

648 i. *Lack of policy specificity and consistency.* While Indonesia has developed specific  
649 laws that provide a framework for improved hydrology management, these laws are  
650 often inconsistent. On the other hand, in Malaysia (see Table 3) and in the ASEAN  
651 region more broadly, there are few specific and legally binding laws. Further, the  
652 conflict in policies and priorities between state and federal agencies creates stagnation  
653 in effective policy implementation.

654 ii. *Lack of political will and ineffective enforcement.* Even where laws which show some  
655 recognition of ecosystem function and hydrology have been established, there are  
656 problems of ineffective law enforcement (Varkkey, 2014). Specifically, less than  
657 optimal bureaucratic structures (AseanPeat, 2014) and patronage politics also pose  
658 challenges.

659 iii. *Current policies and guidelines do not take full account of the hydrological*  
660 *requirements for ecosystem function.* Instead, developments of policies and guidelines  
661 often promote the narrative of sustainable drainage-based agriculture on peat,  
662 providing best management guidelines which promote the notion that a ‘win-win’  
663 scenario is possible.

664

665 To make any progress, recently announced policy initiatives require local political support,  
666 raising questions concerning how key actors can be incentivised to support them. Finally,  
667 such policies must recognise the fundamental importance of hydrology and address current  
668 preconceptions concerning sustainable PSF conversion. In light of the above, the following  
669 sets out a list of policy recommendations to support the long-term integrity of tropical  
670 peatlands:

671 1) Ideally all degraded peatland should have the hydrology restored to natural  
672 conditions, irrespective of the depth of the peat, and the vegetation should be  
673 rehabilitated. In light of this, the Indonesian President Joko Widodo is to be  
674 commended for his recent proposal to restore 2 million ha of degraded peatlands in  
675 Indonesia (The Jakarta Post, 2015b).

676 2) It is vital that the hydrology of intact PSFs should be maintained and buffered from  
677 any peripheral drainage activities. Compartmentalizing peat domes should be avoided  
678 and conservation areas should ideally cover entire hydrological units.

679 3) Conversion of peatland to agriculture inevitably leads to a myriad of impacts.  
680 Consequently, the recommended economic uses should be solely non-drainage  
681 options such as paludiculture and financing via REDD+, especially given the

682 comparative wealth of C stored. Given the economic unsustainability of current  
683 practices, initiative to reintegrate original land-use practices by peatland communities  
684 should be supported before losses to ecosystem services and land area by flooding  
685 become irreversible.

686 4) Complete avoidance of peat of any depth for future development alongside the  
687 rehabilitation of forest and drainage of all existing developed/degraded peatlands  
688 within concessions should be a qualifying element of any sustainable oil palm or  
689 acacia certification scheme where any part of the companies' land area is on peat soil.

690 5) Policies in both countries should be strengthened to have consistency between both  
691 state and federal levels and a commitment to better enforcement, monitoring and  
692 transparency of activities both within and outside concession boundaries.

693 6) Local and International funding options should be provided for the development of  
694 research and implementation programmes to support non-drainage paludiculture  
695 agriculture, ecotourism, set-aside/rehabilitation programmes and other alternative  
696 livelihood strategies for smallholder farmers and local communities living in  
697 proximity to peatlands.

698 7) International recognition of the global importance with respect to carbon sequestration  
699 and contributions to climate change, transboundary air pollution and loss of  
700 endangered species is vital. Recent International collaboration and commitments are  
701 commended (Mongabay.com 2016). Yet a fully comprehensive and ongoing  
702 commitment is required to remove the drivers of peat development and promote  
703 conservation and rehabilitation. Given the financial commitments being made in  
704 relation to climate change mitigation, especially in light of the recent COP21  
705 negotiations, a global strategy to rehabilitate areas of significant C loss such as these,  
706 would be a strategic use of global financial resources and efforts.

707

## 708 **Literature Cited**

709

710

711 Abdullah A (2002) *A Review and Analysis of Legal and Regulatory Aspects of Forest Fires in*  
712 *South East Asia A Review and Analysis of Legal and Regulatory Aspects of Forest Fires*



713 *in South East.*

714 Andiko (2015) Peatland: Wrong for palm oil development, right for community management  
715 | Rights + Resources. <http://rightsandresources.org/en/news/peatland-wrong-for-palm->  
716 [oil-development-right-for-community-management/#sthash.XU3eVbhM.dpbs](http://rightsandresources.org/en/news/peatland-wrong-for-palm-oil-development-right-for-community-management/#sthash.XU3eVbhM.dpbs).

717 Andriesse JP (1988) *Nature and management of tropical peat soils*, Vol. 59. 59 pp.

718 Anshari G, Armiyarsih (2005) Anshari, G. Z., and Armiyarsih. 2005. Carbon Decline from  
719 Peatlands and Its Implications on Livelihood Security of Local Communities, in:  
720 Murdiyarso, D and Herawati, H, eds. Carbon forestry: who will benefit? In: *Proceedings*  
721 *of Workshop on Carbon Sequestration and Sustainable Livelihoods, Bogor on 16-17*  
722 *February 2005 CIFOR.*

723 Applegate G, Smith R, Fox JJ, Mitchell A, Packham D, Tapper N, Baines G (2002) Forest  
724 fires in Indonesia: impacts and solutions. In: *Colfer, C.J.P., Resosudarmo, I.A.P. (eds.)*  
725 *Which way forward?: people, forests, and policymaking in Indonesia.* 293-308.

726 ASEAN Secretariat (2003) *ASEAN Peatland Management Initiative, Manila, ASEAN.*

727 AseanPeat (2014) *Buffer Zone Management Plan for North Selangor Peat Swamp Forest,*  
728 [www.aseanpeat.net/view\\_file.cfm?fileid=320](http://www.aseanpeat.net/view_file.cfm?fileid=320).

729 Bezuijen MR, Webb GJW, Hartoyo P, Samedi (2001) Peat swamp forest and the false gharial  
730 *Tomistoma schlegelii* (crocodilia, reptilia) in the Merang River, eastern Sumatra,  
731 Indonesia. *ORYX*, **35**, 301–307.

732 BMKG BADAN METEOROLOGI, KLIMATOLOGI, DAN GEOFISIKA.

733 Boehm H-DV, Siegert F, Rieley JO, Page SE, Jauhainen J, Vasander H, Jaya a. (2001) Fire  
734 impacts and carbon release on tropical peatlands in Central Kalimantan, Indonesia. *22nd*

- 735 *Asian Conference on Remote Sensing*, 5–9.
- 736 Boer R, Nurrochmat, DR, Ardiansyah M, Hariyadi, Purwawangsa H, Ginting G (2012)  
737 *Indonesia: Analysis of implementation and financing gaps Project Report*. Bogor,  
738 *Center for Climate Risk & Opportunity Management, Bogor Agricultural University*.
- 739 Busch J, Ferretti-Gallon K, Engelmann J et al. (2015) Reductions in emissions from  
740 deforestation from Indonesia’s moratorium on new oil palm, timber, and logging  
741 concessions. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of*  
742 *America*, **112**, 1328–33.
- 743 Cannon CH, Curran LM, Marshall AJ, Leighton M (2007) Beyond mast-fruiting events:  
744 Community asynchrony and individual dormancy dominate woody plant reproductive  
745 behavior across seven Bornean forest types. *Current Science*, **93**, 1558–1566.
- 746 Carlson KM, Curran LM, Asner GP, Pittman AM, Trigg SN, Marion Adeney J (2012)  
747 Carbon emissions from forest conversion by Kalimantan oil palm plantations. *Nature*  
748 *Climate Change*, **3**, 283–287.
- 749 Carlson KM, Curran LM, Asner GP, Pittman AM, Trigg SN, Marion Adeney J (2013)  
750 Carbon emissions from forest conversion by Kalimantan oil palm plantations. *Nature*  
751 *Climate Change*, **SUPP**, 1–26.
- 752 Carlson KM, Goodman LK, May-Tobin CC (2015) Modeling relationships between water  
753 table depth and peat soil carbon loss in Southeast Asian plantations. *Environmental*  
754 *Research Letters*, **10**, 074006.
- 755 Center for International Forestry Research (2015) Clearing the smoke: The causes and  
756 consequences of Indonesia’s fires.

757 Cheyne SM, Morrogh-Bernard H, MacDonald DW (2009) First flat-headed cat photo from  
758 Sabangau peat-swamp forest, Indonesian Borneo. *Cat News*, **51**, 18.

759 Comeau L-P, Hergoualc'h K, Smith JU, Verchot L (2013) *Conversion of intact peat swamp*  
760 *forest to oil palm plantation, Effects on soil CO2 fluxes in Jambi, Sumatra.*

761 Couwenberg J, Dommain R, Joosten H (2010) Greenhouse gas fluxes from tropical peatlands  
762 in south-east Asia. *Global Change Biology*, **16**, 1715–1732.

763 Dau J (1823) Neues Handbuch über den Torf - dessen natürliche Entstehung und  
764 Wiedererzeugung, Nutzen im Allgemeinen und für den Staat (New Handbook on Peat –  
765 its Natural Origin and Re-production, Use in General and for the State). **1**, 248.

766 DID, LAWOO (1996) *Western Johore integrated agricultural development project, peat soil*  
767 *management study.*

768 Dommain R, Couwenberg J, Joosten H (2010) Hydrological self-regulation of domed  
769 peatlands in south-east Asia and consequences for conservation and restoration. *Society*,  
770 **6**, 1–17.

771 Dommain R, Couwenberg J, Joosten H (2011) Development and carbon sequestration of  
772 tropical peat domes in south-east Asia: Links to post-glacial sea-level changes and  
773 Holocene climate variability. *Quaternary Science Reviews*, **30**, 999–1010.

774 Dommain R, Couwenberg J, Glaser PH, Joosten H, Suryadiputra INN (2014) Carbon storage  
775 and release in Indonesian peatlands since the last deglaciation. *Quaternary Science*  
776 *Reviews*, **97**, 1–32.

777 Field RD, van der Werf GR, Shen SSP (2009) Human amplification of drought-induced  
778 biomass burning in Indonesia since 1960. *Nature Geoscience*, **2**, 185–188.

- 779 Freeman C, Fenner N, Ostle NJ et al. (2004) Export of dissolved organic carbon from  
780 peatlands under elevated carbon dioxide levels. *Nature*, **430**, 195–198.
- 781 Garlough EC, Keyes CR (2011) Influences of moisture content, mineral content and bulk  
782 density on smouldering combustion of ponderosa pine duff mounds. *International*  
783 *Journal of Wildland Fire*, **20**, 589–596.
- 784 Giam X, Koh LP, Tan HH, Miettinen J, Tan HTW, Ng PKL (2012) Global extinctions of  
785 freshwater fishes follow peatland conversion in Sundaland. *Frontiers in Ecology and the*  
786 *Environment*, **10**, 465–470.
- 787 Goldstein JE (2015) Knowing the subterranean: Land grabbing, oil palm, and divergent  
788 expertise in Indonesia’s peat soil. *Environment and Planning A*.
- 789 Gomez ET (2009) The Rise and Fall of Capital: Corporate Malaysia in Historical Perspective.  
790 *Journal of Contemporary Asia*, **39**, 345–381.
- 791 Government of Indonesia (2009) Guideline on Oil Palm Plantation on Peatland. in M. o. A.  
792 (14/Permentan/PL.110/2/2009), ed. Jaka.
- 793 Government of Indonesia (2014) Protection and Management of Peatland Ecosystem.  
794 (71/2014) Jakarta: Indonesia.
- 795 Government of Malaysia (2011) *Malaysian National Action Plan for Peatlands in M. o. N. R.*  
796 *Environment*, ed. Putrajaya: Malaysia.
- 797 Government of Malaysia (2015) Intended Nationally Determined Contribution of the  
798 Government of Malaysia. 1–6.
- 799 Gründling P-L, Grobler R (2005) Peatlands and Mires of South Africa. *Stapfia*, **35**, 379–396.
- 800 Gumal MT (2004) Diurnal home range and roosting trees of a maternity colony of Pteropus

- 801 vampyrus natunae (Chiroptera : Pteropodidae) in Sedilu, Sarawak. *Journal of Tropical*  
802 *Ecology*, **20**, 247–258.
- 803 Hameiri S, Jones L (2013) The politics and governance of non-traditional security.  
804 *International Studies Quarterly*, **57**, 462–473.
- 805 Hansen SB, Padfield R, Syayuti K, Evers S, Zakariah Z, Mastura S (2015) Trends in global  
806 palm oil sustainability research. *Journal of Cleaner Production*, **100**, 140–149.
- 807 Hensen I, Dolmat Mohd T, Hamden A (2002) *Subsistence and carbon loss from peat soils*  
808 *following palm oil planting, MPOB, Bangi*,. 6pp pp.
- 809 Herwitz SR (1988) Buttresses of tropical rainforest trees influence hillslope processes. *Earth*  
810 *Surface Processes and Landforms*, **13**, 563–567.
- 811 Hezri AA, Hasan MN (2006) Towards sustainable development? The evolution of  
812 environmental policy in Malaysia. *Natural Resources Forum*, **30**, 37–50.
- 813 Hooijer A, Page S, Canadell JG, Silvius M, Kwadijk J, Wosten H, Jauhiainen J (2010)  
814 Current and future CO<sub>2</sub> emissions from drained peatlands in Southeast Asia.  
815 *Biogeosciences*, **7**, 1505–1514.
- 816 Hooijer A, Page S, Jauhiainen J, Lee WA, Lu XX, Idris A, Anshari G (2012) Subsidence and  
817 carbon loss in drained tropical peatlands. *Biogeosciences*, **9**, 1053–1071.
- 818 Hooijer A, Vernimmen R, Visser M, Mawdsley N (2015) Flooding projections from  
819 elevation and subsidence models for oil palm plantations in the Rajang Delta peatlands,  
820 Sarawak, Malaysia. 1–76.
- 821 Huang X, Rein G (2015) Computational study of critical moisture and depth of burn in peat  
822 fires. *International Journal of Wildland Fire*, **24**, 798–808.

- 823 Huat BBK, Kazemian S, Prasad A, Barghchi M (2011) State of an art review of peat: General  
824 perspective. *International Journal of the Physical Sciences*, **6**, 1988–1996.
- 825 IPCC (2014) *Climate Change 2014: Synthesis Report. Contribution of Working Groups I, II*  
826 *and III to the Fifth Assessment Report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate*  
827 *Change*. 151 pp.
- 828 IST & GCP (2014) *Creating Demand for Sustainable Palm Oil through Tariff Policies in*  
829 *India & Indonesia*. Global Canopy Programme: Oxford, UK. p.
- 830 Ito T, Rachman NF, Savitri L a (2014) Power to make land dispossession acceptable: a policy  
831 discourse analysis of the Merauke Integrated Food and Energy Estate (MIFEE), Papua,  
832 Indonesia. *Journal of Peasant Studies*, **41**, 29–50.
- 833 Jauhiainen J, Silvennoinen H (2012) Diffusion GHG fluxes at tropical peatland drainage  
834 canal water surfaces. *Suo*, **63**, 93–105.
- 835 Jauhiainen J, Hooijer A, Page SE (2012) Carbon dioxide emissions from an Acacia plantation  
836 on peatland in Sumatra, Indonesia. *Biogeosciences*, **9**, 617–630.
- 837 Joosten H, Clarke D (2002) *Wise use of mires and peatlands*. 304 pp.
- 838 Kanchanasaka B (2001) Tracks and other signs of the Hairy-nosed Otter (*Lutra sumatrana*).  
839 IUCN Otter Spec. *Group Bull.*
- 840 Kottelat M, Britz R, Hui TH, Witte K-E (2006) *Paedocypris*, a new genus of Southeast Asian  
841 cyprinid fish with a remarkable sexual dimorphism, comprises the world's smallest  
842 vertebrate. *Proceedings. Biological sciences / The Royal Society*, **273**, 895–899.
- 843 Kuala Lumpur Kepong Berhad (2010) *Annual Report. Kuala Lumpur Kepong Berhad*. Ipoh.
- 844 Kumari K (1996) An application of the incremental cost framework to biodiversity

845 conservation: a wetland case study in Malaysia. *Working Paper - Centre for Social and*  
846 *Economic Research on the Global Environment*, **GEC 96-15**.

847 Latiff A (2005) An overview of the significant findings of the biodiversity expedition to the  
848 peat swamp forest of Sungai Bebar, Pahang. in A. Latiff, K. A. Hamzah, N. Ahmad, M.  
849 N. M. Said, A. N. Toh, and S. K. Gill, editors. *Biodiversity expedition Sungai Bebar,*  
850 *Pekan, Pahang, summary findings.*, 167.

851 Mahmud M (2013) Assessment of atmospheric impacts of biomass open burning in  
852 Kalimantan, Borneo during 2004. *Atmospheric Environment*, **78**, 242–249.

853 Mäkiranta P, Laiho R, Fritze H, Hytönen J, Laine J, Minkkinen K (2009) Indirect regulation  
854 of heterotrophic peat soil respiration by water level via microbial community structure  
855 and temperature sensitivity. *Soil Biology and Biochemistry*, **41**, 695–703.

856 Marti S (2008) Losing Ground: The human impacts of palm oil expansion. *Friends of the*  
857 *Earth, Life Mosaic, Sawit Watch*.

858 McCarthy JF, Cramb RA (2009) Policy narratives, landholder engagement, and oil palm  
859 expansion on the Malaysian and Indonesian frontiers. *Geographical Journal*, **175**, 112–  
860 123.

861 Medrilzam M, Dargusch P, Herbohn J, Smith C (2014) The socio-ecological drivers of forest  
862 degradation in part of the tropical peatlands of Central Kalimantan, Indonesia. *Forestry*,  
863 **87**, 335–345.

864 Melling L, Chua K, Lim K Managing Peat Soils Under Oil Palm. 33.

865 Memon A (1999) Devolution of environmental regulation : EIA in Malaysia. *UNEP EIA*  
866 *Training Resource Manua*, 45–61.

867 Meybeck M (1993) Riverine transport of atmospheric carbon: Sources, global typology and  
868 budget. *Water, Air, & Soil Pollution*, **70**, 443–463.

869 Mezbahuddin M, Grant RF, Hirano T (2014) Modelling effects of seasonal variation in water  
870 table depth on net ecosystem CO<sub>2</sub> exchange of a tropical peatland. *Biogeosciences*, **11**,  
871 577–599.

872 Miettinen J, Liew SC (2010) Status of peatland degradation and development in Sumatra and  
873 Kalimantan. *Ambio*, **39**, 394–401.

874 Miettinen J, Shi C, Liew SC (2012a) Two decades of destruction in Southeast Asia’s peat  
875 swamp forests. *Frontiers in Ecology and the Environment*, **10**, 124–128.

876 Miettinen J, Hooijer A, Shi C et al. (2012b) Extent of industrial plantations on Southeast  
877 Asian peatlands in 2010 with analysis of historical expansion and future projections.  
878 *GCB Bioenergy*, **4**, 908–918.

879 Miettinen J, Wang J, Hooijer A, Liew S (2013) Peatland conversion and degradation  
880 processes in insular southeast asia: A case study in Jambi, Indonesia. *Land Degradation  
881 and Development*, **24**, 334–341.

882 Ministry of Forestry Indonesia (2008) *IFCA 2007 Consolidation Report : Reducing  
883 Emissions from Deforestation and Forest Degradation in Indonesia*. Indonesia. Forestry  
884 Research and Development Agency p.

885 Mongabay (2015) Indonesia bans peatlands destruction.  
886 <http://news.mongabay.com/2015/11/indonesia-bans-peatlands-destruction/>.

887 Mongabay (2016) Norway pledges \$50m to fund Indonesia’s peat restoration.  
888 <http://news.mongabay.com/2016/02/norway-pledges-50m-to-fund-indonesias-peat->



889           *restoration/.*

890 Moore S, Evans CD, Page SE et al. (2013) Deep instability of deforested tropical peatlands  
891           revealed by fluvial organic carbon fluxes. *Nature*, **493**, 660–3.

892 Morrogh-Bernard H, Husson S, Page S., Rieley J. (2003) Population status of the Bornean  
893           orang-utan (*Pongo pygmaeus*) in the Sebangau peat swamp forest, Central Kalimantan,  
894           Indonesia. *Biological Conservation*, **110**, 141–152.

895 MPOB (2011) Sustainable Palm Oil Developments In Malaysia.  
896           <http://www.palmoilworld.org/sustainability.html>.

897 Murayama S, Bakar ZA (1996) Decomposition of tropical peat soils: 2. Estimation of in situ  
898           decomposition by measurement of CO<sub>2</sub> flux. *Japan Agricultural Research Quarterly*,  
899           **30**, 153–158.

900 Mutert E, Fairhurst TH, von Uexküll HR (1999) Agronomic Management of Oil Palms on  
901           Deep Peat. *Better Crops International*, **13**, 22–27.

902 Ng T, Ibrahim S (2001) *Common trees in peat swamp forests of Peninsular Malaysia*.  
903           Kepong, Forest Research Institute Malaysia p.

904 Nijman V, Hon J, Richardson M (2008a) *Presbytis chrysomelas* (Bornean Banded Langur,  
905           Sarawak Surili).

906 Nijman V, Hon J, Richardson M (2008b) *Presbytis chrysomelas* (Bornean Banded Langur,  
907           Sarawak Surili).

908 van Noordwijk M, Matthews R, Agus F et al. (2014) Mud, muddle and models in the  
909           knowledge value-chain to action on tropical peatland conservation. *Mitigation and*  
910           *Adaptation Strategies for Global Change*, **19**, 887–905.

- 911 Ong CSP, Juan JC, Yule CM (2015) Litterfall production and chemistry of *Koompassia*  
912 *malaccensis* and *Shorea uliginosa* in a tropical peat swamp forest: plant nutrient  
913 regulation and climate relationships. *Trees*, **29**, 527–537.
- 914 Othman H, Mohammed AT, Darus FM, Harun MH, Zambri MP (2011) Best management  
915 practices for oil palm cultivati on peat: Ground water-table maintenance in relation to  
916 peat subsidence and estimation of CO<sub>2</sub> emissions at Sessang, Sarawak. *Journal of Oil*  
917 *Palm Research*, **23**, 1078–1086.
- 918 Padfield R, Drew S, Papargyropoulou E et al. Landscapes in transition: an analysis of  
919 sustainable policy initiatives and emerging corporate commitments in the palm oil  
920 industry. *Landscape Research*.
- 921 Padfield R, Waldron S, Drew S et al. (2014) Research agendas for the sustainable  
922 management of tropical peatland in Malaysia. *Environmental Conservation*, **42**, 1–11.
- 923 Page SE, Rieley JO, Shotyk W, Weiss D (1999) Interdependence of peat and vegetation in a  
924 tropical peat swamp forest. *Philosophical transactions of the Royal Society of London.*  
925 *Series B, Biological sciences*, **354**, 1885–1897.
- 926 Page SE, Siegert F, Rieley JO, Boehm H-D V., Jaya A, Limin S (2002) The amount of  
927 carbon released from peat and forest fires in Indonesia during 1997. *Nature*, **420**, 61–66.
- 928 Page SE, Wüst R a. J, Weiss D, Rieley JO, Shotyk W, Limin SH (2004) A record of Late  
929 Pleistocene and Holocene carbon accumulation and climate change from an equatorial  
930 peat bog(Kalimantan, Indonesia): implications for past, present and future carbon  
931 dynamics. *Journal of Quaternary Science*, **19**, 625–635.
- 932 Page SE, Rieley JO, Banks CJ (2011a) Global and regional importance of the tropical  
933 peatland carbon pool. *Global Change Biology*, **17**, 798–818.

- 934 Page SE, Morrison R, Malins C, Hooijer A, Rieley JO, Jauhiainen J (2011b) Review of Peat  
935 Surface Greenhouse Gas Emissions From Oil Palm Plantations in. *Transportation*.
- 936 Pahang Forestry Department (2005) *Pekan peat swamp forest, Pahang, Malaysia. The role of*  
937 *water in conserving peat swamp forests*.
- 938 Phillips VD (1998) Peat swamp ecology and sustainable development in Borneo. *Biodiversity*  
939 *and Conservation*, **7**, 651–671.
- 940 Posa M, Wijedasa LS, Corlett RT (2011) Biodiversity and Conservation of Tropical Peat  
941 Swamp Forests. *BioScience*, **61**, 49–57.
- 942 Price JS (2003) Role and character of seasonal peat soil deformation on the hydrology of  
943 undisturbed and cutover peatlands. *Water Resources Research*, **39**, 1–10.
- 944 Quinten M, Waltert M, Syamsuri F, Hodges J (2010a) Peat swamp forest supports high  
945 primate densities on Siberut Island, Sumatra, Indonesia. *Oryx*.
- 946 Quinten M, Waltert M, Syamsuri F, Hodges J (2010b) Peat swamp forest supports high  
947 primate densities on Siberut Island, Sumatra, Indonesia. *Oryx*.
- 948 Ramakrishna S (2005) Conservation and sustainable use of peat swamp forests by local  
949 communities in South East Asia. *Suo*, **56**, 27–38.
- 950 Ramlah Z, Lizanah M (2000) The abundance of anurans in different types of forest in  
951 Malaysian Borneo. In: *Proceedings of the International Conference on In-situ and Ex-*  
952 *situ Biodiversity Conservation in the New Millenium*, pp. 429–430.
- 953 Ramsar (2014) Ramsar Homepage. [on-line] <http://www.ramar.org>, (accessed .
- 954 Ramsar (2015) Draft Resolution on Peatlands , climate change and wise use : Implications for  
955 the Ramsar Convention Draft Resolution XII . xx Peatlands , climate change and wise

- 956 use : Implications for the Ramsar Convention. 9–12.
- 957 Rein G, Cleaver N, Ashton C, Pironi P, Torero JL (2008) The severity of smouldering peat  
958 fires and damage to the forest soil. *Catena*, **74**, 304–309.
- 959 Rieley J, Page S (2001) Peatlands for People: Natural Resource Functions and Sustainable  
960 Management. In: *Proceedings of the International Symposium on Tropical Peatland*, p.  
961 271.
- 962 Rondonuwu O (2011) No TitleIndonesia divided over forest moratorium, misses Jan start.  
963 *Reuters. Jakarta.*
- 964 Ross J, Wilting A, Ngoprasert D et al. (2015) *Cynogale bennettii* (Otter-civet, Otter Civet,  
965 Sunda Otter Civet). *IUCN Red Data List*.
- 966 Roulet NT (2000) Peatlands, carbon storage, greenhouse gases, and the Kyoto Protocol:  
967 Prospects and significance for Canada. *Wetlands*, **20**, 605–615.
- 968 RSPO (2012) *RSPO Manual on Best Management Practices (BMPs) for Existing Oil Palm*  
969 *Cultivation on Peat*. 111 pp.
- 970 Russon AE, Erman A, Dennis R (2001) The population and distribution of orangutans (*Pongo*  
971 *pygmaeus pygmaeus*) in and around the Danau Sentarum Wildlife Reserve, West  
972 Kalimantan, Indonesia. *Biological Conservation*, **97**, 21–28.
- 973 Sahani M, Zainon NA, Wan Mahiyuddin WR et al. (2014) A case-crossover analysis of forest  
974 fire haze events and mortality in Malaysia. *Atmospheric Environment*, **96**, 257–265.
- 975 Sebastian A (Aonyx EK (Malaysia)) (2002) Globally threatened mammal and bird species in  
976 Malaysia peat swamp forests. In: *International Symposium on Tropical Peatlands*,  
977 *Jakarta (Indonesia), 22-23 Aug 2002*. BPPT.

- 978 Sijabat R (2007) Government, House discuss bill on transboundary haze. *Jakarta Post*, 13  
979 *March 2007*.
- 980 Silvius M, Kaat A (2010) Peat Swamp Forests and Palm Oil.  
981 <http://www.slideshare.net/WetlandsInternational/palm-oil-presentation-for-the-eu>.
- 982 Simamora A (2011) SBY vows to protect palm oil interests. *Jakarta Post*.
- 983 Sjögersten S, Black CR, Evers S, Hoyos-Santillan J, Wright EL, Turner BL (2014) Tropical  
984 wetlands: A missing link in the global carbon cycle? *Global Biogeochemical Cycles*, **28**,  
985 1371–1386.
- 986 Suharto R (2011) *Sustainable Palm Oil Development in Indonesia*. Jakarta.
- 987 Takahashi H, Shimada S, Ibie B, Usup A, Yudha, Limin S (2001) Annual change of water  
988 balance and drought index in a tropical peat swamp forest of Central Kalimantan,  
989 Indonesia. In *Peatlands for people: Natural Resource and Functions and Sustainable*  
990 *Management*. Proceeding of the International Symposium on Tropical Pe. In:  
991 *Proceeding of the International Symposium on Tropical Peatland, 22-23 August 2001*  
992 (eds Rieley JO, Page SE). BPPT and Indonesia Peat Association, Jakarta Indonesia.
- 993 The Jakarta Post (2015a) Haze kills 10 people, leaves 503,874 with respiratory ailments:  
994 Agency.
- 995 The Jakarta Post (2015b) Jokowi signs peatland decree-cop21.  
996 <http://www.thejakartapost.com/news/2015/11/25/>.
- 997 Trumbore S (2009) Radiocarbon and Soil Carbon Dynamics. *Annual Review of Earth and*  
998 *Planetary Sciences*, **37**, 47–66.
- 999 Turetsky MR, Benscoter B, Page S, Rein G, van der Werf GR, Watts A (2015) Global

- 1000 vulnerability of peatlands to fire and carbon loss. *Nature Geosci*, **8**, 11–14.
- 1001 Usup A, Hashimoto Y, Takahashi H, Hayasaka H (2004) Combustion and thermal  
1002 characteristics of peat fire in tropical peatland in Central Kalimantan, Indonesia.  
1003 *Tropics*, **14**, 1–19.
- 1004 Varkkey H (2014) Regional cooperation, patronage and the ASEAN Agreement on  
1005 transboundary haze pollution. *International Environmental Agreements: Politics, Law  
1006 and Economics*, **14**, 65–81.
- 1007 Varkkey H (2016) *The Haze Problem in Southeast Asia: Palm oil and patronage: Routledge  
1008 Malaysian Studies Series*. Routledge., Oxon, UK,.
- 1009 De vries P (2007) Don't compromise your desire for development! A Lacanian/Deleuzian  
1010 rethinking of the anti-politics machine. *Third World Quarterly*, **28**, 25–43.
- 1011 Warren MW, Kauffman JB, Murdiyarso D et al. (2012) A cost-efficient method to assess  
1012 carbon stocks in tropical peat soil. *Biogeosciences*, **9**, 4477–4485.
- 1013 Watts AC (2013) Organic soil combustion in cypress swamps: Moisture effects and  
1014 landscape implications for carbon release. *Forest Ecology and Management*, **294**, 178–  
1015 187.
- 1016 Wibisino I, Silber T, Lubis I, Rais D, Suryadiputra N, Silvius M, Tol S (2011) *Peatlands in  
1017 Indonesia's National REDD+ strategy*. Bogor.
- 1018 Wibisono HT, Pusparini W (2010) Sumatran tiger (*Panthera tigris sumatrae*): A review of  
1019 conservation status. *Integrative Zoology*, **5**, 313–323.
- 1020 Wilmar International (2014) No deforestation, no peat, no exploitation policy. Retrieved May  
1021 25, 2014, from <http://www.wilmar-international.com/wp-content/uploads/2012/11/No->

- 1022            *Deforestation-No-Peat-No-Exploitation-Policy. pdf.*
- 1023    World Growth (2011) *The economic benefit of palm oil to Indonesia.* Virginia, 1-26. pp.
- 1024    Wösten JHM, Clymans E, Page SE, Rieley JO, Limin SH (2008) Peat-water  
1025            interrelationships in a tropical peatland ecosystem in Southeast Asia. *Catena*, **73**, 212–  
1026            224.
- 1027    Wüst R, Jacobsen G, van der Gaast H, Smith A (2011) Comparison of radiocarbon ages from  
1028            different organic fractions in tropical peat cores: insights from Kalimantan, Indonesia.  
1029            *Radiocarbon*, **50**, 359–372.
- 1030    Yule CM (2010) Loss of biodiversity and ecosystem functioning in Indo-Malayan peat  
1031            swamp forests. *Biodiversity and Conservation*, **19**, 393–409.
- 1032    Yule CM, Gomez LN (2008) Leaf litter decomposition in a tropical peat swamp forest in  
1033            Peninsular Malaysia. *Wetlands Ecology and Management*, **17**, 231–241.
- 1034    Zakaria A, Theile C, Khaimur L (2007) *Policy, practice, pride and prejudice: Review of*  
1035            *legal, environmental and social practises of oil palm plantation companies of the*  
1036            *Wilmar Group in Sambas District, West Kalimantan (Indonesia).* Netherlands.
- 1037
- 1038

